

The Mongolian Collections Retracing Hans Leder



edited by
Maria-Katharina Lang
and Stefan Bauer

Austrian Academy
of Sciences Press



OAW

Contents

Preface Maria-Katharina Lang	6
I The Collector and the Collections Maria-Katharina Lang	9
II Mongolian Buddhism: Identity, Practice and Politics Lhagvademchig Jadamba	25
Artefacts - Specific Groups and Figures	
III Tsakli, Thangkas, Prints, Amulets and Manuscripts Olaf Czaja	38
IV Types of Votive Plaque [tshatsha] in the Leder Collections Béla Kelényi	53
V A Maitreya [tshatsha] in the Leder Collections Béla Kelényi	56
VI The Tsam Figures in Leder's Collections – A Reunion Maria-Katharina Lang	58
VII The Khüree-Tsam and its Relations with the Tsam Figures of the Leder Collections Krisztina Teleki	76
VIII Cagān Öwgön – The White Old Man in the Leder Collections The Textual and Iconographic Tradition of the Cult of the White Old Man among the Mongols Ágnes Birtalan	84
IX The Depictions of the Five Personal Protective Deities in the Leder Collections Béla Kelényi	95
X Equestrian Warrior Deities in the Leder Collections Some Aspects of the Mongolian War God Ágnes Birtalan	99
XI Various Depictions of Zanabazar Maria-Katharina Lang	111
XII Different Types of Prayer Flag in the Leder Collections Béla Kelényi	114
XIII The Stronghold of Good Luck A Unique Representation Connecting to the Cult of Prayer Flag Béla Kelényi	117
List of Contributors	121
References	123
Figures	137

II Mongolian Buddhism: Identity, Practice and Politics

Lhagvademchig Jadamba Shastri

Introduction

Buddhism, once a dominant socio-cultural force in Mongolia, lost its power in the “battle” with the Marxist-Leninist ideology adopted by the Mongolian government in early 20th century. Starting from the early 1920s, the Mongolian government took a series of measures against the economic infrastructure and institutional structure of Mongolian Buddhism.¹ The final government attack came in 1937, destroying hundreds of Buddhist monasteries, imprisoning and executing Buddhist monks. In the following period Buddhism was banned from public life, only re-emerging with the collapse of communism in Mongolia in 1990. Former monks started to re-open their home monasteries in their local areas, families started to send their sons to newly opened monasteries and the government of Mongolia supported a revival of Buddhism as a part of its policy of promoting Mongolian culture and national identity.

Contemporary Mongolian Buddhism is now building its own identity in post-socialist Mongolia as well as in the wider Buddhist world. It has had to accommodate itself with a pluri-religious, post-socialist environment and it faces a number of institutional and geopolitical challenges.

Historical background of Mongolian Buddhism

Buddhism spread through Mongol territories² over hundreds of years, with varying degrees of socio-cultural and political intensity. According to the scholar monk Zava Damdin (1998) and some Mongolian contemporary scholars, the earliest dissemination of Buddhism among proto-Mongols was in the period of the Hunnu state (Xiongnu) in the 3rd century BCE. It is recorded that a three-metre-high standing statue, perhaps of Buddha, was the main object of worship for inhabitants of south-western Hunnu state.³ Several Sanskrit loan words in Mongolian related to Buddhist thought and culture are taken as evidence of the early spread of Buddhism in Mongol territory.⁴

Buddhism continued to exist in the states founded in the region after the collapse of the Hunnu state. Buddhism was the state religion in the Toba Wei state (386–581), for example, and we know that a monk called Dharmapriya (Fa Ai) held the office of State Teacher (*purohita*) in the Joujan or Nirun state (402–555). Several Buddhist scriptures were translated in the 8th–9th century Uighur state. A more detailed historical picture of Buddhism in Mongolia dates from the period of the Mongol Empire in the 13th century. The Great Khans of the Mongol Empire supported Buddhism by granting tax exemption for Tibetan and Chinese Buddhist monasteries and monks, promoting Buddhist monks to the status of State Teachers and building Buddhist temples. During the Mongol Empire, Tibetan Buddhist monks became increasingly prominent and active at the courts of the Mongol Khans.

After the disintegration of the Mongol Empire in the late 16th century, Altan Khan of Tumed invited the Tibetan lama Sonam Gyatso for a meeting and gave him the title of Dalai Lama. Reciprocally, the Third Dalai Lama recognised Altan Khan as the reincarnation of Khubilai Khan, the founder of the Mongolian Yuan Dynasty. Being recognised as the reincarnation of Khubilai Khan, Altan Khan became one of the first Mongols to be recognised as an incarnation. Later his great-grandson was recognised as an incarnation of the Third Dalai Lama.

Since the late 16th century the teachings of the Tibetan Yellow Hat School (*Gelug* School), whose head is the Dalai Lama, gradually penetrated Mongolian culture and tradition. By the early 20th century, Buddhist ideology, belief and practice were central to the socio-cultural life of the Mongols. In 1911, the Mongols elevated the Eighth Jebtsundamba Khutugtu, the highest lama of Mongolia, to the throne of the Mongolian state. He became the first and the last theocratic king in Mongolian history. After his death in 1924, the government of Mongolia followed instructions from Moscow⁵ and took repressive action against the Buddhist monastic community, finally destroying the Buddhist institutions by violence.⁶

In 1977, Larry W. Moses, the author of *The Political Role of Mongol Buddhism*, observed that “by all available evidence, Buddhism no longer exists as a political, economic or spiritual form in the Mongolian Peoples’ Republic.” (Moses 1977: 265). He speculated that since Buddhism had disappeared in the way that it did, there was little evidence that there would ever be a revival.

Buddhism and National Identity

After the collapse of the Soviet Union and the success of peaceful democratic change in Mongolia, Buddhism emerged as a vital force in the symbolic of revival of Mongolian culture and nationalism. Mongolian nationalism is strongly present in two ways: the worship of Chinggis Khan and the Buddhist religious faith.

It is now state policy to guarantee religious freedom⁷ and promote harmony among different religions. At the same time the state supports Buddhism and Buddhist culture as an integral part of Mongolian culture and tradition. Article 4.2 of the *Law on Relationships between the State and Religion* states that “Mongolia shall respect the dominant status of Buddhism with consideration of unity of Mongolian people and tradition of culture and civilization.”⁸ The revised *National Security Concept* specifies that it should: “Revive and develop Buddhist religion and culture. Encourage activities of monasteries and temples towards enlightenment of societal wisdom, strengthening national unity, alleviating poverty, disaster relief and protection of the natural environment” and “Maximize support for research and studies on Buddhism which protected and preserved for many centuries the Mongolian people’s intellectual civilization.”⁹

Within the framework of laws and legislation, state officials are involved in a variety of activities that are closely connected to Buddhist rituals and ceremonies. The *Cultural Fund*, a state agency, played an important role in the re-installation of the Migjed Janraisig (Avalokiteśvara) statue, for example, and the government gave financial support for the construction of the Mongolian Buddhist temple in Bodhgayā, India. On the first day of the Mongolian New Year,¹⁰ the speaker of parliament, the prime minister and the president visit the Migjed Janraisig temple¹¹ and perform the Buddhist ceremony of offering *maṅḍala*.¹² In 2007 N. Enkhbayar, the then president of Mongolia issued a decree commissioning an appliqué of Vajrapāṇi,¹³ who is believed to be the protector deity of the Mongols and whose reincarnation is considered to be Chinggis

Khan. Buddhist monks frequently perform land-blessing (*gazar avah*)¹⁴ ceremonies before the construction of significant government buildings and facilities. The president of Mongolia issued a decree for the worship of state-venerated mountains and he participates in these ceremonies personally. The state-venerated Otgontenger mountain in Zavkhan aimag province is believed to be the dwelling place of Vajrapāni. The most significant support by the government was when it granted permission for the visit by the Dalai Lama,¹⁵ who Mongolian Buddhists regard as their spiritual master, at the risk of damaging relations between Mongolia and China.¹⁶ Some politicians and political parties have called for the installation of Buddhism as a state religion. In its platform for the 2008 parliamentary election, the National New Party¹⁷ (NNP) pledged to declare Buddhism the state religion.¹⁸ It argued that establishing Buddhism as a state religion would be important for the unity of the Mongolian people. Mongolian Buddhist leaders supported this proposal and expressed the view that “Religious (Buddhist) teaching is significant for the country’s development”¹⁹ and that “the state and the religion (Buddhism) is wisdom and method (*arga bilig*).²⁰ The union between *arga* and *bilig* is more powerful.”²¹

Buddhism: Magic Stick

In previous centuries, Buddhist monasteries functioned as centres of education and medical service for the public, in addition to conducting various religious ritual performances for believers. During the socialist period these educational and medical services for the public were replaced by the socialist welfare system, but religious performances associated with healing and divinations continued in secret.²² Today even former party leaders admit to having practised Buddhist rites and consulted monk astrologers during the period when the practice of religion was officially forbidden.²³ In his interview, former president N. Enkhbayar said that he became a disciple of a Buddhist monk and started to receive Buddhist teaching when he was 26 years old.²⁴

Most Mongolians practise Buddhism for the purposes of healing and divination and often see Buddhism as “a magic stick” for the difficulties of life and for guidance in some major life-time decisions. This sort of attitude is evidently linked to the characteristics of Tibetan tantric Buddhism, which conducts numerous rituals associated with exorcism, and a pragmatic approach to religion among the Mongols. According to a survey on religious belief and practice conducted in Darkhan Uul aimag, 60 per cent of people who claimed to be Buddhist said that they seek a variety of Buddhist rituals in order to gain success and prosperity in their lives. When a questionnaire asked respondents to write down some teachings of the Buddha, 90 per cent of respondents did not write anything. With regard to the general situation of Mongolian Buddhists concerning Buddhist knowledge and practice it could be concluded that Buddhist rituals and rites are prevalent among the population, but this is not the case when it comes to doctrinal understanding and daily religious practice (Ganbaatar, interview, 2008 and Ariunaa, personal communication, 2008).

Monks often talk about people’s lack of understanding of Buddhist doctrine and emphasise its negative impact on public faith in Buddhism. Baljinnyam, a head monk of Buddhist monastery in Khentii aimag, said that “some people leave the Buddhist faith after several years of ritualistic practice that they have carried out in the hope of improving their life (*amidralaa saijruulah*). When they do not get what they wanted to achieve in material terms, they jump to the conclusion that Buddhism does not have a magical power to bring mate-

rial prosperity and they abandon the faith with no understanding of Buddhist teaching of self-improvement and self-reliance” (personal communication, 2008).

Talking about his monastery’s ritual performance for the candidates campaigning for the 2008 Mongolian parliamentary elections, another monk, Enkhbayar, said that “dealing with people of high social status and neglecting general public is not a good policy for the propagation of Buddhism” (interview, 2008).

There are observable differences in the age and gender between Buddhists and other religious believers. The majority of people who attend public Buddhist teachings and lectures are women and elderly people, while in contrast, Christian congregations are mostly made up of young people of both genders. But in the case of attendees of Buddhist teaching at the Mahāyāna Centre it was interesting to note that these were mainly young girls in their early twenties. This could be explained by the centre’s offer of free English-language classes for young people.

Female Buddhist Practitioners and Lay Buddhist Teachers

One of the new features of Mongolian Buddhism is the emergence of ordained female Buddhists and lay Buddhist teachers.

There is no historical evidence that I am aware of that Mongolian women took the *sramanerika* (novice)²⁵ vow in the past, although travel books and oral historical sources indicate that there were female reincarnated lamas²⁶ and female practitioners of *jod*.²⁷ However, there was a tradition of women taking certain Buddhist vows. Such women were called *chavgants*. According to the Law and Regulations of the Bogdo Khanate of Mongolia, a woman under 60 was not allowed to become a *chavgants*. Following the re-opening of Buddhist monasteries after 1990, Mongolian Buddhist women sought to establish a women’s Buddhist centre. The first initiative was taken by Ts. Gantumur, who founded the first Mongolian women’s Buddhist centre in 1990. Currently, there are three women’s Buddhist centres and a nunnery²⁸ in Mongolia. Over 60 women, including both *upasika*²⁹ and *sramanerika* (novice) ordinands, have been performing religious ceremonies and rituals. There is little difference between these rites and those conducted by Buddhist monasteries of monks. However, more women tend to visit these centres and the nunneries than the Buddhist monasteries of the monks.³⁰

Since female ordination was traditionally unknown in Mongolia, a number of Mongolian monks were opposed to it and to the performance of Buddhist rituals by women. In his speech the abbot of Gandantegchenling Monastery said that “some monasteries have been headed by lay persons who have not taken vows, and even by women. This is serious wrongdoing, which contradicts *Vinaya* rule (monastic rule).”³¹

By 2008, over twenty nuns³² were leading Buddhist religious lives in Mongolia. Most of them were ordained by Bakula Rinpoche,³³ a Ladakhi lama, in early 2000 and a number of them studied in India.³⁴ In July 2008, the 10th Sakyadhita International Conference on Buddhist women took place in Mongolia. A participant observed that Mongolian women are “passionately hungry for any information” on Buddhism and Buddhist practice.³⁵ The major challenges to Mongolian Buddhist nuns and women are gaining access to Buddhist teachings and finding opportunities to study Buddhism (interview with a Gunzee nun and a Tuvdenchöyng nun, Oct. 2008).

Another new development within Mongolian Buddhism is the emergence of lay Buddhist teachers. Traditionally, the *sangha*, the spiritual community of monks, was responsible for maintaining and teaching Buddhism, while the lay Buddhist community was responsible for the support of the *sangha* by providing food and shelter; in return for which they received teachings and guidance in good Buddhist practice. This traditional division of roles and duties is now challenged by lay Buddhist teachers and practitioners. This challenge is quite evident in Western Buddhism and is now emerging in Mongolia. Ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi, an American Buddhist teacher, emphasised that “the monastic-lay distinction is being erased in the elevation of lay people to the position of Dharma teachers who can teach with an authority normally reserved for monks. Some of the most gifted teachers of Buddhism today, whether of theory or meditation, are lay people. Thus, when lay people want to learn the Dharma, they are no longer dependent on monastics.”³⁶

Mongolian Buddhism and the Tibetan Global Network

Within the Tibetan tradition, Indian Buddhist masters are generally seen as *gurus*, and in an analogous way Tibetan lamas play the role of originating exemplars in Mongolian Buddhist tradition.

Since the 17th century, Mongolian monks have generally gone to one of three major *Gelug* (Yellow Hat) monasteries³⁷ and received higher Buddhist training and education there. The practice of sending students to Tibetan monasteries (not those in Tibet under Chinese administration but ones established by Tibetans in exile in India) was re-continued in the early 1980s³⁸ after the Dalai Lama’s first visit to Mongolia in 1979.³⁹ Currently, over 300 Mongolian students have undertaken monastic education at Tibetan monastic colleges in India. Several monks described the eagerness with which Tibetan monastic colleges accepted young Mongolian monks because an increasing number of Tibetan families in exile no longer choose to send their boys to the monastery, preferring to place them in secular Indian colleges, which seem to offer better prospects.⁴⁰

Tibetan Buddhist teachers started to visit Mongolia after the democratic change of the 1990s. The first two teachers were Jhado Rinpoche and Yelo Rinpoche, who came to Mongolia to teach Buddhist philosophy and Tibetan at the Buddhist University of Mongolia.⁴¹ Following them, several Tibetan monks came to Mongolia, some of whom established Buddhist centres in Mongolia.⁴²

Alongside Tibetan lamas, Western Buddhist teachers have also been welcomed by the Buddhist establishment in Mongolia. The abbot of Gandantegchenling monastery once remarked that “we need a Western (Buddhist) face.” This reflects concerns that Buddhism is seen by many young people as an “outdated” and “backward” religion. They argue that Buddhist countries are poor in comparison with Christian countries. In her blog a Mongolian economics student wrote that “the income of a citizen of a Bible (Christian) country is 36 per cent higher than a citizen of a Buddhist country.”⁴³ The presence of Western Buddhist teachers, it was felt by the abbot and others, would help negate such critical perceptions by demonstrating that since Western people from Christian countries value Buddhism and learn from it, so Mongols should not reject their Buddhist inheritance but preserve and study it. A Tibetan *geshe* made this point in his lecture tour in Mongolia, remarking that “Easterners, if they are not careful in learning what their culture is, then Eastern culture will become the culture of the West and Easterners may be left with empty hands” (Schittich et al. 2010: 83). In his speech at the International Conference on Tibetan Buddhism, the abbot of Gandanteg-

chenling monastery extended his gratitude to the Hollywood actor Richard Gere, as “his presence created tremendous interest among the younger generation in the Buddha Dharma.”⁴⁴

International Buddhism has been vital, then, to the Mongolian revival since its outset in the late 1980s, at first because advanced *Gelug* teaching was only available abroad, and more recently because the Buddhist establishment has recognised that it must operate within a public culture subject to a global flow of images and ideas including diverse strands and practices of Buddhism. Since its outset, it has also been sensitive to the geopolitical dimensions of these international entanglements; the Tibetan monasteries of China were decisively ignored in favour of Tibetan exile establishments, clearly placing the Mongolian *sangha* in the non-Chinese, international field of Tibetan-derived Buddhism.

Mongolia and the Shugden Issue

In 1996, during his spring teaching in Dharamsala, India, the Dalai Lama publicly advised “the Tibetan people against the practice of propitiating a spirit, known as Dorje Shugden. He said that this practice fosters religious intolerance and leads to the degeneration of Buddhism into a cult of spirit worship.”⁴⁵ The Tibet government-in-exile stated that “Dorje Shugden was unheard of during the time of the historical Buddha. It was not even among those spirits whom Padmasambhava, the founder of the Nyingma school of Tibetan Buddhism, subdued and bound to the oath of protecting the dharma. Propitiation of Shugden goes against the wishes of His Holiness the Dalai Lama and is ultimately harmful to the Tibetan people. His Holiness personally abandoned any connection with Shugden in 1975.”⁴⁶

In response to the public denouncement of the Shugden worship by the Dalai Lama, the Shugden followers have mounted campaigns both in India and abroad. The conflict between Shugden and non-Shugden worshippers escalated until the brutal murder of the principal of Tibetan Institute of Buddhist Dialectics and his two disciples in 1997, allegedly at the hands of Shugden devotees, and the resulting public petition and oath-taking campaigns run by the Tibetan government-in-exile “to make everybody swear not only to abandon every link to the deity but also to abandon any spiritual and material link of any kind with any adherent of Dorje Shugden.”⁴⁷

This controversies surrounding Shugden worship has had a major impact on Mongolian Buddhism. When the Dalai Lama visited Mongolia in 2002, he refused to visit the Gungaacholing monastic college of Gandantegchinling monastery, because of the presence of Shugden in the college. Whenever he receives and teaches Mongolian monks in India or in Mongolia, he asks people who worship Shugden to leave the teaching.

The Shugden controversy is a complex issue in Mongolia, as both pro-Shugden and anti-Shugden groups are well connected to the wider Tibetan Buddhist network, and both sides continue to gain some support from them. The issue has not only involved monks but also Mongolian businessmen, politicians and academics.

Several Tibetan Shugden lamas, such as Ganchen Rinpoche, Dagom Rinpoche, Shugden oracle and Daknak Dorje Chang Rinpoche, have visited Mongolia. Trijang Rinpoche, an incarnation of the tutor of the Dalai Lama, gave a ceremony of Shugden empowerment in Mongolia in 2012. The benefits of receiving Shugden empowerment are said to be that “worldly activities and business and jobs; everything becomes very

successful⁴⁸ in addition to successful meditation and spiritual practice. The promise of success in one's business and career has meant that the prospect of becoming wealthy is an attractive feature of Shugden worship for many Mongols. Alongside the promise of wealth, commitment and loyalty to one's own Shugden *guru* are the central grounds for defending the Shugden practice among devotees in Mongolia. Guru Deva Rinpoche⁴⁹ and Zava Rinpoche are two prominent Mongolian Shugden lamas who have many disciples, including wealthy businessmen and politicians. Some incarnations of Tibetan Shugden lamas have been recognised in Mongolia. In 2006, a Mongolian boy was recognised as an incarnation of the Tibetan Shugden lama Tendar Rinpoche.⁵⁰ It is said that another Tibetan lama, Dagom Rinpoche, has also taken birth in Mongolia.⁵¹

In response to the continuing Shugden activities in Mongolia, the Mongolian translation⁵² of the Tibetan book *The Dalai Lama's Advice Concerning Dolgyal* (Shugden) (*Dolgyal sGor Lam sDon Ga sLob kNyi pa*) was published in 2012 by the Jebstundamba Centre, whose spiritual master is Jhado Rinpoche, a supporter of the Dalai Lama's line on the issue. Zopa Rinpoche, the spiritual director of the Foundation for the Preservation of the Mahāyāna, wrote the foreword to the book.⁵³ Several websites and social network groups have been actively disseminating anti-Shugden information, including www.buddhism.mn, www.dalailama.mn, www.dalailambashugden.blogspot.com and its Facebook page *Dalai lam ba Shugden (the Dalai Lama and Shugden)*.⁵⁴

While some Mongolian monks and lay Buddhists disagree fiercely over the legitimacy of Shugden, some monks have reacted to the debate in nationalistic terms. One monk expressed the opinion that "we need a (Mongolian Buddhist) leader who has the courage to say that the question of whether to worship Dorj Shugden or not matters to Tibetans, but does not matter to Mongolians." He went on to say that leader should state that "the Dalai Lama of Tibet and the Jebtsundamba of Mongolia are equal in their spiritual authority" (personal communication, 2012).

A Tibeto-Mongolian Collaborative Project

These sorts of challenges to the Dalai Lama's spiritual authority in Mongolia and attempts to restrict the influence of India-based Tibetan lamas in Mongolian Buddhism can be seen in the light of the history of the recognition of the late Ninth Jebtsundamba, who was recognised by the Dalai Lama as the true incarnation of the Eighth Jebtsundamba⁵⁵ in the early 1990s. After his first visit to Mongolia in 1999, he was not allowed to enter Mongolia for ten years as a result of power struggles among Mongolian Buddhist leaders, with apparent support from ruling political parties, as well as the more visible complications that his visit posed for Sino-Mongolian relations.

However, on 2 Nov. 2011, the Ninth Jebtsundamba was enthroned as the head of Mongolian Buddhists.⁵⁶ The Dalai Lama visited Mongolia five days after his enthronement. Four months after his enthronement the Ninth Jebtsundamba passed away. The abbot of Gandantegchenling monastery publicly made the statement at the press conference that "the Ninth Jebtsundamba said before his passing away that he would be re-born in Mongolia. His next reincarnations would not be involved in political affairs." This was the summary of the deal made between the Ninth Jebtsundamba and the government of Mongolia; namely that a) his next incarnation would be Mongolian and not Tibetan and b) that the next incarnation would not be involved with Mongolian political affairs.

Tibetan and Mongolian lamas are now engaged in a collaborative project to secure the next incarnation of the Jebtsundamba in the face of Chinese pressure on Mongolia to minimise the Dalai Lama's involvement in the recognition of next Jebtsundamba and promote the China-based Panchen Lama's influence in Mongolia. The Mongol *sangha* also collaborates with Tibetans and Tibetan Buddhists with regard to securing the next reincarnation of the Dalai Lama. At the 2010 International Conference on Tibetan Buddhism, which took place in Atlanta, US, the abbot of Gandantegchenling monastery said, that Mongolia was a "free and sovereign nation" and "we are keenly aware of the special responsibility that we must shoulder" regarding the Dalai Lama's next reincarnation in light of the deep concerns of "the plight of the Panchen Rinpoche". If this statement is born out of the Mongolian religious establishment's position, it will effectively be in alliance with the Tibetan government-in-exile in resisting Chinese claims regarding the next Dalai Lama. However, a number of factors may lead to different outcomes. These include the Chinese promotion of the Panchen Lama⁵⁷ in Mongolia, the presence of anti-Dalai Lama groups as a result of the anti-Shugden campaigns, the geopolitical considerations regarding China and the ever-changing dynamics of party politics.

Tibetan activists are widely promoting the year 2013 as the centennial of Tibetan independence,⁵⁸ commemorating the 1913 Treaty between Mongolia and Tibet under which the sovereign states of Mongolia and Tibet mutually acknowledged each other. In November 2010, an international symposium on *The 1913 Treaty between Mongolia and Tibet* was held in Ulaanbaatar.⁵⁹ A month later a two-day discussion on the same theme was organised by the Tibetan government-in-exile.⁶⁰ Tibet.net, the official Tibetan government-in-exile website reports that "the Government of Mongolia said it is not involved in any way in the symposium (on the Treaty that held in Ulaanbaatar), nor [does it take] any position on this issue."

The government of Mongolia is cautious in its official statements yet the recent history of its religious policy suggests that it has been remarkably daring in its treatment of the sensitive issues of Tibet, China and the Dalai Lama that emerge in the context of Mongolian Buddhism. Officially, the Chinese government sees Mongolia as a friendly state, declaring that the two countries will be "forever good neighbours, friends and partners" and expressing the belief "that Mongolia will follow the same principles and adopt the same attitude in handling its relations with China."⁶¹

Looking back at the recent history of the Mongolian Buddhist establishment and the various currents of opinion within it, we can see that to date there has been remarkable unanimity on one point – the independence of the Mongolian *sangha*. Opinion has varied considerably on the authority of the Dalai Lama with respect to the Jebtsundamba, the merits of populist lay Buddhist teachers, the conduct of the senior management of the monastic establishment and the proper evaluation of Shugden worship. The debate over each of these issues has, from time to time, elicited a broadly national perspective, at least among certain circles of opinion, so that some have stressed the need for an independent Mongolian Buddhist resolution of these controversies, depending upon which side of the argument commentators find themselves. But such calls for doctrinal independence have generally been with respect to exiled Tibetan and international Buddhist establishments, since the original positioning of the Mongolian establishment has been firmly independent of China. But in view of the dynamic tensions within both the Buddhist establishment and the political elite it is difficult to predict the outcome of the next great international crisis in Tibetan Buddhism – the reincarnation of the Dalai Lama.

- 22 Religious performance was not allowed to take place outside of Gandantegchenling monastery, the sole sanctioned monastery during the communist era, but now ex-monks recollect that they often used to conduct religious rites secretly at night (interview with Dambajav and Purevbat, Ulaanbaatar, September 2010).
- 23 Kollmar-Paulenz 2003.
- 24 www.indianexpress.com/news/Dissatisfaction-should-always-be-there-it-keeps-you-going/322409/ (accessed January 2013).
- 25 According to an unconfirmed source there were nuns at the monastery of Danjanravjaa in Gobi (interview with Gunzee nun, Oct. 2008).
- 26 The Russian Mongolist Aleksei M. Pozdneev noted two Mongolian female reincarnated lamas, Tsagaan Dara Ekh (White Tārā) and Nogooson Dara Ekh (Green Tārā), in his book “*Очерки быта будд. монастырей и будд. духовенства в Монголии в связи с отношениями сего последнего к народу*”.
- 27 *Jod* (Tib. *god*) is a tantric practice in which a practitioner meditates on “non-selfness” or “emptiness of self existence”.
- 28 Tugs Bayasgalant töv, Narkhajid süm and Dulmaaling nunnery.
- 29 A female Buddhist practitioner who holds the Five Precepts: not killing, not taking what is not given, not engaging in sexual misconduct, not lying and not taking alcoholic drinks.
- 30 Interview with a female lay practitioner at Tögs Bayasgalant Centre, May 2008.
- 31 Shinzlekh Ukhaany Akademi Filosopi, Sotsiologi Erkhiiin Khureelen, 1998.
- 32 There are two nuns in Tögsbayasgalant Centre, 15 in Dolmaling nunnery and four in Narkhajid süm. Interview with Tuvdenchoying, a nun at Dolmaling, Oct 2008, and Burnee, D. *Mongolian Buddhist women: past and future*. 10th Sakyadhita International Conference.
- 33 The Indian ambassador to Mongolia from 1989 to 2000 was a major player in revival of Buddhism in Mongolia after democratic change in Mongolia. He passed away in 2003 and his next reincarnation was found in 2005 in Ladakh, India.
- 34 The Gunzee nuns studied in India for 12 years and the Tuvdenchoying nuns studied for four years.
- 35 www.sandyboucher.net/mongolia.htm (accessed January 2013).
- 36 www.abhayagiri.org/index.php/main/article/the_challenge_of_the_future/ (accessed January 2013).
- 37 The monasteries of Sera, Gandan and Drepung.
- 38 Several Mongolian students went to study at the Institute of Buddhist Dialectics, Dharamsala, India for shorter term in the mid-1980s, including D. Chojijamts, abbot of Gandantegchenling Monastery, Dambajav, abbot of Dashchoilin Monastery.
- 39 The Dalai Lama was invited to participate in the 5th International Conference of the Asian Buddhist Conference for Peace which took place in Ulaanbaatar.
- 40 A Tibetan monk also mentioned that the shortage of monks from exile families is now filled by refugees from Tibet and from Himalayan regions (personal communication, 2012). In the Tibetan movie *Unpredictable Life (nges gtan med pa'i mi tshé)*, a father says that his young son “will be able to go university (*slob grwa chen mo*) in the future” not referring to monastic college. www.youtube.com/watch?v=enxttUJ7_jQ (accessed January 2013).
- 41 The Buddhist University of Mongolia was established in 1970 with 30 students and four lecturers with a six-year study programme.
- 42 Two major Buddhist centres founded by Tibetan lamas are the Mahāyāna Centre, the Mongolian centre of the Foundation for the Preservation the Mahāyāna Tradition is of Lama Yeshe, and the Asral centre (Jampaling) of Panchen Otrul Rinpoche.
- 43 <http://biznetwork.mn/topic/show/34323/5>. Some other debates in this topic can be seen in www.buddhism.mn/static/129/135 and <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RMEOnuQHx30v> (accessed May 2013).
- 44 www.tibetanbuddhismconference.com/go/doc/3079/985703/ (accessed January 2013).
- 45 www.tibet.com/dholgyal/CTA-book/contents.html (accessed January 2013).
- 46 www.tibet.com/dholgyal/CTA-book/chapter-1.html (accessed January 2013).
- 47 www.shugdensociety.info/newsEN.html (accessed January 2013).
- 48 www.dorjeshugden.com/all-articles/features/trijang-rinpoche-conferred-dorje-shugden-initiation-in-mongolia-2011/ (accessed January 2013).
- 49 Guru Deva Rinpoche of Inner Mongolia (1908–2009) played a major role of restoring Buddhist sites, including Amarbayasgalant monastery, commissioning the Migjed Janraisig statue in Mongolia after the 1990s. He was awarded the Order

of the Red Banner of Labour (*Hüdülmüriin gaviyany ulaan tugiin odon*) by the Mongolian government. He also became the permanent abbot (*darkhan khamba*) of Gandantegchenling monastery.

50 www.dorjeshugden.com/great-masters/recent-masters/geshe-tendar/ (accessed January 2013).

51 www.dorjeshugden.com/forum/index.php?topic=873.40;wap2 (accessed January 2013).

52 Translated by of the Idgaachoizinling monastic college of Gandantegchenling monastery. Many of the Idgaachoizinling monastic college monks received Buddhist education in Sera Jhe monastic college where Zopa Rinpoche studied.

53 www.fpmt.org/images/stories/organization/announcements/shugden/Mongolian_shugden_book_foreword_Engl.pdf (accessed January 2013).

54 <https://www.facebook.com/dalailambashugden> (accessed January 2013).

55 The Eighth Jebtsundamba was the first and last the Mongolian king who was Tibetan by birth.

56 A year before of his enthronement, he was granted Mongolian citizenship.

57 Some Mongolian lamas are well connected with the Chinese Panchen Lama. The Panchen Lama is ready to recognize Mongolian reincarnated lamas if Mongolian side asks him to do it (personal communication, 2012).

58 <https://www.studentsforafreetibet.org/centennial-of-tibetan-independence-day-1913-2013> (accessed January 2013).

59 www.phayul.com/news/article.aspx?id=28397&t=1 (accessed January 2013).

60 <http://tibet.net/2010/12/31/dharamsala-hosts-discussion-on-significance-of-1913-tibeto-mongol-treaty/> (accessed January 2013).

61 www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/zxxx/t975488.htm (accessed January 2013).