

**Atiśa's Open Basket of Jewels: A Middle Way
Vision in Late Phase Indian Vajrayāna**
(An Annotated English Translation of the
Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭamadhyamakopadeśa)

James B. Apple *

Introduction

Dīpaṅkaraśrījñāna (986–1054), more commonly known under his honorific title of Atiśa,¹ is a renowned figure in Tibetan Buddhist cultural memory. He is famous for coming to Tibet and revitalizing Buddhism there during the early eleventh century. Although his thirteen-year (1042–54 C.E.) presence is nostalgically recounted in a number of Tibetan historical sources, the actual social and institutional impact that Atiśa had while in Tibet has recently been re-evaluated. As Davidson (2005: 108–15) notes, since Atiśa belonged to the Lokottaravāda section of the Mahāsaṅghika ordination lineage, he had constraints on his teaching and influence in areas controlled by Tibetan Eastern Vinaya monks, who belonged to the Mūlasarvāstivāda ordination lineage. Nevertheless, Atiśa was a charismatic teacher and translator who influenced Tibetans to rethink the integration of mainstream and Mahāyāna Buddhist principles with the practices of secret mantra or Vajrayāna.

The following text, translated for the first time into English, is Atiśa's *Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭamadhyamakopadeśa*, "An Open Jeweled Basket, Special Instruction of the Middle Way". The term "*Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭa*" refers to an open *karaṇḍa* "basket or covered box" (Monier-Williams, 1988: 254) made of jewels (*ratna*) or containing jewels. In this instance, the jeweled box or box of jewels is the text itself, containing over one hundred and twenty citations from *sūtras* and *tantras*, as well as *śāstras* and

* Department of Religious Studies, University of Calgary, 2500 University, Drive NW, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, T2N 1N4. Email:jbapple@ucalgary.ca

¹ As noted in Sopa (2001: 24n2), the form Atiśa is most likely derived from the Sanskrit *atiśaya*, "eminent, superior" (Tib. *phul (du) byung (ba)*) rather than Sanskrit *ati + īśa*, "the great Lord" which is not permitted by the rules of Sanskrit grammar. Tibetan often refer to Atiśa as *jo bo*, "(The) Lord".

hymns attributed to seminal Buddhist figures, such as Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva.

The text centers on the special instructions (*man ngag* or *gdams ngag*) of the middle way (*dbu ma*). As Kapstein (1996: 275) notes, *gdams ngag*, “instruction”, is understood in connection with meditational and yogic practice and “refers essentially to the immediate, heartfelt instructions and admonitions of master to disciple concerning directly liberative insight and practice”. In this instance, the special instructions provide guidance in developing insight derived from meditative cultivation (*bhāvanāmayī-prajñā*), the third level of insight that comes after levels involving initial rote learning and study (*śrutamayī-prajñā*) and intellectual integration (*cintāmayī-prajñā*) of Buddhist teachings. The type of Madhyamaka instruction conveyed by Atiśa in this text centers on cultivating the mind to rest in the nonconceptual experience of the *dharmadhātu*, rather than utilizing Madhyamaka reasoning to realize emptiness (*śūnyatā*).

The middle way special instructions that Atiśa imparts are permeated with the values of the Vajrayāna or tantric phase of Buddhism under the socio-economic influences of the South Asian Pāla dynasty (750–1150 C.E.). During the Pāla dynasty, Buddhist formations were centered on the scholarly study and practice of Mahāyāna discourses (*sūtra*) and technical digests (*śāstra*) supported and cultivated in tandem with Vajrayāna consecrations, rituals, and blessings. The integration of Mahāyāna discourses with Vajrayāna literature is well illustrated in the text, as Atiśa cites over forty-six Mahāyāna sūtras and ten tantras as authoritative for his vision of the middle way. As the annotations to the translation illustrate, Atiśa’s style is to abbreviate citations from sūtras and tantras. Comparison with the canonical versions of these texts often indicates that Atiśa modifies the meaning of verses to help illustrate the rhetorical points that he wishes to emphasize.

The emphasis throughout the text is on transmission and authority through the lineage of teaching coming from Nāgārjuna. Atiśa cites Nāgārjuna throughout the text (over twenty times, including the first four citations) and devotes individual sections of the text to Nāgārjuna’s teachings (§5), predictions of his buddhahood (§5.2), and his bodies of awakening (§5.3, 5.4). The emphasis that Atiśa places on Nāgārjuna points toward the visionary inspiration of Nāgārjuna and the continued authority and

validity of Nāgārjuna's teaching, as argued by Wedemeyer (2007). The text culminates with instructions based on visions Atiśa's teachers had of Nāgārjuna and places emphasis on the oral transmission of these teachings from "mentor's mouth to mentor's mouth" (*guru vaktrād guru vaktram*), unbroken from the time of śākyamuni Buddha's awakening.

The practices outlined by Atiśa in this text integrate the cultivation of insight (*prajñā*) and compassion (*karuṇā*) through training a bodhisattva to develop the mind of awakening (*bodhicitta*) at both ultimate and conventional levels. The ultimate mind of awakening—the birthless, luminous, non-conceptual, realm of reality (*dharmadhātu*) equated with emptiness—is cultivated during the meditative state, and the conventional mind of awakening is practiced during the post-meditative state. In this manner the two levels of the awakening mind are integrated and stabilized, having the essence of emptiness and compassion (*śūnyatākaruṇāgarbha*).² A snapshot of instructions for this integrated cultivation is found in section §2.5, where Atiśa states:

Regarding the training, first the mind did not come from anywhere and will not go anywhere at the end. [The mind] does not abide anywhere and is without color and without shape. [The mind] does not arise from the beginning nor does it cease at the end. [The mind is] empty of inherent existence and has the nature of clear light. One should recall this again and again.

On the other hand, one should stabilize through accustoming that mind of awakening to love and compassion. One should completely purify [the mind] and stand firm, being continuously mindful of each moment of thought with mindfulness, awareness, thoughtfulness, and conscientiousness.³

² *Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭa* D (3930) 97b6–7: *de ltar rnal 'byor pa des nang du mnyam par gzhag pa na / don dam byang chub kyi sems bsgoms la / de las langs pa na kun rdzob byang chub kyi sems bsgoms pas stong pa snying rje chen po'i snying po can gyi byang chub kyi sems gnyis po brtan par bya'o /*. Cf. Wangchuk 2007: 257–58, 258n125.

³ *Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭa* D (3930) 100b1–100b3: *de sbyang ba ni sems de dang po gang nas kyang ma 'ongs shing / tha ma gar yang mi 'gro ba / gang na yang mi gnas pa ste / kha dog med pa / dbyibs med pa / gzod ma nas ma skyes pa / tha mar mi 'gag pa / rang bzhin gyi stong pa / 'od gsal ba'i ngo*

This integrated mind of awakening is proctected (§2.7) and increased (§2.12) while the bodhisattva advances through the ten stages (*bhūmi*) as outlined by the *Daśabhūmikasūtra*. In the course of the training, the bodhisattva alternates between cognizing the non-conceptual space-like realm of reality (*dharmadhātu*) in meditative stabilization and viewing things as illusions in the post-meditative state. The alternation ceases at the stage of buddhahood, where for Atiśa, based on numerous citations from the hymns (*stava*) of Nāgārjuna (§3.2), the purified realm of reality (*dharmadhātu*) directly and constantly fuses with the *dharmakāya*, without any mental element or gnosis (*jñāna*) existing at all.

Date and place of authorship

The *Blue Annals* mentions that “the Master was invited by Rngog-legs-pa’i shes-rab to Lha-sa. Rngog requested Atiśa and Nag-tsho to translate the *Mādhyamakahrdayavṛtti-tarkajvālā*. In order to explain the text, the Master composed the large and short *dbu ma’i man ngag* (‘Special Instructions on Madhyamaka’). After that he spent (some time) at Snye-thang”.⁴

The colophon to the so-called short *Dbu ma’i man ngag*, the *Madhyamakopadeśa* (*Dbu ma’i man ngag*, D 96a7), does mention that it was composed in the main temple of Lhasa. However, according to the colophon of the canonical version of the *Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭa*, the text was written in the great temple of Vikramaśīla, under the patronage of King Devapāla, through the urging of Atiśa’s disciple and translation partner Tshul khriṃs rgyal ba. The colophon of this edition also mentions that the translation was redacted by Atiśa, Tshul khriṃs rgyal ba, and the layperson Brtson ’grus sen ge. The text must have been composed before Atiśa left for Tibet ca. 1040 C.E., as Brtson ’grus sen ge passed away in Nepal on the journey to Tibet (Chattopadhyaya 1981: 302).

*bo yang nas yang du dran par bya’o / yang na byams pa dang / snying rje
byang chub kyi sems de goms pas brtan par bya ba dang / shin tu byang bar
bya ste / sems kyi skad cig re re la dran pa rgyun chags su bya ba dang /
dran pa dang / shes bzhin dang / tshul bzhin du sems pa dang / bag yod pas
gnas par bya’o /*

⁴ Roerich 1976: 258-59, ’Gos lo tsā ba gzhon nu dpal p. 316: *der rngog gis lo
paṇ la zhu ba phul nas / rtog ge ’bar ba bsgyur / de’i man ngag che chung
gnyis mdzad / slar yang snye thang du bzhugs /*

Texts

My translation was initially based on the Tibetan from the Lhasa and Dergé (*sde dge*) editions of the Tanjur (*bstan 'gyur*). I have revised the translation based on Miyazaki's recent (2007) critical edition of the Tibetan, which is based on the Dergé (*sde dge*) Tanjur and compared against the Cone (*co ne*), Golden Manuscript (*gser gyi lag bris ma*), Narthang (*snar thang*), and Peking Tanjurs. I have also adapted the section headings of Miyazaki's Japanese translation so as to facilitate a comparison between translations and editions of the text. I have not followed Miyazaki's Japanese translation at this time.⁵ However, I have noted important variants from Miyazaki's critical edition found in a version of the text, the *Dbu ma'i man ngag rin po che za ma tog kha phye ba* (pp. 594–608.11; 793.23–807.25), recently published in the *Jo bo rje dpal ldan a ti sha'i gsung 'bum* (hereafter, *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum*, “Collected Works of Atiśa”), published by the Dpal-brtsegs group in Lhasa in 2006.

The *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* version of the text was found among handwritten manuscripts that were purportedly a part of the library of the fourth Tsang king, Karma Tenkyong Wangpo (Karma bstan skyong dbang po, r. 1622–42). If this is the case, this edition of the text would be older than the block print editions of the Tanjur, most of which were created in the early part of the eighteenth century (1730s). In fact, a close examination of the language of this version indicates that the terminology and idioms of expression are more archaic or at least do not follow standardized ‘high church’ Tibetan (*chos skad*). For instance, “*sogs pa*” (“etc.”, or “and so forth”) is consistently spelled “*scogs*” and “*ji skad du*” (“as it is said”) is rendered several times as “*ji snyed du*”. In several places the *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* edition reads more clearly than do the canonical versions in terms of its variants and punctuation, but in other places the variants do not provide better readings. The *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* edition also provides additional notes in certain sections, yet in other sections sentences are missing. I have noted the differences in the footnotes. The *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* version of the text is located in two different sections of the recently printed Dpal-brtsegs volume (on pp. 594–608.11 and then pp. 793.23–807.25), and contains a letter that

⁵ In so far as I am not able to read Japanese, I have not followed or been able to assess Miyazaki's Japanese translation (2007).

Atiśa wrote to a king appended to the end of the first section (pp. 608.11–609.16) and also found at the beginning of the second section (pp. 791.5–793.22). I have not been able to assess the actual manuscript or its facsimile to determine if the split of this edition occurs due to the pen of a scribe, to the shuffling of manuscript folios, or oversight while typing on a computer keyboard. I have provided a table of the section headings found in this edition and Miyazaki's in Appendix I.

An Open Jeweled Basket, Special Instructions of the Middle Way

by

Dīpaṃkaraśrījñāna

In the Indian language:

Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭamadhyaṃakopadeśa.

In the Tibetan language:

“An Open Jeweled Basket, Special Instructions of the Middle Way.”

Homage to the venerable Mañjuvajra.

Homage to the Three Jewels.

1 [Preliminary Instructions (D96b1–98b4)]

I will write the special instruction of the lineage of Ācārya Nāgārjuna.⁶

⁶ Atiśa indicates the individuals within the lineage of Ācārya Nāgārjuna in several of his works. The *Bodhipathapradīpa* states, “Cultivate only the instruction of Ārya Nāgārjuna, Āryadeva, Candrakīrti, Bhavya, and śāntideva (26) and if there is no one of that tradition, then study the texts composed by them over and over again” (Sherburne 2000: 250); *'phags pa klu sgrub 'phags pa'i lha / zla grags bha bya zhi ba'i lha / brgyud pa'i man ngag 'ba' zhig bsgom / gal te brgyud pa med gyur na / de dag rnams kyis bkod pa yi / gzhung rnams yang dang yang du blta* (*Bodhipathapradīpa*, P 327a-5). The *Bodhipathapradīpa-pañjikā* states, “The nectar of Ārya Nāgārjuna's words filled up Āryadeva, Candrakīrti, Bhavya, and Śāntideva down to Bodhibhadra too; even on me a little has been sprinkled and thus with their four great proofs, I establish the non-arising of all phenomena; and following the steps of those Ācāryas of old, I will hold to the tenets of the great Middle Way” (Sherburne 2000: 237; Cf. Lindtner 1981: 210); *'phags pa klu sgrub zhal gyi bdud rtsi des / arya de ba zla grag bha bya dang / zhi ba'i lha dang byang chub bzang po'i bar / tshim par gyur pa bdag la 'ng cung zhig 'thor / de ltar gtan tshigs chen po bzhi dag dis / chos*

As for this, an individual who remembers the suffering of beginningless saṃsāra of oneself and beings without exception should not be attached even to an object [the size] of a mere sesame seed, entirely discarding like a drop of spit all activities and objects of the world. First, one who keeps the pure uncorrupted three vows of morality that have been promised, who possesses the wisdom of hearing and reflection, who has compassion naturally, who disregards his own life and body for the sake of the holy dharma, should search for a holy individual having the special instruction of the lineage of Ācārya Ārya-Nāgārjuna, and please [him] for a long time. Since [one] is a beginner, reside [where it is] easy to obtain livelihood, in a great vast land, or great city or isolated place, at the edge of a mountain [rock] and so forth. Sitting on a soft and smooth seat in front of the images of the three jewels, [one should reflect] as follows: “When I survey the five types of sentient beings—[those] born from eggs,⁷ [those] born from moisture, [those] born miraculously, [those] possessing form and not possessing form, and those possessing consciousness and those not possessing consciousness—I see that they] are all my mothers. These mother-like [sentient beings] produce and accumulate polluted actions on account of their own [selfish] purpose, and with the maturation of those [actions], experience much suffering.”

Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

rnams thams cad skyes med bsgrub byas te / sngon gyi slob dpon rnams kyis res 'brang nas / dbu ma chen po'i grub mthar gnas par bya/ (P 323b6-327a1). Also, the *Satyadvayāvatāra* states, “But who has [actually] ‘understood’ emptiness?—Nāgārjuna, who was predicated by the Tathāgata, [and his] disciple Candrakīrti who [also] saw the absolute truth (*dharmatāsatya*) (Lindtner 1981: 194); *stong nyid gang gis rtog shes na / de bzhin gshegs pas lung bstan zhing / chos nyid bden pa gzigs pa yi / klu sgrub slob ma zla grags yin / de las brgyud pa'i man ngag gis / chos nyid bden pa rtogs par 'gyur /* (Lindtner 1981: 191, cf. Sherburne 2000: 335). See also the *Dbu ma'i man ngag gi 'bum* (*Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 2006: 642–68), an early Kadampa commentary on Atiśa's *Satyadvayāvatāra*, where (p. 658: 19–20) “the special instructions only exist from the lineage derived from Ācārya Candrakīrti” (*slob dpon zla ba grags pa nas brgyud pa'i man ngag yod pa cig las gdam ngag tshul bzhin du mnos nas /...*) and (p. 658: 22–23) “the special instructions of the lineage derived from Candrakīrti are the only Madhyamaka special instructions” (*zla bag rags pa las brgyud pa'i man ngag kyang dbu ma'i man ngag kho na yin te*).

⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 594.11 adds “those born from the womb” (*mngal las skyes po*).

The intelligent, having seen the sufferings of the three realms [caused] by the faults of conceptual thought and habitual tendencies should pull out from the abode that is saṃsāra.⁸

Ācārya Nāgārjuna also says:

As I have brought suffering upon sentient beings living in the prison of existence who are tormented by the fire of the afflictions, since all [of them] previously were dear friends and parents who provided great benefit, now it is suitable to make [them] happy.⁹

By understanding [their] kindness, generate the mind of awakening with the four immeasurables¹⁰ [thinking I will] “liberate them [from suffering], set them free, relieve their sufferings, and make them reach nirvāṇa”.¹¹ For this purpose accumulate the two collections [of wisdom and merit].

The immediate sphere of space before one, not separate from the dream-like mind, is filled with the three jewels like a heap of mustard seeds.¹² Remembering the seven mental perceptions and the seven holy [things], utter words of remembrance and by means of the six antidotes,¹³ having made the proper posture of body, make prostration, offerings, confess transgressions, rejoice, request

⁸ *vikalpavāsanādoṣāñ jagatrayavimohakān/ samabhivikṣya tān dhīmān yogatantreṇa śodhayet // Piṇḍikṛtasādhana*, k. 3.

⁹ Atiśa's Tibetan differs from the Tanjur. Cf. *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, k.74-75: *gang dag pha dang ma dang ni / gnyen bshes gyur pas bdag la sngon / phan pa byas par gyur pa yi / sems can de dag rnam la ni / byas pa bzo bar gyur par bya / srid pa'i btson rar sems can ni / nyon mongs me yis gdungs rnam la / bdag gis sdug bsngal byin pa ltar / de bzhin bde ba sbyin par rigs /*.

¹⁰ The 'four immeasurables' (*catvāry apramāṇāni*, Tib. *tshad med bzhi*) also known as the four 'abodes of Brahma' (*brahmavihāra*), the contemplations of immeasurable love (*maitrī*), compassion (*karuṇā*), joy (*muditā*), and equanimity (*upekṣā*). *Mahāvīyutpatti*, 1503-7.

¹¹ Aspirations to liberate (*bsgrol ba*) beings, free (*dgrol ba*) them from obstacles, free them from great powerful suffering (*dbuggs dbyung ba*), and to free those not passed beyond nirvāṇa (*mya ngan las bzla*).

¹² *Jo bo gsung 'bum* p. 595.3 reads *til gyi gang bu* ("heap of mustard seeds") rather than *til gyi ga'u* ad D 97a.

¹³ The six antidotes are (1) recitation of *sūtras* (2) mediation on emptiness, (3) recitation of mantras, (4) making statues or paintings of buddhas, (5) making offering to buddhas or *stūpas*, and (6) recitation of the names of buddhas.

[the wheel of the teaching] to be turned, make supplication,¹⁴ go for refuge, generate the mind of awakening, offer the body, take the vow, make firm the promise of the vow to remain in the path of the Mahāyāna, and dedicate all of these to great awakening. All of this turns into the realm of reality (*dharmadhātu*), the place of offering, the assembly of offerings: all of these. [Now] first of all, when [one] examines where these come from and where they go, [one realizes that] they do not go anywhere [and] they do not come from anywhere. Since all inner and outer things are exactly like that, all [of them] appear as a false emanation of illusion in one's own mind. These [things] with false-like appearance belong to the body and also belong to the mind. The mind is without color, without form, by its own nature clear light, and unarising from the beginning. The wisdom of individual analysis (*so sor rtog pa'i shes rab*) itself turns into clear light. Amidst that consciousness does not absolutely exist, does not at all abide, is not at all established, is unproduced in any aspect, and is totally pacified of elaborations. One should reside as long as one as is able in the appearanceless *vajrasamādhi* [like] the sky from which all signs of dust are gone, like the midday sky with a noon-time autumn sun. If the mind becomes distracted through the force of not being used to regular practice, stand firm through summoning suchness. In other sessions one should do the same. Many sessions should be done for a short time. At the time of becoming accustomed, when the practice becomes a bit more firm, one should do longer and longer [meditative sessions]. One should pacify with the individual antidotes to the five obstacles [of *śamatha*],¹⁵ and after that open the eyes, saying "Eh ma ho! The *dharmadhātu*, without anything existing, appears everywhere. This is amazing. These [things], the

¹⁴ These comprise the seven limbed (*saptāṅga*, *yang lag bdun*) prayer liturgy based on the *Samantabhadracaryā-praṇidhāna*: praise (*vandana*), offering (*pūjanā*), confession (*pāpadeśanā*), rejoicing (*modanā*), requesting (*adhyeṣanā*) to turn the wheel of dharma, begging [the buddhas not to abandon beings] (*yācanā*) and dedication (*pariṇāmanā*); see Crosby and Skilton: 1995: 9–13.

¹⁵ The five obstacles to be relinquished are laziness, forgetting the instructions, dullness and agitation, non-application, and over-application. There are eight antidotes to these five; see *Madhyāntavibhāga*, IV.4-5: *kausīdyam avavādasya saṃmoṣo laya uddhataḥ / asaṃskāro 'tha saṃskāraḥ pañca doṣā ime matāḥ / āśrayo 'thāśritas tasya nimittaṃ phalam eva ca / ālambane 'saṃmoṣo layauddhatyānubuddhyanā / tadapāyābhisamkāraḥ śāntau praśaṭhavāhitā / IV.5.*

nature of one's own mind, an illusory emanation, appear like an unreal apparition and are as false as they appear. Appearances are exemplified by the eight similes of illusion¹⁶ and are not intrinsically real". Then, having prayed aspiration prayers, release slowly [from] the sitting position and take to molding statues and so forth, doing as much virtuous activity as one can. Accordingly,¹⁷ one should make effort to accumulate the two collections in six sessions [of cultivation]. Meditate on *śūnyatā* at the time of sleep and go to sleep in the [sphere] of that. After that, at the last session, think to wake up with the mind of awakening arising from love and compassion. These [above activities] generate the ultimate mind of awakening. Food should be divided into four portions.¹⁸

Again, Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

The mind of ultimate bodhicitta should be produced by the power of cultivation for a bodhisattva who does the activity by way of secret mantra.¹⁹

In this way, when one strives with devotion for a long time and without stopping [then it will] automatically produce compassion towards sentient beings. Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

Accordingly, when yogis cultivate emptiness, the mind no

¹⁶ Eight similes of illusion (*aṣṭamāyopamā*, Tib. *sgyu ma'i dpe brgyad*). The eight are said to be a twinkling star (*skar mar*), optical illusion (*rab rib*), lamp (*mar me*), dream (*rmi lam*), flash of lightning (*glog*), moon in the water (*chu zla*), mirage (*smig rgyu*), and cloud (*sprin*). See Ruegg 1966: 99n2.

¹⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 595.21 reads *de ltar* rather than *de dag*.

¹⁸ "Divide into four portions" is explained by Atiśa in his *Caryāsaṃgrahapradīpa* (Sherburne 2000: 349): "Divide your food into four parts: first give pure food gifts to the gods, then scatter generous offerings to the guardians of the dharma, and after your own food and drink, give what remains to all creatures" (*zlas la cha bzhir bgo bya ste / dang po lha la bshos gtsang dbul / de rjes chos kyi srung ma la / gtor ma shin tu rgya chen gtang / rang gis zos shing 'thungs pa yi / lhag ma 'byung po kun la shyin /*).

¹⁹ Cf. *Bodhicittavivaraṇa* (Lindtner, 1986: 32): *byang chub sems dpa' gsang sngags kyi sgor spyad pa spyod pa rnams kyi de ltar kun rdzob kyi rnam pas byang byang chub kyi sems smon pa'i rang bzhin can bskyed nas / don dam pa'i byang chub kyi sems bsgom pa'i stobs kyi bskyed par bya ba yin pas.../*. Lindtner (1986, 33) translation: "When a bodhisattva, having practiced a course by way of mantras, has thus produced the bodhicitta that in its relative aspect has the nature of aspiration, he must by means of meditational development produce the absolute bodhicitta".

doubt will become joyful for the purpose of others.²⁰

Moreover,

The ultimate, birthless from the beginning, when deeply realized by the mind will effortlessly produce compassion for [those] sinking in the mud of *saṃsāra*.

Likewise, when the yogin internalizes this cultivation and cultivates the ultimate mind of awakening, then through cultivating the conventional mind of awakening one will stabilize both minds of awakening, [the two minds each] having the essence of great compassion and emptiness.²¹ The *Vairocanābhisambodhi* states:

Awakening, the characteristic [of which is similar to that] of space, is the abandonment of all conceptual thought (*rtog pa*).²²

The *Prajñāsaṃcayagāthā* says:

There is not even a mere particle of something to be obtained. One should not apprehend awakening as real. This should be demonstrated to beginners.²³

The *Śatasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā* states:

I have completely awakened in the essence of awakening without obtaining anything at all.

Also the *Ārya-Dharmasaṅgīti* states:

In this regard, what little desire of a bodhisattva is there? He is one who does not desire even awakening. What is the satisfaction? He is one who does not excessively long for the mind of awakening.

This meaning itself is indicated in many other precious sūtras as well as tantras of secret mantra. The *Śrī-Gūhyasamāja*

²⁰ *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, k. 73: *de ltar stong pa nyid 'di ni / rnal 'byor pa yis bsgom byas na / gzhan gyi don la chags pa'i blo / 'byung bar 'gyur ba the tshom med /*.

²¹ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 596.8 adds: “the object of attainment called ‘awakening’ is nothing at all” (*de byang chub ces bya'i thob par bya ba ni ci yang med de /*).

²² Cf. Miyazaki, p. 8n6, *Vairocanābhisambodhi*, D (494) tha 226b7-227a1: *byang chub nam mkha'i mtshan nyid do kun tu rtog pa thams cad spangs /*.

²³ Cf. *Ratnaguṇasaṃcayagāthā*, XV.3cd: *na ca bodhi skandha vimṛśitva parāmrśeyā ye ādikarmaka na deśayitavyaṃ evaṃ /*.

[*tantra*] states:

Due to the sameness of the essencelessness of things, one's own mind—free of all entities, without aggregates (*skandhas*), elements (*dhātus*), sense spheres (*āyatana*s), and subject and object²⁴—[is] unproduced from the beginning, the very nature of emptiness (*śūnyatā*).²⁵

The *Ārya-Aṣṭasāhasrikā* [*prajñāpāramitā*] says:

Śāripūtra, whatever is thought, that is no thought; thought by its nature is clear light.²⁶

As *Ārya Nāgārjuna* has indicated:

The mind has not been seen, and will not be seen by all buddhas. What will one see [of something that has] the nature of having no nature?²⁷

The Venerable *Āryadeva* states:

When one becomes accustomed to ascertaining the mind with wisdom, then the mind will not be seen.²⁸

The *Ārya-Dharmasaṃgīti* states:

Devapūtras! Moreover, even the desire to understand the mind of awakening is the activity of Māra.²⁹ Apprehending the mind as real while seeking out the illusionary mind is to

²⁴ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 596.16; the verse up to this point is missing.

²⁵ *sarvabhāvavigataṃ skandhadhātāvāyatana-grāhyagrāhakavarjitam / dharmanairātmyasamatayā svacittam ādyanutpannam śūnyatābhāvam / Guhyasamāja*, II.3-4:

²⁶ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 596.17–18 differs: *sha ra dva ti'i bu gang sems ma yin pa de ni sems med pa'o / gang sems med pa de ni sems med pa'o / gang sems med pa de ni rang bzhin gyis 'od gsal ba'o /*. Cf. *Aṣṭasāhasrikā*, p. 3: *taccittam acittam / prakṛtiś cittasya prabhāsvarā /*.

²⁷ *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, k. 43. The Tibetan of this verse differs from the canonical version: *mdor na sangs rgyas rnams kyi ni / gzigs par ma gyur gzigs mi 'gyur / rang bzhin med pa'i rang bzhin can / ji ltar bur na gzig par 'gyur /*. Buddhas not perceiving the mind goes back to *Kāśyapaparivarta* §98: *cittam hi kāśyapa sarvabuddhair na drṣṭam na paśyanti na paśyīṣyanti na drakṣyanti /*.

²⁸ Miyazaki, p. 9n13; *Jñānasārasamuccaya*, k. 33abc. Sanskrit located in *Tattvaratnāvalī*: *cittam niścīya bodhena abhyāsaṃ kurute yadā / tadā cittam na paśyāmi (kva gataṃ kva sthitaṃ bhavet) /*.

²⁹ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 596.22 add: *'phags pa phung po gsum pa'i mdo las kyang*.

be confessed by whomever produces the mind of unsurpassable awakening.

One who is accustomed to the great vehicle for innumerable previous lives, with a well purified [mental] continuum, with sharp mental faculties, knows the conventional mind of awakening itself as producing the ultimate mind of awakening, and since [that mind] has both great compassion and emptiness, one stands firm in the emptiness endowed with all excellent features (*rnam pa thams cad kyi mchog dang ldan pa'i stong pa nyid*).³⁰ Intending this meaning, Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

The buddhas teach that the awakened mind is not obscured with notions of a self, skandhas, and so forth, [but] has the characteristic of being empty [of such notions].³¹

Well then, if someone asks “how [is the mind of awakening produced)?” [the reply is:] one should produce it conventionally, like a magically created individual or emanated individual arousing the mind of awakening. As is said in the *Ārya-Sāgaranāgarājaparipṛcchā*:

King of Nāgas! Due to one dharma, bodhisattvas will be quickly awakened in unsurpassable fully complete awakening! What, one may ask, is that one dharma? It is the mind of awakening that does not let go of all sentient beings.³²

This *sūtra* teaches that it is necessary to generate the [mind of awakening].

³⁰ “Endowed with all excellent features” (*sarvākāraṇapetā śūnyatā*; translation Wangchuk 2007: 210) is an important concept in Tathāgatagarbha and Vajrayāna traditions. This expression is discussed by Ruegg 1981: 84, 97, 98.

³¹ *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, k. 2. Atiśa's Tibetan of this verse differs from the Tanjur version: *sang rgyas rnams kyi byang chub sems / bdag dang phung sogs rnam rig gi / rtog pa rnams kyi ma bsgribs pa / rtag tu stong nyid mtshan nyid bzhed /*.

³² Compare Miyazaki, p. 10n16: *Sāgaramatiparipṛcchā*, D (152) 58b7-59a1: *blo gros rgya mtsho theg pa chen po par 'gyur ba'i chos gcig ste / chos gcig gang zhe na / 'di lta ste / byang chub kyi sems brjed pa med cing bag yod pa ste / blo gros rgya mtsho 'di ni theg chen po sdud par 'gyur ba'i chos gcig go /*.

2 [The Mind of Awakening (D 98b4–98b6)]

Regarding that mind [of awakening], one should be knowledgeable about the: (1) cause of arising, (2) condition, (3) nature, (4) aspect, (5) training, (6) apprehension, (7) guarding, (12) increasing, (13) benefits of that [mind of awakening] (8) cause of dropping, (9) fault of relinquishing, (10) benefits of causing the arising in another, benefits of rejoicing in the arising in others, and (11) bad fault of causing interruption in the arising of [the mind in] others.

2.1 [The cause of the mind of awakening (D 98b6–99a3)]

In this regard, the cause is having the sign of the excellent lineage (*gotra*). As the *Bden par smra ba lung bstan pa'i mdo* (*Sūtra of the Prophecy Spoken Truthfully*) states:

(1) With admiration for the extensive, [one] is without admiration for the inferior. (2) By having great compassion naturally, [one] possesses virtuous qualities. (3) By abandoning polluted friends, [one] is nourished by the spiritual friend. (4) By doing whatever one says, [one] is undecitful. (5) By pleasing the buddhas wandering in the world, [one] has joy. (6) By being without low activities of body, speech, mind, [one] abandons sin. (7) By [this] faultless superior thought, [one] has trust in the sacred vow. (8) By non-attachment to [one's own] tastes, [one] has the nature of pleasing everyone. (9) One is free from the empowerments of Māra. (10) By accumulating roots of virtue, [one] does well-performed activity. (11) Since it is in the sphere of great compassion, one has compassionate love for sentient beings. (12) By freely giving necessary things, one has little attachment to anything.³³

³³ Compare Miyazaki, p. 11n17 *Bodhisattvagocaraopāyaviṣayavikurvāṇa-nirdeśa*, D (146) Pa 87a7–b5: (*rigs kyi bu chos bcu gnyis dang ldan pa'i rigs kyi bu' am rigs kyi bu mo bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub tu sems skye bar 'gyur ro / bcu gnyis gang zhe na/ 'di lta ste /*) (1) *rang bzhin gyis rgya chen po la mos shing dman pa la mos pa med pa yin /* (2) *rang bzhin gyis snying rje'i spyod yul dang ldan zhing dkar po'i rang bzhin can yin /* (7) *bcos ma ma yin pa'i lhag pa'i bsam pa'i spyod yul dang ldan zhing yi dam la brian pa yin /* (10) *tshogs shin tu bsags shing spyad pa legs par spyad pa yin /* (5) *sangs rgyas 'byung ba legs par bsnyen bkur zhing dkar po'i chos legs par yongs su bsdu pa yin /* (6) *lus dang ngag dang yid kyi las kyi mtha' kha na ma tho ba med pa dang ldan shing dig pa'i las tham cad bor ba yin /* (3) *sdig pa'i grog po thams yong su spangs*

Ācārya Ārya-Asaṅga states:

There are four causes: lineage, a spiritual friend, compassion, and enduring the suffering of saṃsāra.³⁴

2.2 [The condition for the mind of awakening (D 99a3–100a5)]

As for the condition [of generating *bodhicitta*], there are two: (1) the condition of application (*prayoga*, *sbyor ba*) and (2) the condition of thought (*āśaya*, *bsam pa*).

2.2.1 [The condition of application (D 99a3–99b5)]

In regard to that, the conditions of application are that one should: (1) accumulate the provisions [of merit], (2) purify the [mental] continuum, and (3) perform the superior going for refuge [in the three jewels].

2.2.1.1 [Accumulating provisions]

(1) To accumulate the provisions, one should perform the seven-limbed *pūjā* three times during the day and three times during the night; memorize, read, and recite the profound *sūtra* of the perfection of wisdom; make extensive offerings to the three jewels; make gifts and feast offerings for the saṃgha; give ordinary feasts; give great extensive charity to the protectorless; and give great extensive sacrificial cakes to spirits.

2.2.1.2 [Training the mental continuum]

(2) Train the mental continuum as before: read, recite, and memorize the profound *sūtras*, perform the seven-limbed *pūja*,

shing dge ba'i bshes gnyen la brten pa yin / (4) ji ltar smras pa de bzhin du byed cing slu ba med pa yin / (8) bged pa'i ngang tshul can yin zhing ro bro ba rnams la ma zhen ma chags pa mang ba yin / (9) de bzhin gshegs pa'i byin gyi rlabs kyis byin gyis brlabs shing bdud kyi byin gyi rlabs dang bral ba yin / (11) sems can thams cad la yang dang yang snying rje chen po yang dag par 'jug pa yin / (12) bdog pa thams cad yong su gtong zhing ma chags pa'i sems dang ldan pa yin te / (rigs kyi bu yon tan gyi chos bcu gnyis po de dag dang ldan pa'i rigs kyi bu'am rigs kyi bu mo bla na med pa yang dag par rdzog pa'i byang chub tu sems skye ste /...).

³⁴ Bodhisattvabhūmi, p. 10: catvāro hetavaḥ katame / gotrasampad vodhisattvasya prathamo hetuś cittasyotpattaye / buddhabodhisattva-kalyāṇamitraparigraho dvitīyo hetuś cittasyotpattaye / sattveṣu kārūṇyaṃ bodhisattvasya tṛtīyo hetuścittasyotpattaye / saṃsāraduḥkhād duṣkara-caryāduḥkhādapi dirghakālīkādvicitrāttivṛānnirantarādabhirutā caturtho hetuścittasyotpattaye /.

recite the *Triskandhaka*³⁵ and confess transgressions with texts such as *Karmāvaranapratiprasrabdhi* and *Suvarṇaprabhāsottama-sūtrendrarāja*, and so forth.

2.2.1.3 [Superior going for refuge]

(3) The superior going for refuge is distinctively noble (*ārya*, 'phags pa) in seven excellent aspects: (1) excellence of the individual person,³⁶ (2) excellence of the three jewels as objects of refuge, (3) excellence of time, (4) excellence of thought, (5) excellence of application, (6) excellence of advice, (7) excellence of benefits.

In this regard—the excellence of the three jewels as refuge objects—the object of refuge of the inferior vehicle is mentioned in the *Abhidharmakośa*:

One who goes for refuge in the three jewels, goes for refuge in the qualities of the Buddha, the saṅgha, and the dharma, and likewise one takes refuge by going for refuge in [the qualities] of nirvāṇa.³⁷

Here, the distinction of the three jewels is in three aspects: (1) the three jewels of ultimate truth, (2) the three jewels in front of oneself, and (3) the three jewels of realization.³⁸ One should ask a spiritual teacher (*bla ma*) for the extensive meaning of this.

Still, I will describe only the excellence of the advice. By means of remembering the excellence of the three jewels and their good qualities, one does not relinquish the three jewels even for the sake of one's life and body. By means of going for refuge over and over again and remembering [their] great kindness one should,

³⁵ This most likely refers to the *Sūtra of the Three Heaps* (*Āryatriskandhaka-nāmamahāyānasūtra*, Derge 384), used for the confession of downfalls and featuring thirty-five buddhas of confession. The 'three heaps' or three sections referred to in the title are (1) confession of sin (*pāpadeśanā*), (2) rejoicing at merit (*punṇānumodanā*) (3) and requesting instruction from a buddha (*buddhādhyeṣanā*).

³⁶ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 598.8: "the excellence of the special instructions for the individual" (*rten gdam nga gi khyad par dang*).

³⁷ *Abhidharmakośa*, 4.32: *buddhasaṅghakarān dharmān aśaikṣān ubhayāms ca saḥ / nirvāṇaṃ ceti śaraṇaṃ yo yāti śaraṇatrayam* /.

³⁸ The three jewels of (1) ultimate truth are the emptiness or *śūnyatā* of the buddha, dharma and saṅgha; the three jewels (2) in front of oneself are the physical representations of the three jewels; and the three jewels (3) of realizations (*mngon par togs pa*) are realizations attained on the path.

always or from time to time, offer even as much as a full bowl of pure water, as well as offer the first portion of food and so forth. Whatever you do, whatever your purpose, make requests to the three jewels but abandon other worldly methods. One should perform activity in this manner for other sentient beings as well. As for advice of the common vehicle: since one goes to refuge in the Buddha, one should not make homage and so forth to worldly deities; one should follow this advice for each of the three jewels.

2.2.2 [The condition of the thought (D 99b5–100a2)]

(2) The condition for the thought: the *Ārya-Jñānamūdrāsūtra* and the *Karuṇapūṇḍarikasūtra* state:

[Of] (1) the mind generation for the awakening of a buddha, (2) the mind generation at the time of the destruction of the holy dharma, (3) the mind generation when one has seen the suffering of sentient beings, (4) the mind generation of bodhisattvas, (5) the mind generation when one has made good offerings and worship, (6) the mind generation when one has seen other deities, and (7) the mind generation when one has seen the body of tathāgata, the first three are the actual mind of awakening.³⁹

³⁹ Miyazaki (p. 14n20) notes that this citation is not in the *Karuṇapūṇḍarika*. Cf. *Tathāgatajñānamudrāsamādhi*, D (131 da 240a7–b7): *de ci'i phyir zhe nab yams pa rnam pa bdun gyis byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems skyed do / bdun gang zhe na / 'di lta ste / (1) sangs rgyas bcom ldan 'das rnams kyis byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems skyed pa dang / (2) dam pa'i chos rnam par 'jig pa'i dus na dam pa'i chos yongs su bsrung ba'i phyir byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems skyed pa dang / (3) sdug bsngal sna tshogs kyi yongs su gzir ba'i sems can gyi khams mthong nas snying rje chen po skyes te byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa dang / (4) byang chub sems dpas byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa dang / (5) stang du byas te sbyin pa bzang po yid du 'ong ba byin nas / byang chub sems dpa' bdag nyid byang chub tu sems bskyed pa dang / (6) gzhan yang byang chub tu sems bskyed pa mthong nas byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa dang / (7) de bzhin gshegs pa'i sku'i mtshan dang dpe byad bzang po'i rgyan sna tshog kyi yon tan bsngags pa yongs su rdzogs pa thos nas byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa ste / byams pa rnam pa bdun po de dag gis byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed do / byams pa de la gang byang chub sems dpa' sang rgyas bcom ldan 'das rnams kyis byang chub tu sems bskyed pa gang yin pa dang / gang dam pa'i chos rnam par 'jig pa'i dus na dam pa'i chos yongs su bsrung bar bya ba'i phyir byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa gang yin pa dang / gang sdug bsngal sna tshogs kyis yongs su gzir ba'i sems can gyi khams mthong nas sems can*

The *Ārya-Daśadharmakasūtra* also states:

[There is] (1) the mind generation when one has been urged by buddhas and bodhisattvas and so forth, (2) the mind generation when one has seen the good qualities of the mind of awakening, (3) the mind generation when one has seen the suffering of sentient beings, (4) the mind generation when one has seen the excellence of the buddhas and bodhisattvas.⁴⁰

2.2.3 [Five conditions for the awakening thought (D 100a2–3)]

From the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*:

There are five conditions: (1) the power of friend, (2) the power of cause, (3) the power of the root, (4) the power of hearing, and (5) the power of being accustomed to virtue. Some of them are firm and some are not firm.⁴¹

2.2.4 [Four conditions and four powers (D100a3–50)]

Ācārya Āsaṅga speaks of four conditions and four powers. The four conditions are: the mind generation when one has seen the excellence of the Tathāgata, the mind generation when one has seen the benefits, the mind generation at the time of the destruction of the holy dharma, and the mind generation when one has seen the suffering of sentient beings. The four powers are: the power of cause, the power of activity, one's own power, and the power of

thams cad la snying rje chen po skyes te / byang chub sems dpa' byang chub tu sems bskyed pa gang yin pa dang / byams pa sems bskyed pa 'di gsum ni sang rgyas bcom ldan 'das rnams kyi byang chub bsrung ba yin te / myur du bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub las phyir mi ldog par 'gyur ro /.

⁴⁰ Miyzaki, p.15n21: *Daśadharmaka*, D (53) kha 168a1–a7. Cited in the *śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 8: *yathā daśadharmakasūtre deśitam / iha kulaputra bodhisattvo gotrasthaḥ sann anutpāditabodhicittaḥ tathāgatena vā tathāgataśrāvakeṇa vā sañcodyamānaḥ saṃvedyamānaḥ samādāpyamāno 'nuttarāyāṃ samyaksambodhau bodhicittam utpādayatīdam prathamam kāraṇam bodhicittotpādāya / sambodher vā bodhicittasya vā varṇam bhāṣyamānaṃ śrutvā nuttarāyāṃ samyaksambodhau cittam utpādayatīdam dvitīyam kāraṇam / sa sattvā ... naśaraṇān advīpān dṛṣṭvā kārūṇyacittam upasthāpyayāvad anuttarāyāṃ samyaksambodhau cittam utpādayatīdam tritīyam kāraṇam bodhicittotpādāya / sa tathāgatasya sarvākāraparipūrṇatām dṛṣṭvā prītimutpādyānuttarāyāṃ samyaksambodhau cittam utpādayatīdam caturtham kāraṇam iti /.*

⁴¹ *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*, 4.7: *mitrabalāt hetubalān mūlabalāc chrutabalāc chubhābhyāsāt / adṛḍhadṛḍhodaya (uktaś cittopādaḥ parākyānāt) /.*

others.

In this way, when one thoroughly accumulates the causes and conditions, one will thoroughly generate the mind of awakening.

2.3 [The nature of arising (D 100a5–100a6)]

The nature of arising: the wish (*'dun pa*), the desire (*'dod pa*), and the aspiration (*smon pa*) are synonyms.⁴² As Ārya Maitreya states:⁴³

Generation of mind is a desire for perfectly complete awakening for the sake of others.⁴⁴

The essential nature is to perceive the distinctive object of consciousness, which is an intelligence that possesses similarity with compassion and wishing. Like the good foundational earth that produces without exception the crops of [virtuous] white dharma[s], the wish is the mind of awakening that is like earth.

2.4 [The distinctive aspect (D 100a6–100b1)]

The distinction or the particularity of the aspect itself is that it is not even covered by any kind of fault, like deceiving and so forth, and is stainless. For example, like the pure gold that is without the faults of rust, stones, earth, and so forth, that mind itself is a pure thought like gold. As for the extensive meaning of this, the *Ārya-Akṣayamatīnirdeśasūtra*: states:

Venerable Śāradvatīputra: Regarding the mind of awakening, what are the aspects of generating the mind like that? [Bhagavan:] Kulaputra, by being unmixed with the inferior vehicle, [that mind] arises in the aspect of purity.⁴⁵

Thus it is taught extensively and so forth [in the *sūtras*].

⁴² See Sparham 1987 regarding debates on the relation of *bodhicitta* to mental factors (*caitta*) such as desire.

⁴³ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 599.13 has the archaic *ji snyed du mgon po byam pa'i zhal snga nas* /.

⁴⁴ *Abhisamayālaṃkāra*, 1.18ab: *cittotpādaḥ parārthāya samyaksambodhi-kāmatā* /.

⁴⁵ Compare with *Akṣayamatīnirdeśa* (Braarvig 1993: 20): *bstun pa sha ra dva ti'i bu byang chub sems dpa' rnam kyī dang po sems bskyed pa yang mi zad pa'o / de ci'i phyir zhe na / ma 'dres pa'i phyir ro / sems de ni nyon mongs pa thams cad dang ma 'dres par skyes so / theg pa gzhan la 'dod pa med pas sems de ni ma 'brel bar skyes so* /.

2.5 [Training the mind (D 100b1–100b3)]

Regarding the training, first the mind did not come from anywhere and will not go anywhere at the end. [The mind] does not abide anywhere and is without color and without shape. [The mind] does not arise from the beginning nor does it not cease at the end. [The mind is] empty of inherent existence and is of the nature of clear light. One should recall this again and again.

On the other hand, one should stabilize through accustoming that mind of awakening to love and compassion. One should completely purify [the mind] and stand firm, being continuously mindful of each moment of thought with mindfulness, awareness, thoughtfulness, and conscientiousness.

2.6. [Keeping the mind of awakening (D 100b3–103a2)]

As for keeping the mind of awakening, [this consists of]: (1) the four ways of not letting go of sentient beings, (2) the eight thoughts of a holy individual, (3) the ten masteries of the inner method, (4) the six masteries of the outer method, including the exchange of self and other, as well as equalizing self and others, and (5) dedicating with the *Rdo rje rgyal mtshan gyi bsngo ba chen po bcu* (*Ten Great Blessings of the Vajra Banner*) and the *Ārya-Bhadracaryā*.

2.6.1 [Not giving up sentient beings (D 100b5–102a3)]

In this regard not giving up sentient beings entails: (1.1) not letting go of the mind that is beneficial to oneself, (1.2) not letting go of sentient beings who harm oneself, (1.3a) directly suffering, (1.3b) not giving up the cause of suffering and so forth, and (1.4) not giving up on sentient beings in general.

2.6.1.1 [Not letting go those who benefit oneself (D 100b6–101a1)]

Regarding that, not letting go those who benefit oneself means to not let go the mind that knows the kindness [of beings] and repays their kindness. As Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

Sentient beings—who have resided in the prison of existence suffering with the fire of the defilements since beginningless saṃsāra—were previously my parents. Since they provided great benefit [I] need to make the same repayment. They have been made to suffer by me, now it is

suitable to make [them] happy.⁴⁶

One should look at the sūtras for the extensive meaning of this. One needs to understand the benefits that the father, mother, relatives, friends, and so forth of this life have provided and repay [their] kindness. Accordingly, if one will not do so, the downfall of “not to repay a good turn”⁴⁷ will occur.

2.6.1.2 [Not letting go beings who do harm to oneself (D 101a1–7)]

Not letting go of sentient beings who do harm to oneself means to not mentally relinquish one's control over [one's] actions. As is said,

When answered politely, the supreme individual of the Jambudvīpa continent responds politely, and even when receiving a rude response answers in a considerate manner.

The *Eight Thousand Verse Mother* (*Aṣṭasāhasrikāprañāpāramitā*) states:

A bodhisattva, even when faulted by others, does not become disturbed in mind, does not harm them, and does not fight with them. Even in the case of killing one does not become hostile. One does not have hatred toward any sentient being. Bodhisattvas should firmly produce [this] disposition.

As is further taught:

Bodhisattvas should perceive all sentient beings as mother, father, sons, and daughters. As one wishes happiness for oneself, [one] should apply happiness to other beings as well. One should liberate from suffering all beings without exception, not giving up on any sentient being. Even if they cut one's body into one hundred pieces, one produces love

⁴⁶ *Bodhicittavivarāṇa*, k. 74-75. Atiśa's Tibetan of these verses differs from the Tanjur version: *gang dag pha dang ma dang ni / gnyen bshes gyur pas bdag la sngon / phan pa byas par gyur pa yi / sems can de dag rnams la ni / byas pa bzo bar gyur par bya / 74 / srid pa'i btson rar sems can ni / nyon mongs me yis gdungs rnams la / bdag gid sdub bsngal byin pa ltar / de bzhin bde ba sbyin par rigs / 75.*

⁴⁷ *Bodhisattvasaṃvaraviṃśaka*, k. 18c: *byas la lan du phan mi 'dogs/*. Cf. Tatz 1985: 29: “Not to repay a good turn”.

and compassion and does not have malice towards them.⁴⁸

From the venerable Āryadeva:

When fierce harm occurs, one should understand that as [one's own] previous *karma*.

If it is the case that one will not do accordingly, rudimentary downfalls and faults will occur such as

“not listening to another’s confession”, “striking out in anger”, “blaming others”, “abandoning confession through discussing other’s faults”,⁴⁹ “disdaining those who are angry”, “abusing with abusive replies” and so forth.⁵⁰

2.6.1.3a [Not letting go beings who suffer (D 101a7–b3)]

One does not let go of beings who are certainly suffering from heat, cold, hunger, thirst, and so forth, the immediate [suffering of heinous actions],⁵¹ etc., and degenerate vows. When seeing them tormented with various sufferings, one does not relinquish the mind of compassion. As the Venerable Āryadeva states:

I have heard that a wheel made of iron twelve *yojanas* long revolves on the head; as soon as the mind of awakening arises, it is dispelled.⁵²

⁴⁸ *Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā*, p. 14: *tasmān māṭṛsaṃjñā pīṭṛsaṃjñā putrasaṃjñā duhitṛsaṃjñā bodhisattvena mahāsattvena sarvasattvānām antike yāvad ātmasaṃjñā utpādayitavyā / yathā ātmā sarveṇa sarvaṃ sarvathā sarvaṃ sarvaduḥkhebhya mocayitavyaḥ evaṃ sarvasattvāḥ sarveṇa sarvaṃ sarvathā sarvaṃ sarvaduḥkhebhya mocayitavyā iti / evaṃ ca sarvasattveṣu saṃjñā utpādayitavyā mayaite sarvasattvā na parityaktavyāḥ / mayaite sarvasattvāḥ parimocayitavyā aparimāṇato duḥkhaskandhāt / na ca mayaiteṣu cittapradoṣa utpādayitavya antaśaḥ śataśo 'pi chidyamāneneti / evaṃ hi bodhisattvena mahāsattvena cittamutpādayitavyam.*

⁴⁹ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 600.25 adds: “engaging with an angry mind” (*khro ba'i sems kyis rjes su 'jug /*).

⁵⁰ These are bodhisattva downfalls listed in the *Bodhisattvasaṃvaraviṃśaka*: (k. 7ab) *gzhan gyis bsags kyang mi nyan par / khros nas gzhan la 'tshog pa dang /* (k. 13c) *pha rol shad kyis 'chags pa spong /* (k. 13ab) *gshe la lan du gshe la sogs / khros pa rnamis ni yal bar 'jog /* Tatz, 1985: 28.

⁵¹ The five sins of immediate retribution (*ānantaryakarma*) are killing one’s father, mother, or an arhat, drawing the blood a buddha, and creating a schism in the monastic community. See Silk 2007.

⁵² *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa*, k. 32: *dvādaśayojanavyāsaṃ cakram vai śirasi*

Ācārya Aśvaghōṣa says:

Just as a mother produces anguish for a son tormented by illness, likewise a bodhisattva's love exists especially for those who are inferior.⁵³

Also, Ācārya Bhāvaviveka states:

At the time of seeing the sorrowful who are overwhelmed with grief, compassion arises from the bottom of the heart and [one] provides benefit to them.⁵⁴

One should look in the *sūtras* for the extensive [meaning].

2.6.1.3b [Not letting go beings who have the cause of suffering (D 101b3–b6)]

Not letting go of sentient beings who have the cause of suffering and so forth means to not let go of the mind that has loving compassion. Undermining precepts, performing heinous actions, cutting life, and committing various transgressions—one should do the opposite from these. The *Ārya-Smṛtyupasthānasūtra* states:

Whoever, having received good conduct, does not protect [it] well: that [person's] flesh and bones will certainly burn in the destructive [hell] of Memarmu.

And:

The Noble being who obtains and stands firm in desirable qualities, when seeing the breaking of morality, sheds tears [thinking] “What rebirth will come of this?”⁵⁵

Also, Ācārya Nāgārjuna says:

bhramat /bodhicittam samutpādyā apanītam iti śrutih.

⁵³ Miyazaki, p. 21n37, cf. *Catuhṣataka*, V-11, Sanskrit text is found in the *Subhāṣitasamgraha*, fol 11, p. 385: *glāne putre viśeṣeṇa mātā 'rtā jāyate yathā / asatsu bodhisattvānām viśeṣeṇa dayā tathā /*.

⁵⁴ Cf. *Madhyamakahrdaya* III.296cd, 297a, 301ab: *aśokaḥ śokasamtaptam prekṣate duḥkhitam jagat / 296 /sa tadā karuṇārdreṇa lokam ālokyā cakṣuṣā/ 297ab /pepiḍyamānaḥ kṛpayā taddhitādhānadikṣitaḥ / 301 a /* For comments on these verses see Eckel 1992: 27–28, 174–76, 2008: 45–46.

⁵⁵ Cf. *Gaganagañjaparipṛcchā*, D (148) pa 323a7-b1: *sems can rnyed dang 'dod gnas pa / tshul khriṃs 'chal bam thong nas su / de yi 'gro ba cir 'gyur zhes / mchi ma 'ang rab tu 'byung bar gvi /*. Cited in the *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 45.15–16: *drṣtvā duḥśīlasattvāṃś cecchālobhapraṭiṣṭhitān / āsrupātāṃ kariṣyāmo gatiḥ kāndhasya bhāvitā /*.

May I always dissuade all at once all beings of any world who intend to engage in negativity, without doing them any harm.⁵⁶

2.6.1.4 [Not letting go of sentient beings in general (D 101b6–102a3)]

Generally, not to let go of sentient beings means not to relinquish the mind of love. The *Ārya-Pratibhānamatimahāyāna-sūtra* states:⁵⁷

Bodhisattvas should view all sentient beings like a son. One should view them like one's own body.⁵⁸

Also, the *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* says:

Like a pigeon who has supreme love for her young, embracing them closely to herself, a bodhisattva has love like that for sentient beings who suffer.⁵⁹

The *Vidyottamamahātantra* also states:

Bodhisattvas do not desire their own happiness, are not even bothered by their own sufferings, and suffer because of the sufferings of others. If others are happy, then bodhisattvas are joyful.

The *Śrī-Vajraḍākinītantra*, as well as the *Śrīparamādī[buddha]* state:

For as long as he can, the best wise person bestrides (*gnas, adhiṣṭhāna*) existence and for that long he accomplishes unequalled good for sentient beings, without passing beyond suffering.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ English translation of Dunne and McClintock 1997: 69, *Ratnāvalī*, 5.82: *ye pāpāni cikīṣanti sarvalokeṣu vartataḥ / vārayeya[m nirābādham] tān sarvān yugapat sadā /*.

⁵⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* 601.18 cites from the *'phag pa blo gros mi zad pa'i mdo*.

⁵⁸ Miyazaki p. 22n42, *Pratibhānamatiparipṛcchā*, D (151) pa 339a3: (*kun tu thogs pa med pa'i 'od zer rnams kyi*) *sems can thams cad bdag dang 'dra zhin bu gcig pa'i byis pa dang 'dra bar mthong ba dang /...*

⁵⁹ The Tibetan here differs from the Sanskrit. Cf *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra*, 13.22: *yathā kapotī svasutātivatsalā svabhāvakāṃstānupaguhya tiṣṭhati / tathāvidhāyaṃ pratigho virudhyate suteṣu tadvatsakṛpe 'pi dehiṣu /*. See Thurman et al., 2004: 172.

⁶⁰ *Śrīparamādyamantrakalpakaṇḍa*, D (488) ta 173b-34: *ci srid 'khor ba'i*

One should look in the sūtras for the extensive [meaning of this point].

2.6.2 [Eight special thoughts of a holy individual (D 102a3–5)]

The eight special thoughts of a holy individual: (1) Alas! If possible may I be able to make sentient beings be without the suffering of birth; and likewise (2) without the suffering of aging, (3) the suffering of sickness, and (4) the suffering of death. (5) I will deliver beings who are not delivered and (6) free those who are not free. (7) I will free them from powerful suffering and (8) I will lead to nirvāṇa those who have not yet reached nirvāṇa. One should continuously be mindful, moment by moment, thinking these thoughts.

2.6.3 [Mastery of the inner method (D 102a3–b1)]

Mastery of the inner method: Make others' suffering one's own and clear away the suffering of others with one's own suffering. Exchange (*brje ba*) others' suffering with one's happiness; always grieve (*gdungs pa*) on account of others' suffering. As the *Vidyottamamahātantra* states:

Bodhisattvas are not attached to their own happiness; they are not even bothered (*mi mjed kyang*) by their own sufferings. [Their] mind suffers with others' suffering; when others are happy, bodhisattvas are joyful.

One confesses others' transgressions as one's own, rejoices in others' virtue as if it was one's own, rejoices through making one's own virtue the virtue of others, and dedicates having made one's own virtue the virtue of others.

2.6.4 [Mastery of the outer method (D 102b1–b2)]

The mastery of the outer method includes the four means of gathering disciples,⁶¹ the five objects of knowledge,⁶² the ten

gnas su ni / mkhas mchog 'dug par 'gyur ba'i tshe / de srid mtshungs med sems can don / mya ngan mi 'da' byed par nus /; cf. *Adhyardhaśatikā*, k.1: *yāvad bhavādhiṣṭhāne 'tra bhavanti varasūrayaḥ / tāvat sattvārthm atulaṃ śakyā kartum anivṛtāḥ /*. Also cited in the *Bodhipathapradīpa-pañjikā* (Sherburne 2000: 267).

⁶¹ The four means of gathering disciples (*bsdu ba'i dngos po*, *saṃgrahavastu*) are: generosity (*dāna*), kind words (*priyavādītā*), beneficial acts (*arthacaryā*), and sympathy (*samānārthatā*). *Mahāvīyutpattī*, 924–28.

⁶² Also known as the five sciences (*pañcavidyā*): linguistic science (*śabda*), logical science (*hetu*), 'inner' science (*adhyātma*), medical science (*cikitsā*),

masteries, the six perfections, the four immeasurables, and so forth. [The following activities] mature all sentient beings without exception: nurturing, terrifying, seducing, conquering, building, and pleasing with presents.

2.6.5 [Dedication with recitation (D 102b2–103a2)]

One should avoid relinquishing beings by [reciting] the *Rdo rje rgyal mtshan gyi bsngo ba bcu pa* (*The Ten Praises of the Noble Vajra Victory Banner*), the *Bhadracaryā*[*praṇidhāna*], the *Smon lam nyi shu pa* (*Twenty Aspirational Prayers*) composed by Ācārya Nāgārjuna, and the eleven verses that occur in the *Ba tshwa chu klung* [*mdo*] (*Salty River* [*sūtra*]) and so forth. As the Ārya-*Kāśyapaparivarta* states:

Even for the sake of one's life, without speaking lies, one should stand firm with the superior thought that is undeceiving to sentient beings. One should generate the perception that individuals who have the mind of awakening are teachers. One should mature sentient beings who are ready to become established in unsurpassable awakening but not *śrāvakas* or *pratyekabuddhas*.⁶³

Likewise the Ārya-*Avalokiteśvaraparipṛcchā* states:

Kuḷaputra, bodhisattvas who immediately generate the mind of awakening should train in seven qualities, and should not have sexual enjoyment even with mental perception, not to mention joining together the two sexual organs. One should not take up with a non-virtuous friend even in dreams. With a mind like that of a bird, one should be completely without grasping. With mastery in skill and wisdom, without grasping at pride and the “I”, abandon [conceptions of] existence and non-existence, and firmly cultivate the *samādhi* of emptiness. Pacifying erroneous conceptuality, do not take joy in *saṃsāra*. In brief, a mind

and the science of fine arts and crafts (*śilapakarmasthāna*). *Mahāvvyutpatti*, 1554–59. See Gold 2007: 11–16, 20–24.

⁶³ Cf. *Kāśyapaparivarta* §4: a *jīvitārthe anṛtaṃ vadanti bhāṣaṃti vācaṃ sada arthayuktāṃ māyāya śāṭṭhyena ca nitya varjitā adhyāśayena sada satva paśyati* *ṛbodbhāya ye prasthita śuddhasatvā śāsteti tān manyati bodhisatvān varṇaṃ ca teṣāṃ bhaṇate caturdiśaṃ śāstāra saṃjñāṃ sadupasthapitvā yāṃś cāpi satvān paripācayati anuttare jñāne samādapeti cāpi eteṣu dharmeṣu pratiṣṭhitānaṃ cittaṃ na bodhāya kadāci muhyati.*

in accordance with mindfulness and introspection will not be separate from conscientiousness.⁶⁴

[And:]

Befouled by offences due to the fault of lacking awareness, [conscientiousness] does not stay in the memory of a mind that lacks awareness, like water in a leaky jar.⁶⁵

Again:

Through mindfulness, awareness, and mental introspection one does not separate from conscientiousness.⁶⁶

This is taught by Ācārya Śāntideva.

Through not forgetting in each moment of thought and by having continual mindfulness, one should apprehend the mind of awakening. In the case where one has not acted appropriately—

not giving wealth or *dharma*, being stingy (*ser sna*) to suffering protectorless [beings], not offering [*dharma*] to those [who] seek *dharma*, neglecting to do service [for the] sick, not being a friend in need, doing little for the purpose of sentient beings⁶⁷

⁶⁴ Miyazaki, p. 25n48, *Avalokiteśvarapariṣcchāsaptadharmaka*, D (150) pa 331a7-b2: *rigs kyi bu sems bskyed ma thag pa'i byang chub sems dpas chos bdun la bslab par bya ste / bdun gang zhe na / 'di lta ste / rnam par tog pas kyang 'dod pa la sten par mi byed na dbang po gnyis sbyor blta smos kyang ci dgos / tha na rmi lam gyi nang du yang mi dge ba'i bshes gnyen bsten par mi byed pa dang / bya dang 'dr ba'i sems kyis yongs su 'dzin pa med par bya ba dang / thabs dang shes rab la mkhas pas nga rgyal dang / ngar 'dzin pa med par bya ba dang / dngos po dang / dngos po med pa spangs nas stong pa nyid kyi rnam par thar pa brtan po dang ldan par bya ba dang / yang dag par bden pa ma yin pa'i kun du rtog pa'i shes pa sgyu ma dang / rmi lam dang 'dra bar 'khor ba las mngon par dga' bar bya ba ma yin pa dang / rgyu dang 'bras bu la skur bag dab par mi bya ba ste /*

⁶⁵ Atiśa cites two half-verses in inverse order from the *Bodhicaryāvatāra* (5.26cd, 25cd) making it difficult to determine the subject of the citation. The Sanskrit of the regular order of the half-verses is as follows:
*sacchidrakumbhajalavanna smṛtāvavatiṣṭhate / 5.25cd/
asamprajanyadoṣeṇa bhavanty āpattikaśmalāḥ / 5.26 /*

⁶⁶ *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, 27 cbd: *apramādāviyojanāt / smṛtyātha samprajanyena yoniśācintanena ca*.

⁶⁷ *Bodhisattvasaṃvaraviṃśaka*: (k.10c) *chos 'dod pa la sbyin mi byed / (17dc) dgos pa'i grogs su 'gro mi byed / nad pa'i rim gro bya ba spong / (11b) sems can don la bya ba chung /*. See Tatz 1985: 28–29.

—that is how major transgressions and faults will occur.

2.7 [Protecting the mind of awakening (D 103a2–103b4)]

Completely protecting the mind of awakening: One should guard against forgetting, undermining, and giving up [the mind of awakening]. As the *Ārya-Kāśyapaparivarta* states:

Causing those without regret to have regret; deceiving the preceptor, teacher, and objects of genorsity; not having the superior thought in abundance; deceiving and agitating sentient beings; and insulting individuals who have generated the mind [of awakening].⁶⁸

As the *Ārya-Sarvapūṇyasamuccayasamādhī* states:

Son Without Desire! With four qualities [one] will forget the mind of awakening: excessive conceit, not respecting the dharma, disregarding the spiritual friend, and saying bad words; and four further: making acquaintance with *śrāvakas* and *pratyekabuddhas*, admiring (*mos*) the inferior vehicle, having anger toward and slandering (*sdang zhing skur pa 'debs pa*) bodhisattvas, and pretending not to know the dharma (*chos la dpe mkhyud byed pa*); and four further: being deceptive [to someone else], deceiving [with one's own faults], being duplicitous to the guru, and having great attachment to profit (*rnyed pa*) and honor (*bkur sti*); and four further: not understanding evil action, [being] obscured with the obscurations of karma, [having] no fortitude for the altruistic attitude, and [being] without skillful means and wisdom. These will cause [one] to forget the mind of awakening.⁶⁹

The *Sāgaranāgarājapariprcchā* states:

King of Nāgas! That wisdom of all-knowledge is free from the twenty-two bad paths and wrong paths: (1) not being free from the mentality of *śrāvakas* and not being free from

⁶⁸ *Kāśyapaparivarta* §3, (*caturbhiḥ kāśyapa dharmaiḥ samanvāgatasya bodhisattvasya bodhicittaṃ muhyati katamais caturbhiḥ*) *yad utācāryaguru dākṣiṇīyavisamvādanatayā pareṣam akokṛ{ī}tye kaukrīyaupasamhāraṇatayā mahāyānasamprasthitānām ca sattvānām avarṇāyaśakīrtiśabdaślokaniścāraṇatayā māyāśāṭṭhyena ca param upacarati nādhyāśayena ebhiḥ kāśyapa caturbhiḥ dharmaiḥ samanvāgatasya bodhisattvasya bodhicittaṃ muhyati.*

⁶⁹ Miyazaki, p. 28n56, *Sarvapūṇyasamuccayasamādhī*, D (134) na 101a4–7.

the mentality of *pratyekabuddhas*, (2) [having] pride and excessive conceit, (3) deceiving others and self-deception, (4) conversing with nihilists, (5) [engaging in] erroneous practice, (6) being frightened by birth, (7) being swollen with pride, (8) [engaging in] argument, (9) [having] passionate attachment, (10) [having] hatred, (11) [being] ignorant, (12) [encountering] obstacles of *karma*, (13) [encountering] obstacles of [powerful] dharmas, (14) praising oneself and demeaning others, (15) not wanting to share the dharma, (16) being forgetful, (17) [consorting with] sinful friends, (18) [having] a hateful attitude to the spiritual teacher, (19) not being harmonious with the six perfections, (20) [having the extremes] of nihilism and permanency, (21) [performing] the four means of conversion with non-mastery of skillful means and (22) not separating from all sins. With these [one] will forget the mind of awakening.

Also, the *Gaṇḍhavyūha* states:

Hey! Sons of the Victorious One, [I] do not see a greater karmic retribution than negative thoughts occurring among bodhisattvas.

Likewise, one should look in *sūtras* that speak extensively on this, such as the *Śraddhābalādhānāvatāramudrā*.

2.8 [The causes for downfalls to occur (D 103b4–103b7)]

The causes for downfalls to occur: being without a lineage, having little compassion, not being frightened by the misery of *samsāra*, being under the influence of evil friends, thinking that highest awakening is far away, being overpowered by Māra, serving an individual of the inferior vehicle, making effort in the texts of the small vehicle (*theg pa chung ngu'i gzhung*), abandoning sentient beings, uttering insults and having hostility toward bodhisattvas, and not abandoning a position unharmonious with the mind of awakening. Furthermore, [there is] being without awareness, without conscientiousness, without humility, and having many defilements.

2.9 [The negative consequence of letting go (D 103b7–104a1)]

The negative consequence (*nyes dmigs*) of letting go: If the sentient beings of the trichiliocosm became arhats and [one] were to kill all of them, and also perform the five heinous actions, the sin

of letting go would be even greater. Moreover, the number of dust particles that pervade the limits of space is known by the Buddha, but the measure of this sin— just this—cannot be known by the Buddha. [One] should look in the sūtras, *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, and so forth for the extensive meaning of this.

2.10 [The benefit of rejoicing in others' generation of the mind of awakening (D 104a1–104a3)]

As for the benefit of rejoicing in others' generation of the mind [of awakening], [there is this] from the *Eight Thousand Verse Mother* (*Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā*):

The measurable number of all the world realms is knowable, but as for the benefit of making others enter into generating...

— one should look at Mahāyāna sūtras and the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*—

...even the buddhas and bodhisattvas of the ten directions are not able to cognize. The measure of merit made by rejoicing in others' generation of the mind of awakening is unknowable.⁷⁰

One should look in the sūtras for the extensive [meaning].⁷¹

2.11 [The negative consequence of interrupting others' generation of mind. (D 104a3–104a6)]

As for the negative consequence of interrupting others' generation of mind, the *Kuśalamūlasamparigraha* [states]:

Śāradvatīputra, a person who desires to interrupt the generation of mind or causes interruption, Śāradvatīputra, will have no opportunity for nirvāṇa.

Likewise, the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā* [*prajñāpāramitā*] states:

It is a greater sin than performing the five heinous actions and killing as many arhats as there are sands of the Ganges

⁷⁰ Cf. *Aṣṭasāhasrikā*, p. 216: *syāt khalu punaḥ kauśika śakyeta trisāhasramahāsāhasre lokadhātau tulyamāne palāgreṇa pramāṇaṃ grahītuṃ, na tve va kauśika tasya kulaputrasya vā kuladuhitṛ vā bodhisattvasya mahāsattvasyānumodanāsahagatasya cittotpādasya puṇyapramāṇaṃ grahītuṃ /*.

⁷¹ The preceding irregular sequence of citation follows the order given in the Tibetan.

river [in] three thousand world systems.

Also, the *Bodhicaryāvatāra* states:

Whoever interrupts and hinders the merit of generating the mind of awakening, becomes inadequate for the purposes of sentient beings; limitless are the bad migrations of that [person].⁷²

One should look in the *sūtras* for the extensive meaning.

2.12 [Increasing the Mind of Awakening (D 104a6–105b1)]

2.12.1 [Increasing the Mind of Awakening]

Increasing of the mind of awakening: That mind itself, the mind of awakening, increases in three aspects: the mind of awakening [increases by way of] the discipline of vows (*saṃvara-śīla*), the discipline of collecting virtuous *dharma*s (*kuśaladharmasaṃgrāhaka-śīla*), and the discipline of effecting the aims of sentient beings (*sattvārthakriyā-śīla*). For example, like the gradual increase of the waxing moon, this mind will also increase.

Moreover, since it is superior by [virtue of] its vast and extensive purity, causes great benefit, and is virtuous itself, the pure thought is the superior thought (*adhyāśaya*).

This is taught in the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*.⁷³ The superior thought is like the beginning of the moon (*zla ba tshes*) and is also called the engaging mind of awakening.

2.12.2 [Three Aspects of Conduct]

The *Śīlapāṭalam* [in Asaṅga's *Bodhisattvabhūmi*] states that conduct has three aspects: naturally endowed conduct (*prakṛti-śīla*), accustomed conduct (*abhyasta-śīla*), and conduct [based on] accepting vows (*samātta-śīla*).

2.12.2.1 [Naturally Endowed Conduct]

Regarding naturally endowed conduct: All sentient beings have a single lineage, possess the essence of the Tathāgata (*tathāgatagarbha*), and possess the Mahāyāna lineage. Although one may have the fortune to succeed when practicing, nevertheless,

⁷² *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, 4.9: *yo 'pyanyaḥ kṣaṇamapyasya puṇyavighnaṃ kariṣyati / tasya durgatiparyanto nāsti sattvārthadhātinaḥ /*.

⁷³ Citation not identified.

[the lineage] remains covered with four types of faults. As the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra* states:

Briefly, the fault of lineage is expressed in four aspects: being accustomed to defilements, having bad friends, being destitute, and being under the power of another.⁷⁴

This said, the individual who possesses the lineage naturally has great compassion and naturally possesses in the mental continuum the virtues of the perfections called ‘naturally endowed conduct’.

2.12.2.2 [Accustomed Conduct]

Accustomed conduct has three aspects: from a past life up to this life one has great familiarity with the great vehicle, has moderate familiarity, or [one] has been accustomed from immeasurable previous lives. For this reason Maitreya states:

Venerating the buddhas, producing roots of virtue under them, being protected by the spiritual friend: this is the vessel who hears [the teaching].

Engaging in proper worship and respect of the buddhas, and practicing giving, morality, and so forth: that one is understood by the holy ones as a vessel.⁷⁵

2.12.2.3 [Discipline]

In this regard, [there is] the discipline based on properly accepting vows: the preceptor (*slob dpon*), having examined well by way of three examinations, should bestow discipline according to the level of the vessel. For the aforementioned individual, the preceptor should give the [vows related to] the four great basic downfalls of the *Prātimokṣa*, along with the accompanying lesser [restrictions], the four similar downfalls of the *Mahāyāna*, and the forty-six minor downfalls. For the moderate individual [i.e., an individual with moderate familiarity with *Mahāyāna*], one should bestow the vows of that moderate individual. On top of that, [one] should bestow [vows related to] the eighteen root downfalls of the

⁷⁴ *kleśābhyāsaḥ kumitratvaṃ vidhātāḥ paratantratā / gotrasyādinavo jñeyāḥ samāsenā caturvidhaḥ / Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*, 3.7.

⁷⁵ Cf. *Abhisamayālaṃkāra*, 4.6, 7abd: *kṛtādhikārā buddheṣu teṣūptaśubhamūlakāḥ / mitraiḥ sanāthāḥ kalyāṇair asyāḥ śravaṇabhājanam / buddhopāsanasaṃpraśnadānaśilādicaryayā / (udgrahadhāraṇādīnām) bhājanatvaṃ satāṃ matam /*.

Ākāśagarbha and so forth, and the fourteen faults mentioned by Ācārya Śāntideva. For the third individual, in addition to these, the four hundred disciplines that are taught in the *Saptaśatikā* and the precepts of the bodhisattva path of accumulation that are taught in the Mahāyāna *sūtras* should be maintained. As for one on the path of accumulation, the discipline of vows is foremost. For the person on the path of preparation, the discipline that collects virtuous qualities is foremost. For the person who is beyond the worldly path, the discipline that achieves the purpose of sentient beings is foremost. If you calculate (*rtsis na*) in the continuum of a single individual, the individual at the time of the small path of accumulation should make effort in the precepts of the first [type]. The individual at the time of the moderate path of accumulation should make efforts in the precepts of the moderate [individual]. The third individual should make effort in the precepts of the third [type]. Intending the aforementioned accustomed discipline, the *Prasādaprabhāvanā* states:

The bodhisattva-follower with predispositions for faith in the Mahāyāna follows in this way: whether moving, sitting, sleeping, sick, drunk, or crazy, one will always have faith in the Mahāyāna. The bodhisattva, adhering faithfully to the great vehicle in this life as well as future lives, will—even if they have forgotten the mind of awakening in those lives—not be in an inferior situation or have a mind that has inferior fortune. [The bodhisattva] will not even be tempted to identify with *pratyekabuddhas*, *Śrāvakas*, and evil friends. How can they be tempted by other *tīrthikas*? When one comes across even a small condition for faith in the Mahāyāna, [one] will swiftly and continuously produce strong faith in the Mahāyāna for that purpose. Therefore, inclinations to faith in the Mahāyāna will increase in later lives, up until unsurpassable fully complete awakening.⁷⁶

⁷⁶ Miyazaki, p. 34n66; *Mahāyānaprasādaprabhāvanā*, D (144) pa 15a6–b3: rig kyi bu 'di la byang chub sems dpa' rnam kyi theg pa chen po'i phyir theg pa chen po la dad pa'i bag chags byang chub sems dpa'i gnas la rje su 'brang ba de ni 'di ltar rjes su 'brang ste / 'di lta ste / 'gro 'am 'dug gam nyal lam gnyid kyis log gam / ra ro'am / smyos kyang rung ste / rtag tu theg pa chen po la dad pa de dang ldan par 'gyur ro / byang chub sems dpa' tshe rabs gzhan du rjes te / theg pa chen po la dad pa de brjed du zin kyang dman pa skal pa mi mnyam pa'i sems bskyed pa'i tshul can ma yin pas / bshes gnyen ngan pa nyan thos dang rang sangs rgyas dang 'dre bas kyang

2.13 [The Benefits of the Mind of Awakening (D 105b1–106a1)]

In this regard, the benefits of the mind of awakening have two aspects; these are: (1) the benefit of aspiration (*praṇidhāna*) and (2) the benefit of engaging (*prasthāna*).

2.13.1 [The Benefits of the Aspiration]

The benefits of aspiration are limitless. In brief, [the mind of awakening] does not cut off the continuous lineage of the three jewels in the world. It is the seed or cause of all virtuous actions, destroying sin, uplifting from downfalls, and rendering non-existent all interruptions, epidemics (*rims*), devils (*mi ma*), and so forth. The *Kuśalamūlasaṃparigraha* states:

Śāradvatīputra, firstly, the heap of merit of the mind of awakening is not merely a common or minor matter. Accordingly, one is not able to proclaim [the merit] even in a hundred, a thousand, or a hundred thousand aeons. How could one know the measurement of the merit of bodhisattvas' generation of the mind [of awakening]?

And also, the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā* states:

The merit is greater in someone generating the mind of awakening for one day, half a day, or a finger snap than [in] someone possessed of substantialist views creating for an aeon the roots of merit [equal to] the sands of the Ganges River.

Also the *Bodhicaryāvatāra* states:

If those who are bound in the prison of *samsāra* generate the mind of awakening for one moment, they will be proclaimed a 'Son of the Sugata,' and will be venerated by gods and men in the world.

Seizing this impure form [the mind of awakening], transform it into the priceless image of the Buddha-gem. Grasp tightly the supreme elixir, the mind of awakening,

'phrog par mi 'gyur na / gzhan mu steg can gyi lta 'phrogs par ga la 'gyur / theg pa chen po'i phyir theg pa chen po la dad pa'i rkyen chung ngu zhig rnyed pas kyang myur ba dang / shas che ba dang / rgyun gyis theg pa chen po'i phyir theg pa chen po la dad pa skied do / de'i theg pa chen po'i phyir theg pa chen po la dad pa'i bag chags rjes su 'brel pa de yang tshe rabs tshe rabs su rnam par 'phel te / bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub kyi bar du 'gyur ro /.

which must be thoroughly transmuted.⁷⁷

2.13.2 [The Benefit of Engaging]

The benefit of the engaging mind is stated in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*:

Although the result of the mind that aspires for awakening is great within the cycle of existence, it is not a source of uninterrupted merit like the mind that engages.⁷⁸

And further,

From that moment on, an uninterrupted stream of merit, equal to the sky, constantly arises, even when one is asleep or distracted.⁷⁹

Regarding the benefits of both of these, one should look for the extensive meaning in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, the *Gaṇḍavyūha-sūtra*,⁸⁰ and the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* and so forth, as well as in the *sūtras*.

3 [Buddhas and bodhisattvas (D 106a1–112b3)]

3.1 [The Activities of buddhas and bodhisattvas]

Buddhas and bodhisattvas do not have any extensive activity other than delivering beings from *samsāra*. Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

The excellence of the purpose of others is accepted as the foremost result [of awakening]. Other than buddhahood itself and so forth, these other [benefits] are asserted as the result of this goal [i.e., awakening].⁸¹

⁷⁷ *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, 1.9–10:

*Bhavadācakabandhano varākaḥ sugatānāṃ suta ucyate kṣaṇena/
sanarāmaralokavandanīyo bhavati smodita eva bodhicitte /9/
aśucipratimāṃ imāṃ grhītvā jīnatnāpratiṃśatāṃ karoty anarghāṃ /
rasajātāṃ atīva vedhanīyaṃ sudrḍhaṃ grhṇata bodhicittasamjñāṃ /10/.*

⁷⁸ *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 1.17:

*bodhipranidhicittasya samsāre 'pi phalaṃ mahat /
na tv avicchinnaṃ puṇyatvaṃ yathā prasthānacetasāḥ /.*

⁷⁹ *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 1.19:

*tataḥ prabhṛti suptasya pramattasy āpy anekāśaḥ /
avicchinnaḥ puṇyadhārāḥ pravartante nabhaḥsamāḥ /.*

⁸⁰ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (607.14–15) adds this line: *de gnyis kyi phan yon ni spyod pa la 'jug pa dang / sdong po bkod pa dang /.*

⁸¹ Miyazaki, p. 36n72; *Kudrṣṭinirghātana*, k.3:

Therefore, the body of a buddha, [the interior body] of awareness (*jñāna*), qualities, and activities are completed from just effecting only that—the aim of others. [It is explained] as follows:

In other previous inexpressible [numbers of] *kalpas*, the Bhagavat, the Protector of the Śākyas, was awakened as the tathāgata, the arhat, the fully complete buddha called “Crown of Indra” (*Indraketu*), and presently will awaken again (*yang sangs rgyas pa*). Likewise, Ārya-Avalokiteśvara, in other countless kalpas, completely and fully awakened as a fully complete buddha, arhat, tathāgata called “Dharma Banner” (*Dharmadhvaṇa*). Now in Sūkhavati with the Bhagavan Amitābha from the evening til the dawn of nirvāṇa, Avalokiteśvara will become awakened.⁸²

And:

In previous *kalpas* equal to ninety-two times the [number of] sands of the Ganges river, the venerable Vajrapāṇi became awakened as the Tathāgata Lamp of Wisdom (*ye shes sgron ma*). Now, after the present fortunate *kalpa* (*bhadrakalpa*) itself, he will awaken as the Tathāgata Diamond Power (*rdo rje rtsal*).⁸³

In this regard, [there is] no beginning and no end to *samsāra*, Ārya-Maṇjuśrī also has no beginning. He is the primordial buddha (*ādibuddha*).⁸⁴ [He is] the gnostic mind of all

*parārthasampad buddhānām phalaṃ mukhyatamaṃ matam /
buddhatvādi yad anyat tu tādarthāt phalam iṣyate* / Cited in the
Ekasmṛtyupadeśa, D (3928) ki 95a6-7, see Sherburne 2000: 416–17.

⁸² Miyazaki, p.37n73, cf. *Māyopamasamādhi*, D (130) da 227a7–b2: *rigs kyi bu de ltar de bzhin gshegs pa 'od dpag med yongs su my ngan las 'das nas dam pa'i chos nub ma thag pa'i mtshan mo reng 'char ba'i dus kyi tshe byang chub sems dpa' sems pa' chen po spyan ras gzigs dbang phyug rin po che du ma'i bkod pa'i byang chub kyi shing drung du 'dug nas bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub mngon par rdzogs par 'tshang rgya'o / de mngon par rdzogs par sangs rgyas nas 'od zer kun nas 'phags pa'i dpal brtsegs rgyal po zhes bya bar 'gyur ro /*.

⁸³ Miyazaki, p. 37n74, cf. *Tathāgatācintyaguhyanirdeśa*, D (47) ka 166b4-167a1.

⁸⁴ The following lines explain how Atiśa construes Maṇjuśrī to be an Ādhibuddha, an “all-pervasive lord” who pervades all buddha families and who pervades different systems. For a similar discussion of how Maṇjuśrī appears according to the different systems of *śrāvaka*, *pāramitā*, and *tantra*

the buddhas of the three times without exception. All buddhas are grouped into six families. At the heart of the six families, Vajratikṣṇa (*rdo rje rnon po*, i.e., Mañjuśrī) and so forth dwell as *jñānasattvas*. Samantabhadra Mañjuvajra is the chief deity of the *Guhyasamājatantra*. Mañjuśrī is the foremost deity of the Yamāntaka maṇḍala⁸⁵ and Śrī-Vajrabhairava [a wrathful form of Mañjuśrī] appears as Heruka. [Mañjuśrī] is made chief maṇḍala deity of the *Abhidhana* explanatory *tantra* of *Śrī-Cakrasaṃvara*, and [he is known as] Lion Sound, Kumuda, Good Youth, Mañjuśrīkumārabhūta, and so forth. [Mañjuśrī] appears according to the aspiration of the spiritual trainee.⁸⁶ Currently, the *Mañjuśrīkṣetravyūhasūtra* teaches that he will be awakened in the eastern direction. Buddhas and bodhisattvas do not relinquish sentient beings until reaching the end of *saṃsāra*; they perform extensive activity of body, speech, and mind, the twenty-seven extensive activities, the thirty-five extensive activities,⁸⁷ the three great manifestations and so forth, continuously delivering the sentient beings of *saṃsāra* from *saṃsāra* without exhausting [their number]—because *saṃsāra* is without end. In order to clarify this meaning, Ārya-Avalokiteśvara, from his commitment to draw out sentient beings from *saṃsāra*, has the Bhagavan Amitābha dwelling at the top of his head. [This is] due to the time his head split open when perceiving the realm of sentient beings. All buddhas and bodhisattvas accept immeasurable hardships on their bodies for the purpose of all sentient beings. In this way, even Bhagavan Śākyamuni, [as shown] in the *Jātaka* tales, renounced [the world], practiced great giving, discipline, patience, energetic diligence, and concentration, and accepted immeasurable hardships on his bodies for three countless [*kalpas*], for the sake of sentient

based on the exegesis of Rong-zom-pa see Almogi 2009: 125–28, 127n307.

⁸⁵ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (608.8) reads: *dpal gshin rje' gshed kyi rgyud kyi lha'i 'khor lo mdzad pa dang /*.

⁸⁶ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (608.11) first section ends at this point and begins again at p. 793.23; see the Appendix for section headings and page numbers.

⁸⁷ At this point and in section 3.2, although the numbers are not exactly the same, Atiśa refers to the extensive activities of bodhisattvas in twenty-seven forms listed in the *Abhisamayālaṃkāra* (8.40b, *dharmakāyasya karmedaṃ saptaviṃśatidhā matam*) and in thirty-two forms (*dvatviṃśadākāraṃ bodhisattvakarma*) listed in the *Ratnagotravibhāga* (See Mathes 2008: 308ff).

beings. The *Ba tshwa chu klung mdo* (Salty River Sūtra) states:

Wives, son, kingdom, great power, flesh, blood, fat, body, and eyes I have given based on the happiness of others.⁸⁸ Anything beneficial to sentient beings is the highest worship for me. If one does harm to sentient beings, one does harm to me.⁸⁹

[This] and other statements were spoken [in] eleven stanzas.

Even recently in this Jampudvīpa [continent], the head of Ācārya Nāgārjuna was given away, Ācārya Āryadeva gave his eye, Ācārya Maṭṛceta Aśvaghōṣa gave [his] body to a tigress, and my guru, the Brahman Jetāri, died right at the time of giving his broken leg to a tigress.⁹⁰ Those [great] beings have trained in the mind of awakening that is moistened with love and compassion. The best bodhisattva produces the mind of awakening very deeply on the path of preparation (*prayogamārga*). In this way, the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* states:

On the *bhūmi* of conceptual understanding before the path of seeing, one who is firm in the roots of virtue produces the mind of awakening.⁹¹

Therefore, since bodhisattvas need to cherish others, one should train the mind of awakening by exchanging self and others. Previously, when sitting in the forest of Somapurī, I was directly taught by⁹² Lokeśvara, “Kulaputra, if desiring the goals of others, to be quickly awakened you must make effort in expanding and training the mind of awakening”; having said [this he] disappeared. Furthermore, while circumambulating at Vajrāsana (Bodhgayā),

⁸⁸ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (794.10) adds: *gang gis sems can gtse na nga la gtse pa yin /*.

⁸⁹ Miyazaki, p. 39n75; *Sattvārādhana-gāthā*, D (1125) ka 74b7–75a1: *chung ma dag dang bu dang 'byor dang rgyal srid chen po dang / sha rnams dang ni khrag dang tshil dang mig dang lus rnams kyang / gang la brtse ba'i dbang du byas nas nga yi yongs btang ba / des na de la gnod pa byas na ngag la gnod byas 'gyur /*.

⁹⁰ See Ohnuma (2007) regarding the giving away of the body in Indian Buddhist literature.

⁹¹ *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (Dutt 223): *tatrādhimukticyāvihārīnām sarvākāra-sūpacitakuśalamūlānām [samāsataḥ samyagbodhisattvacaryāniryātānām bodhisattvānām] taccittamutpadyate/*.

⁹² *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (794.21) adds: *rje btsun*.

the Venerable Tārā and the Venerable Wrathful One said, “Kulaputra,⁹³ if you desire to be awakened quickly, endeavor in the mind of awakening”. Further, when I was staying in Vajrāsana (Bodhagayā), [someone shouted] from a window, “Bhadanta, if you desire to train in the mind of awakening, you should be accustomed to love and compassion”. Also, the venerable guru⁹⁴ Ser ling pa taught, “Āyusman, you should train the mind of awakening that arises from love and compassion. If [you] do not train in that, Yogī of Bengal, [you] will not succeed”.

The mind of awakening is the root of all qualities of the great vehicle: it is the cause, it is the seed. The *Śrī-Vairocanābhisambodhi[tantra]* states:

The cause of omniscience is the mind of awakening; its root is great⁹⁵ compassion.⁹⁶

With mindfulness and mental introspection on each moment of thought, [one] should continuously generate the mind of awakening with love and compassion. As it is said in [the *Vairocanābhisambodhi*] *tantra*:

When it has degenerated, there are four qualities that are unsuitable for regaining [this mind of awakening]: giving up the mind of awakening, causing harm to sentient beings, abandoning the quality the holy dharma,⁹⁷ and stinginess.⁹⁸

Regarding this, if the mind of awakening does not degenerate, then it is possible to regain the three [other qualities]. If the [mind of awakening] degenerates, it will not be possible to

⁹³ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (794.24) adds *rigs kyi bu*.

⁹⁴ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (795.1) adds *bla ma*.

⁹⁵ “Great” is missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (795.5).

⁹⁶ *Mahāvairocanābhisambodhi*, D (494) tha 153a5: *rgyu ni byang chub kyi sems so / rtsa ba ni snying rjed chen po'o* / Cf. *Bhāvanākrama* I: *tad eta sarvajñajñānaṃ karuṇāmūlaṃ bodhicittahetukam* /.

⁹⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (795.8) adds *dam pa'i chos spong ba dang* /.

⁹⁸ Miyazaki, p.40n78: *Vairocanābhisambodhi*, D (494) tha 220a5–7: *'dus ma byas pa'i tshul khrims kyi phung po bla na med pa de bzhin gshegs pas bsngags pa la gnas te / 'dus byas kyi tshul khrims l a thabs dang shes rab kyi yongs su zin par spyod cing / ltung ba'i rtsa ba bzhi ni srogs gyi phyir yongs su nyams par mi bya'o / bzhi gang zhe na / 'di lta stel dam pa'i chos spong ba dang / byang chub kyi sems gtong ba dang / ser sna byed pa dang / sems can la gnod pa byed pa'o* /.

regain [it] even if the other three [qualities] have not degenerated. Thus, one should master the cause of arising and one should be very firm in holding, developing, purifying, and increasing it. For the extensive meaning of this one should look in the *Ārya-Maitreyāvatārasūtra*, the *Nāgārājasaraparipṛcchā*, the *Sarva-puṇyasamuccayasūtra*, the *Ākāśagarbhaparipṛcchā*, and so forth.

First, one should protect, as one protects the eyeball, the three trainings of pledged vows. The training of discipline should be protected like the tail of a yak. Having realized cause and effect, one should not waste [time] because death will definitely [come] quickly. Life within Jampudvīpa is without certainty. Now, since it is the degenerate time, there is no ability to remain for a long time.⁹⁹ One should recollect death. One [should] meditate [that] since all inner and outer phenomena are caught by the three types of impermanence,¹⁰⁰ [they] quickly and definitely will be nonexistent. One should purify with the four powers¹⁰¹ all downfalls and obscurations. Moreover, when generating the mind of awakening it is purifying,

Entering into the great vehicle, even *Śrāvakas* are turned away from harm; by generating love and compassion¹⁰² [one] loves sentient beings like a son. This purifies previously committed transgressions.

Ācārya Nāgārjuna taught this.

Purify by reciting particular *dhāraṇīs*, and confess the downfalls [listed] in the *Karmāvaraṇapratiprasrabdhī*, the *Triskandhakaśūtra*, and so forth. A *sūtra* teaches that it is purifying when one understands that downfalls and obscurations themselves are unproduced. It is imperative to view in a purifying manner when cognizing the equality of all things. Because buddhahood

⁹⁹ Miyazaki, p. 98n74, notes the five impure conditions of degenerate time (*pañcakaṣāyāḥ*): the impurity of life (*āyuh*), the impurity of view (*dṛṣṭi*), the impurity of defilements (*kleśa*), the impurity of beings (*sattva*), and the impurity of time (*kalpa*) (*Mahāvīyūtpatti*, 2335–40).

¹⁰⁰ The three types of impermanence are changeability, disintegration, and separation.

¹⁰¹ The four powers consist of the power of the support (*rten gyi stobs*), the power of antidote (*gnyen po kun spyod kyi stobs*), the power of regret (*rnam par gsum 'byin pai stobs*), the power of turning away from future faults (*nyes pa las slang ldog pa'i stobs*).

¹⁰² *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (795.20) reads *byams dang snying rje skyed pa'i sa /*.

arises from relying on sentient beings, sentient beings should be construed as foremost. The *Madhyamakatarkajvālā* states:

Those who are bound by the noose of expecting the result will search for and choose the field of giving. Others who, for the purpose of pacifying the suffering of the sick, hungry, and so forth, give while not counting the recipient will cognize the equality [of] dharma[s]. As is said in the *sūtra* in another [way]: “By one dharma a bodhisattva will quickly become fully awakened, engaging the equalizing mind to all sentient beings, and not discriminating. [If] that bodhisattva [thinks,] ‘the three jewels are the field of my good qualities but animals and so forth are not’, he will not cognize the equality of *dharmatā* (‘suchness’). With that [view], the three jewels and the guru are the good field of giving, but animals and so forth are not. Like a seed planted in a dry dusty field, that mind will not grow into the quality of a bodhisattva”. By teaching thus, the bodhisattva makes firm the superior thought. With the mental continuum moistened by compassion, [bodhisattvas] do not discriminate the field of giving”.¹⁰³

The *Tarkajvālā* teaches this.

[This is] also taught in verses that satisfy sentient beings drawn from the *Ba tshwa chu klung mdo* (*Salty River Sūtra*) by Ācārya Nāgārjuna, and taught in other sūtras of the great vehicle. As King Indrabhūti states:

With equanimity to all beings, one should generate a perfect mind.¹⁰⁴ Anybody who abides without equanimity [in regards to sentient beings] will not generate that

¹⁰³ Miyazaki, p. 42n80: *Tarkajvālā*, ad *Madhyamakahrdaya* 2.5, D (3856) dza 51a7-b3: 'bras bu la re ba'i zhags pas bcings pa'i blo gros can dag zhing 'tshol bar yang byed la / gang gzhan dag gis bkres pa la sogs pa'i sdug bsngal nye bar zhi bar bya ba tsam kho na la dmigs nas snod la mi rtog par snyoms par sbyin pa sbyin par byed pa des chos nyid mnyam par yang rtog par' gyur te / ji skad du gzhon nu chos bcig gis byang chub sems dpa' myur du bla na med pa yang dag par rdzogs pa'i byang chub mngon par rdzogs par 'tshang rgya ste / di lta ste sems can thams cad la sems myam pa nyid do zhes bya ba dang / de bzhin du gal te byang chu sems dpa' 'di snyam du de bzhin gshegs pa nib dag gi yon gnas yin gyi dud' gro ni ma yin no snyam du sems na / byang chub sems dpa' chos su mi' gyur ro zhes bya ba la sogs pa gsung pa lta bu'o /.

¹⁰⁴ Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum (796.11) reads yang dag pos ni bskyed par bya /.

wisdom that liberates in the beginning, middle, and end.¹⁰⁵

One with dull faculties, a fresh beginner—who has not trained the mind, who is not familiar with compassion, and who has little compassion—discriminates the field of giving. As extensively taught in the dharma commentaries, *sūtras*, and *tantras*, a beginner, when not in contemplation, makes sure to attain mental introspection and mindfulness in all activities on the path of preparation (*prayoga-mārga*). For even as long as a finger snap one should not reside with vulgar individuals. [One should] abandon foolish speech and give sacrificial cakes continually to hungry ghosts. One should read and recite the *prajñāpāramitā* [*sūtras*]. Until attaining supernatural knowledge (*abhijñā*), one should not teach dharma. Not relinquishing sentient beings or abiding in emptiness, one should have those qualities that have been discussed and are blessed by the Sugata. Even at the time of the dream mind one should not be separate from compassion. One should [perform] all temporal [activities] of the preparatory path as taught in the *Ārya-Ratnamegha*. Definitely one should satisfy other [beings]. With little desire and sufficient knowledge, one should be disciplined and peaceful. One should suppress the eight worldly dharmas.¹⁰⁶ One should possess and strengthen the ten virtues.¹⁰⁷ One should have little grasping or attachment to any object. One should increase the antidotes for the subsidiary defilements and [root] defilements on account of the equality of all dharmas.¹⁰⁸ When seeing others' suffering, if one is ordained, one should give away non-monastic necessities. If one is a layperson, one should give without attachment to necessities.

My body and wealth, and the virtues I have produced in the three times, should be given without attachment for the

¹⁰⁵ *Jñānasiddhi*, 8.24cd, 25d, 26ab: *saṃyak cittam utpādyam samatvaṃ sarvadehiṣu / 24cd / viśamatvaṃ yadā sthitam / 25d/ na tad utpadyae jñānam ādimadhyāntavarjitam / 26ab*.

¹⁰⁶ The eight worldly concerns (*aṣṭalokadharmā*) are gain (*lābha*), loss (*alābha*), pleasure (*sukha*), misery (*duḥkha*), praise (*praśamsā*), degradation (*nindā*), fame (*yaśa*), and infamy (*ayaśa*). *Mahāvīryūtpatti*, 2341–48.

¹⁰⁷ The ten virtues are abstaining from: killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying, plus abstention from slanderous, harsh, or frivolous speech, abstention from covetousness, malevolence and false views.

¹⁰⁸ “*chos thams cad mnyam pa nyid*” is missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (796.3).

benefit of all sentient beings.¹⁰⁹

The venerable Guru Avadhūtipa states:

With sharp eyes examining one's own faults, be like a blind man when examining the faults of others; frank and without conceit, one should always meditate on emptiness.¹¹⁰

The Guru Nāropa taught:

One should exchange self and others with direct and indirect compassion. For whatever reason, cherish sentient beings [more] than oneself.

Since the bodhisattva needs to cherish others more than him/herself, s/he should exchange self and other. The mind of awakening, compassion, and love are also essential for secret mantra [practice]. Among the fourteen root downfalls of the *Mūlāpatti* [*saṃgraha*]:

The Victorious One taught abandoning love for sentient beings as the fourth [downfall]. Abandoning the root of dharma, the mind of awakening, is the fifth [downfall].¹¹¹

One should go one hundred *yojanas* to avoid slandering others and making sinful conditions for others:

The bodhisattva who is ordained should go more than a hundred *yojanas* from any place where there is a dispute. If s/he does not go, the bodhisattva degenerates.¹¹²

One should utilize as much as one can the six perfections. One should recollect the thirteen dharmas of the path of accumulation, the seven noble treasures,¹¹³ the six recollections,¹¹⁴

¹⁰⁹ *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, k. 4ab, 5a: *ātmabhāvasya bhogānām trydhavavṛtteḥ śubhasya ca* / 4ab / *paribhogāya satvānām* / 5a /.

¹¹⁰ Cf. *Madhyamakahrdaya* 2.3: *ṛjunā hatamānena manasā tattvadarśinā / paroḣekṣaṇāndhena svadoṣāpattibhīruṇā* /. See Miyazaki, p. 44n83, Gokhale 1972: 43.

¹¹¹ *Mūlāpattisaṃgraha*, k. 3: *maitrīyagena sattveṣu caturthī kathitā jinaiḥ / bodhicittaṃ dharmamūlaṃ tasya tyāgāc ca pañcamī* /.

¹¹² This verse is missing from the *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (797.8).

¹¹³ The seven treasures of Noble beings (*ārya*) are faith (*śraddhā*), morality (*śīla*), listening (*śruta*), generosity (*tyāga*), sense of shame (*lajjin*), dread of blame (*āpatrāpya*), and insight (*prajñā*). *Mahāvīyutpatti*, 1565–72.

¹¹⁴ The six recollections (*saḍanusmṛitī*) are on the *Buddha*, *dharma*, *saṅgha*, *śīla*, *tyāga*, *devatā*. *Mahāvīyutpatti*, 1148–54.

the four means of gathering disciples, and the sixteen cognitions of the holy individual. In particular, one should recollect the eight illuminations of the bodhisattva.¹¹⁵ One should recollect the seven faults of *saṃsāra* as taught by Ārya-Nāgārjuna and the seven¹¹⁶ faults related to the impermanence of *saṃsāra* taught by Ārya-Asaṅga. One should understand and employ the antidotes for the faults of the five sense desires. Do not do anything that is not dharma. To affect the purposes of sentient beings, indirectly and directly recollect love and compassion. Think: “Alas!, I will take these [beings] out of *saṃsāra*, Alas!, what can one do for these [beings]?” One should recollect [this] again and again.

Those who desire to ascend definitely to this buddha vehicle should have an equanimous mind to all sentient beings, perceiving [them] as mother and father, and stand firm¹¹⁷ with a mind of love and beneficial thoughts. Without anger and frankly, one should speak gentle words.¹¹⁸

Thus, one should follow accordingly. If one does not quickly dedicate even a tiny virtue, [the situation] will become like the legends of Apalāla (Sog ma med) and Āṭavaka (’Broḡ gnas).¹¹⁹ In this manner, for a long time and with humility, the bodhisattva should continuously practice the teachings previously explained, even when not in contemplation, [and] at the time of meditative stabilization, should cultivate the space-like *vajra-samādhi* previously explained. When one has a little clarity towards the ultimate mind of awakening, and not does not feel one’s own body as existent,¹²⁰ one should pacify the defilements a little, and view

¹¹⁵ The eight illuminations of the bodhisattva are: (1) *smṛti*, (2) *manas*, (3) *caryā*, (4) *dharma*, (5) *jñāna*, (6) *satya* (7) *abhijñā*, and (8) *apratihatajñāna*.

¹¹⁶ *Jo bo rje’i gsung ’bum* (797.13) reads *gsum*, “three”.

¹¹⁷ *Jo bo rje’i gsung ’bum* (797.17) reads *dul bar byed* rather than *gnas par bya*.

¹¹⁸ *Ratnaguṇasaṃcayagāthā*, 16.6: *niryāyanāya ya icchati buddhajñāne samacitta sarvajagatī piṭmāṭṛsaṃjñā /hitacitta maitramana eva parākrameyyā akhilārjavo mṛdugirāya parākrameyyā /*.

¹¹⁹ The stories related to Apalāla, a nāga king, and Āṭavaka (Pali, Āṭavaka), a demon of the wilderness, take place during the Buddha’s life and involve narratives that illustrate the value of having faith and keeping one’s commitments. See Strong 1992: 26–28 concerning Apalāla. For information on Āṭavaka see Duquenne 1983: 610a–640b.

¹²⁰ *Jo bo rje’i gsung ’bum* (797.22) adds: *dbugs rgyu ba mi tshor ba dang /*.

all worldly activities and verbal conventions, all inner and outer objects, as like misty vapor (*ban bun lang long*) with subtle form. Then, a vast, pervasive, smooth, light, joyful, and blissful awareness will occur. Moreover, [it will] also produce the marks taught in the *Samcayagāthā*:

They possess knowledge that is free from perceiving multiplicity; they speak suitably.¹²¹

[One should consider] as well the remaining twenty-four lines taught [in *Samcayagāthā* chapter 17 on the qualities of a bodhisattva].

On account of the four foundations of mindfulness,¹²² the four correct exertions, the four miraculous powers,¹²³ and faith, persistence, mindfulness, absorption, and wisdom, one develops into a person who resides on the path of accumulation (*saṃbhāra-mārga*). [Known as] the beginner's ground [or as] residing on the level of faith, this [stage] produces roots of virtue (*kuśalamūla*) that is harmonious with the path of liberation (*mokṣabhāgiya*). After that, the virtuous qualities of the "preparatory analytical factors" (*nirvedhabhāgiya*) will be produced. As has been indicated, with devotion, with continuous effort for a long time, gradually [one will attain] the five faculties,¹²⁴ the five powers,¹²⁵ [the stage of] 'attained illumination' (*ālokalabdha*), and [the stage of] 'expanded illumination' (*ālokaṛddhi*). [Then, one will] enter single-pointedly into the meaning of suchness¹²⁶ (*tattvārthaikadeśānupraveśa*), attain the uninterrupted concentration (*ānantarya-samādhi*), and having become cognizant of the ultimate truth, reach the first *bhūmi*, the "very joyous". At that time, the four patientcies and the four equanimities also occur. Then, up through the tenth stage,¹²⁷

¹²¹ *Ratnaguṇasaṃcayagāthā*, 17.2 *nānātvasaṃjñāvigatā gira yuktabhāṇī*.

¹²² These consist of mindfulness with regards to body (*kāya*), feeling (*vedanā*), mind (*citta*), and things (*dharma*). *Mahāvyūtpatti*, 952–56.

¹²³ The four miraculous powers are supernormal powers related to determination (*chanda*), discernment (*mīmāṃsā*), diligence (*vīrya*), and (concentration *saṃādhi*). *Mahāvyūtpatti*, 966–70.

¹²⁴ The five faculties are faith (*śraddhā*), energy (*vīrya*), mindfulness (*smṛti*), concentration (*saṃādhi*), and insight (*prajñā*). *Mahāvyūtpatti*, 976–81.

¹²⁵ The five powers are faith (*śraddhā*), energy (*vīrya*), mindfulness (*smṛti*), concentration (*saṃādhi*), and insight (*prajñā*). *Mahāvyūtpatti*, 982–87.

¹²⁶ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (798.6) reads *de kho na nyid kyi don*.

¹²⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (798.9) *add sa bcu pa'i bar du*.

the ten complete perfections, ten powers, eight[fold] brilliance,¹²⁸ four ornaments,¹²⁹ sixteen compassions,¹³⁰ and so forth¹³¹ will be attained; the grounds are established as taught in the *Daśabhūmika sūtra*. Accordingly, there is meditative stabilization and post-meditative equipoise up through the tenth ground, as the *Ārya-Avikalpa-praveśadhāraṇī* clearly states:

The bodhisattva in meditative stabilization sees all dharmas as like the middle of the sky and when in the subsequent attainment of that, sees [things] in the manner of the eight similes of illusion.¹³²

At whatever time one realizes the highest non-conceptual

¹²⁸ The bodhisattva's eighfold brilliance (*aṣṭākāro bodhisattvābhāsaḥ*) consists of memory (*smṛti*), the intellect (*matī*), understanding (*gati*), phenomena (*dharma*), knowledge (*jñāna*), truth (*satya*), supernormal powers (*abhijñā*) and accomplishment (*pratipatti*). See Mathes (2008: 304–5); Takasaki 1966: 152.

¹²⁹ The four *alāṅkāras* of the bodhisattva are: (1) morality (*śīla*), (2) concentration (*samādhi*), (3) insight (*prajñā*), and (4) recollection (*dhāraṇī*). See Takasaki 1966: 152n88.

¹³⁰ Sixteen 'compassions' are translated by Mathes (2008: 307) from 'Gos lo-tśā-ba gzhon nu dpal's commentary to the *Ratnagotravibhāga* as compassion that: "takes the form of wishing [that sentient beings] may be free from [the following defects]: (1) various views, (2) the four errors, (3) the notion of mine, (4) the five hindrances, (5) the attachment to the objects of the six sense spheres, (6) seven[fold] pride, (7) straying from the noble path, (8) lack of independence, (9) anger, (10) being influenced by sinful friends, (11) lacking the potential of the noble ones, (12) mistaken views, (13) a view of a self caused by ignorance, (14) being seized by the executioner [in the hire] of the *skandhas*, (15) being tied in the noose of Māra, and (16) straying from the higher realms and liberation". See also Takasaki 1966: 152n88.

¹³¹ In the previous three items listed Atiśa is referring to the qualities of the sixtyfold process of purifying the buddha element (*buddhadhātōḥ ṣaṣṭyākāraviśuddhiparikarmaguṇāḥ*), as found in the *Ratnagotravibhāga-vyākhyā*; see Mathes 2008: 304, 535n1670. According to 'Gos lo-tśā-ba gzhon nu dpal, Atiśa and Nag tsho Tshul khriṃs rgyal ba translated the *Ratnagotravibhāga* before Ngog blo ldan shes rab (Mathes 2008: 162).

¹³² Cf. *Ārya-avikalpa-praveśa-nāma dhāraṇī*, P (810) nu 3b6-4a2: *byang chub sems dpa' sems dpa' chen po rnam par mi rtog pa'i dbyings la rab tu gnas pas ni shes bya dang khyad par med pa rnam par mi rtog pa'i yes shes kyis chos thams cad nam mkha'i dkyil dang mtshungs par mthong ngo / rnam par mi rtog pa'i rjes las thob pa'i shes pas ni cho thams cad sgyu ma dang / smig rgyu dang / rmi lam dang / mig yor dang / brag cha dang / gzugs brnyan dang / chu zla dang / sprul pa dang / mtshung par mthong ngo /*.

thought,¹³³ the *samādhi* like a *vajra* (*vajropāmasamādhi*), one does not have subsequent attainment. Transforming into the sphere of dharma (*dharmadhātu*) one directly realizes the *dharmakāya*. Because of dwelling in the *dharmakāya*, apprehending [reality] from that time as long as space endures, one does not possess subsequent attainment.

Whoever sees me as visible matter, whoever understands me as sound, has entered into a wrong path; that person will not see me. The buddhas are the *dharmakāya*; the 'leaders' see reality (*dharmatā*).¹³⁴

The *Śrī-Vajramālātantra* states:

All enters into the consciousness aggregate, and even that consciousness is said to be clear light, passing beyond sorrow, totally empty, and the *dharmakāya*.¹³⁵

The *Ārya-Dharmasaṅgīti* states:

The actual buddha is unproduced.

And also the *Ārya-Lokottaraparivarta* states:

The buddhas are the *dharmakāya*, completely pure like space.¹³⁶

The teaching of Dignāga states:

The perfection of wisdom, non-dual: that gnosis is the Tathāgata.¹³⁷

Also, Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] himself states:

Immaculate like space, whose nature is unchanging and

¹³³ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (798.15) reads *rnam par mi rtog pa mthar phyin pa*.

¹³⁴ The *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (798.19) reads the last line as *'dren pa rnam ni chos nyid gzigs /*. For a discussion on these verses see Almogi 2009: 252n46. Cf *Vajracchedikā*, 26, k.1–2ab: *yo māṃ rūpeṇa cādrākṣur yo māṃ ghoṣeṇa cānvaguḥ / mithyāprahāṇapravṛtā na māṃ drakṣanti te janāḥ / 1 / dharmato buddho draṣṭavyo dharmakāyā hi nāyakāḥ /*.

¹³⁵ Miyazaki, p. 47n91: "Not identified in the *Vajramālā*, but cf *Piṇḍikṛtasādhana*, k. 43cd, 44ab: *viññānaskandham āyāti viññānaṃ ca prabhāsvaraṃ / sanirvāṇaṃ sarvaśūnyaṃ ca dharmakāyaś ca gadyate!*".

¹³⁶ Miyazaki, p. 47n93: "Not found in the *Lokottara-parivarta*. Cf. *Buddhāvataṃsaka*, D (44) ka 81b5: *yang dag sang rgyas chos kyi sku / rnam dag nam mkha' 'dra ba ste /*".

¹³⁷ *Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārtha*, k. 1ab: *prajñāpāramitā jñānaṃ advayaṃ sātathāgataḥ /*.

without elaboration, one who sees you (i.e., *prajñāpāramitā*) sees the Tathāgata. Between you who have complete good qualities and the Buddha, the teacher of the world, wise ones see no difference, as with the moon and the light of the moon.¹³⁸

The same Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] also states:

Not remaining in any phenomena,¹³⁹ becoming the reality of the *dharmadhātu*—homage to you, the profound that is the realization of supreme profundity.¹⁴⁰

Further:

Therefore, there is really no difference between the buddhas and the *dharmadhātu*.¹⁴¹

Again:

Through the nature of non-arising, you do not arise. The Protector does not possess coming and going. Homage to you devoid of an own-being “essence”.¹⁴²

Further:

Buddhas in all times dwell in the *dharmatā* like this.

There are many teachings like this [but] I will set this aside for the time being. The Venerable Āryadeva states:

Here, this reality is essenceless like a lotus born from a sky-forest. [Arising] from both, from self, or from others is also like a rabbit horn. What aspect of liberation [inherently] exists?

¹³⁸ *Prajñāpāramitāstotra*, k. 2–3:

*Ākāśam iva nirlepāṃ niṣprapañcāṃ nirakṣarām /
yas tvāṃ paśyati bhāvena sa paśyati tathāgatam /2/
tava cāryaguṇādhyāyā buddhasya ca jagadguroḥ /
na paśyanty antaram santaś candracandrikayor iva /3/*

¹³⁹ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (799.3) reads *chos rnams kun la mi ngas pa* rather than *dge chos kun la mi gnas par*.

¹⁴⁰ *Paramārthastava*, k.8:

*asthitaḥ sarvadharmeṣu dharmadhātugatiṃ gataḥ /
parāṃ gaṃbhīratāṃ prāpto gaṃbhīrāya namo 'stu te /*

¹⁴¹ *Acintyastava*, k. 42ab: *buddhānāṃ sattvadhātoś ca tenābhinnatvam arthataḥ /*

¹⁴² *Paramārthastava*, k. 3:

*anutpannasvabhāvena utpādas te na vidyate /
na gatir nāgatir nāthāsvabhāvāya namo 'stu te /*

Also, the *Vajrajñānasamuccaya* states:

Even the buddhas—even when they are not affecting the purposes of others—reside pacifying all elaboration while abiding in the limits of purity.¹⁴³

Also, Ācārya Asaṅga states accordingly:

At the time when all sentient beings have become fully and completely awakened, they will become the *dharmakāya*; all will be buddhas without exception, and having become the purity aspect itself of the *dharmadhātu*, they will remain in suchness.

Thus it is said in the *Viniścayasamgrahaṇī*.

This Ācārya does not even accept non-dual gnosis in the ultimate [sense], nor does he accept the attainment subsequent to non-conceptual gnosis; because he attained the sovereignty of the third ground, he realized that all things are unproduced.¹⁴⁴ Intending this point, the *Vajramālātantra* states:

This is the ultimate truth, without appearance and without signs; it is also called the ultimate truth, the dwelling place of all buddhas.¹⁴⁵

Ācārya Candrakīrti states:

The [status of] buddha is proclaimed when the mind resides in the unproduced, the *dharmatā*.¹⁴⁶

¹⁴³ Miyazaki, p. 49n101, *Vajrajñānasamuccaya*, D (447) ca 286a2: *ji srid du zhi ba la sogs pa'i las kyis sems can gyi don mi byed pa de srid du yang dag pa'i mtha' la rab tu gnas par 'gyur ro* /.

¹⁴⁴ Atiśa is claiming that Asaṅga asserts that on the absolute level gnosis does not exist at the stage of a buddha. This claim relates to the controversy surrounding the existence of gnosis at the stage of a buddha between the various adherents of Yogācāra and Madhyamaka philosophical systems. See the chapter section in Almogi (2009: 142–59) on “the mental element of the absolute and Yogācāra theories of knowledge”.

¹⁴⁵ Miyazaki, p. 50n103: “Not in the *Vajramālā*. But cf. *Piṇḍikṛtasādhana*, k. 45: *paramārthamaṇḍalam hy etan nirābhāsam alakṣaṇam* / *paramārthasatyanāmāpi sarvatathāgatālayaḥ* /.

¹⁴⁶ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (799.19) reads *chos nyid skye med nyid la ni / thugs gnas sang rgyas yin par gsungs*, whereas the canonical (Miyazaki 2007: 50) reads *chos nyid skye ba med pa ni / thub gnas sangs rgyas yin par gsung* /. Cf. *Triśaraṇasaptati*, k. 22ab: *chos rnam dngos med nyid la ni / blo gnas sangs rgyas yin par bshad* /. See Sorenson 1986: 28.

3.2 [Objections against Mādhyamikas]

[Objection:] Because of great attachment to objects from beginningless time, those who do not understand the nature of the two truths say, “If things are as you Mādhyamikas say, then the buddhas, when bodhisattvas, underwent many countless aeons of immeasurable hardships and accumulated an immeasurable store of merit for no reason, and the dharma and the saṅgha become nothing at all. Since there will not be [any] sentient beings liberated from *saṃsāra*, one should place this evil view at a great distance. This [Mādhyamika view] is hail-stones for crops of virtuous qualities; this [view] is worse than [that of] nihilist outsiders. It is appropriate to abandon and clear away a view such as this”.

Mādhyamika reply: “You whose minds are untrained and foolish, who denigrate the teachings of Ārya-Nāgārjuna—who is prophesized again and again in the *Mahāmegha*, *Laṅkāvatāra*, *Mahābherihārakaparivarta*, and the *Mahāmañjuśrīmūlatantra*—are causing self-defeat. The texts that are accepted by him state that the buddhas become *dharmakāya*, and since even the gnosis of the [buddha], through the abandonment of all conceptual thought, becomes the *dharmadhātu*, the sphere and gnosis are without object and subject, so how can non-conceptual wisdom exist”?

Ācārya Nāgārjuna states:

If that which has passed does not exist, then the future does not exist, and because the present shifts from place [to] place, where is the presently arisen?¹⁴⁷

And:

Whether in meditation or not in meditation, all things lack [true] existence. Being free of things and non-things is taught by the teacher as [entering into a state of] unity.¹⁴⁸

According to this teaching, non-conceptual wisdom is not accepted. At the time [of awakening] non-conceptual wisdom does not exist because all elaborations without exception have been

¹⁴⁷ Cf. *Bodhicittavivarāṇa*, k. 31: ‘das pa gang yin de ni med / ma ‘ongs pa ni thob pa min / gnas phyir gnas ni yongs gyur pa / da lta ba la ga la yod /.

¹⁴⁸ Cf. *Pañcakrama*, 5.16abd, 15c:
yuganaddham vadech chāstā [svāpabodhavivarjitaṃ] / 15 /
samādhānāsamādhānam yasya nāsty eva sarvathā /
[yuganaddhe sthito yogī] bhāvābhāvavivarjitaḥ / 16/

pacified—what kind of subsequent attainment wisdom will there be? There is not. The *Laṅkāvatārasūtra* states:

If error appears, even after all errors have been eliminated,
that is the real error, as for one who has not been purified of
diseased vision (*rab rib, timira*).¹⁴⁹

With respect to this, there are three types of diseased vision: (1) the diseased vision of the unskillful, (2) the diseased vision of the skillful, (3) and the completely purified diseased vision of the skillful. Since buddhas are purified [of] diseased vision, diseased vision will not appear again. Well, then, do buddhas have a body, gnosis, virtuous qualities, and extensive activities, or not? On account of one condition and three causes [these] appear according to the perspective of the disciple; the body variously appears according to the categories of disciples. Furthermore, gnosis is great self-arisen gnosis (*rang 'byung gi ye shes, svayaṃbhūjñāna*). Guru Avadhūtipa and Guru Tāmradvīpa both teach:

There is no difference between gnosis and the
dharmadhātu: the *dharmadhātu* is labeled self-arisen
gnosis, without thought and free from the elaboration of
words; that gnosis itself is said to have five aspects from
the perspective of those to be trained.¹⁵⁰

Ācārya Nāgārjuna has taught this as well.

Likewise, the ten powers and so forth, the three miraculous activities, the twenty-five extensive activities, and the thirty-two

¹⁴⁹ See Almogi 2009: 300n6 for a discussion of this verse. *Timira* (*rab rib*) means literally 'darkness,' and may refer to the darkness of the eyes or a certain type of eye disease. The version here differs slightly from the canonical. Cf. *Laṅkāvatāra*, 2.166, 167:

āryo na paśyati bhrāntiṃ nāpi tattvaṃ tadantare /
bhrāntir eva bhavet tattvaṃ yasmāt tattvaṃ tadantre / 166 /
bhrāntiṃ vidhūya sarvāṃ hi nimittaṃ jāyate yadi /
saiva tasya bhaved bhrāntir aśuddhaṃ timiraṃ yathā / 167 /.

¹⁵⁰ This terse citation implies that the *dharmadhātu* is equated with *svayaṃbhūjñāna* ('self-arisen gnosis') and is undivided in reality but has five aspects that appear according to the purview of the person to be trained (*vineya, gdul bya*). The five aspects of the *dharmadhātu* that appear follow a schemata of five gnoses: (1) the mirror-like gnosis (*samatājñāna*), (2) the gnosis of equality (*samatājñāna*), (3) discerning gnosis (*pratyaवेक्षणा-jñāna*), (4) the gnosis of performing activities (*krtyānuṣṭhānājñāna*), and (5) the gnosis [that equates to] the *dharmadhātu* (*dharmadhātujñāna*). On the multiple gnoses of a buddha see Almogi 2009: 114–18.

extensive activities appear to the mind of the trainee. In regards to that, it is as taught by Ācārya [Nāgārjuna]:

O Protector, you possess neither thought nor mental creation nor movement; [nevertheless,] in this world you fulfill a buddha's activity for sentient beings without any effort.¹⁵¹

Again:

You completely fulfill the wishes of all sentient beings like a wish-fulfilling tree unmoved by the fierce winds of conceptual thought.¹⁵²

Again:

O Protector, your perception of sentient beings does not at all occur, but you send out beneficial compassion for beings tormented by suffering.¹⁵³

Again:

The excellence of the purpose of others is accepted as the foremost result [of awakening]. Other than buddhahood itself and so forth, these other [benefits] are asserted as the result of this goal [awakening].¹⁵⁴

Furthermore, Ācārya Āryadeva states:

In many innumerable kalpas [one] always makes effort only for the purpose of others. Finally, when attaining the *dharmakāya*, for the purpose of effecting the goals of others, one does not pass beyond suffering as long as beings abide. For this reason, the bodhisattva does not do [that] which is not [for] the purpose of others. The effort [to

¹⁵¹ *Nirāupamyastava*, k. 24: *na te 'sti manyanā nātha na vikalpo na ceñjanā / anābhogena te loke buddhakṛtyaṃ pravartate /*. Miyazaki, p. 53n109, *Kuḍṛṣṭinirghātana*, k. 2: *na te 'sti manyanā nātha na vikalpo na veñjanā / anābhogena te loke buddhakṛtyaṃ pravartate /*.

¹⁵² Miyazaki, p. 53n110, *Kuḍṛṣṭinirghātana*, k. 4: *cintāmaṇir ivākampyaḥ sarvasaṃkalpavāyubhiḥ / tathāpi sarvasattvānām aśeṣāśāprapūrakaḥ /* Cited in the *Madhyamakaraṇtapradīpa* (D (3854) tsha 286b1) as well.

¹⁵³ *Nirāupamyastava*, k. 9:
sattvasaṃjñā ca te nātha sarvathā na pravartate /
duḥkhārteṣu ca sattveṣu tvam atīva kṛpātmakaḥ /

¹⁵⁴ Miyazaki, p. 54n112; *Kuḍṛṣṭinirghātana*, k. 3: *parārthasaṃpad buddhānām phalaṃ mukhyatamaṃ matam / buddhatvādi yad anyat tu tādarthyaṭ phalaṃ iṣyate /*.

fulfill] merely their own aims is carried out by the five types of migrators. When the supreme individual practices for the purposes of others, always being compassionate, they are like joyful parents of migrators.

Establishing the aspects of the three bodies: Ācārya Nāgārjuna established this teaching in other [texts]. Accordingly, from the blessings of the *dharmakāya*, on account of one condition and three causes, the form body [appears] and teaches the profound and vast dharma. The extensive activity of the *kāya*[s] occurs until the end of saṃsāra. Having intended this meaning, a tantra states:

Just as multiple distinctions occur due to the many aspirations and different inclinations of sentient beings, likewise, a reflection of the moon appears in many vessels of water at one time.

Further, Venerable Āryadeva indicates:

In an arrangement of vessels of copper, *vaidurya*, precious stones, gems, and coral, the one moon in the middle of the sky becomes transformed to appear different in each one. Likewise, the *vajra* mind of the protector himself abides variously permeating the mass of beings.

For those with weak faculties and little merit there is no appearance of the body. As the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra* states:

Just as the reflection of the moon does not appear in a broken vessel, likewise the buddha's reflection does not appear to evil beings.¹⁵⁵

Likewise, the speech [of the Buddha] occurs in relation to the vessel of the trainee:

...the buddhas teach the dharma in accord with disciples' aspirations. For some [they] teach the dharma that turns away from sin. To some [they] teach the dharma in which both cause and effect are never wasted. To some [they] teach the dharma that classifies [things] into the two truths. To those who are apprehensive about the profound [they] teach the essence of emptiness and compassion; in this way

¹⁵⁵ *Mahāyānasūtrālaṃkāra*, 9.16: *yathodabhājane bhinne candrabimbaṃ na dṛśyate /tatha duṣṭeṣu sattveṣu buddhabimbaṃ na dṛśyate* / Thurman et al. 2004: 80.

[they] teach dharma according to aspiration.¹⁵⁶

Ācārya Nāgārjuna taught this. Further, [the teachings of buddhas] do not appear to the impure vessel. When requested by Brahmā [the Buddha said]:

I have found a dharma like ambrosia,¹⁵⁷ unconditioned, nectar-like, separated from attachment, profound. No one to whom I show it will comprehend, so [staying] alone by myself, I will meditate in the forest.¹⁵⁸

Ācārya Nāgārjuna also stated:

Why does the profound dharma not appear to beings who are not [proper] vessels? Due to the fact that the wise are those who understand that the Buddha is omniscient.¹⁵⁹

Thus was this meaning taught in the *Ārya-Tathāgata* *acintyaguhyā* *[nirdeśa]*.

Therefore, the Madhyamaka followers of Ārya-Nāgārjuna have no faults whatsoever. Those sentient beings who denigrate these teachings, who abandon the profound and extensive dharma, will experience the sufferings of hell for a long time.

4 [Previous Buddhist Masters (D 112b3–113a4)]

Make [an effort to understand] each one of the previous teachers.

¹⁵⁶ Atiśa's version of these verses differs from that found in the Tanjur. Cf. *Ratnāvalī*, 4.94cd, 95, 96:

*buddho 'vadat tathā dharmam vineyānām yathākṣamam / 94 /
keṣāñcid avadad dharmam pāpebhyo vinivṛttaye /
keṣāñcit puṇyasiddhyartham keṣāñcid dvayānīśritam /
dvayānīśritam ekeṣām gambhīram bhīrubhīṣaṇam /
śūnyatākaruṇāgarbham ekeṣām bodhisādhanam / 96 /*

For the English of the Tanjur version see Dunne and McClintock 1997: 71.

¹⁵⁷ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (801.22) is missing this line of the verse.

¹⁵⁸ Cf. *Lalitavistara*, 25.1: *gambhīra śānto virajāḥ prabhāsvaraḥ prāpto mi dharmo hy amṛto 'saṃskṛtaḥ / deśeya cāham na parasya jāne yan nūna tūṣṇī pavane vaseyam /*.

¹⁵⁹ Atiśa's version of these verses differs from that found in the Tanjur. Cf. *Ratnāvalī*, 1.74:

*sarvajña iti sarvajño buddhais tenaiva gamyate /
yenaitad dharmagāmbhīryam novācābhājanam /*

For the English of the Tanjur version see Dunne and McClintock 1997: 20.

4.1 [Logic]

Ācārya Dignāga and Dharmakīrti wrote extensive texts on logic.

4.2 [Vaibhāṣika]

Ācārya Dharmatrāta, Ācārya Buddhadeva, Vasumitra, Ghosaka, Yid 'ong, and so forth provided the extensive transmission of the śrāvaka Vaibhāṣika.

4.3 [Sautrāntika]

Ācārya Śubhagupta, Dharmottara, the earlier Vasubhandu, and so forth wrote extensive texts on the śrāvaka Sautrāntika.

4.4 [Yogācāra]

Ācārya Asaṅga, [the later] Vasubandhu, Sthiramati, Prajñākaragupta, Kāliṅga, Devendrabuddhi, Upāsaka Bhadanta Asvabhāva, and so forth wrote extensive texts on the Sākāra (*rnam bcas*) and Nirākāra (*rnam med*) [Yogācāra].

4.5 [Madhyamaka]

Ācārya Bhāvaviveka, Buddhapālita, Devaśarma, Avalokitavratā, Śāntarakṣita, Kamalaśīla, and so forth wrote extensive texts on the Madhyamaka.

4.6 [Mādhyamikas who practiced extensive deeds]

Ācārya Candragomin, Ācārya śura, Sāgaramegha, Ācārya Śāntideva, Ācārya Luntaka, and so forth, wrote extensive texts for the sake of beginners on the great vast activities of practice, like the four immeasurables, four means of gathering disciples, six¹⁶⁰ perfections, and so forth, starting with the mind of awakening.

4.7 [The Foundations of Madhyamaka]

Ācārya Nāgārjuna, Ācārya Āryadeva, Ācārya Mātṛceṭa, Ācārya Kambala, Ācārya Candrakīrti— the Madhyamaka texts written by these five *Ācāryas* are the foundation of all Madhyamaka texts. Since they are the root of all Madhyamaka texts, they are incomparable.

4.8 [Caryā Tantra and the Yoga Tantra]

Accordingly, for the texts of secret *mantra* oral precepts, Ācārya Buddhaguhya, Ācārya Śākyamitra, Ācārya Prajñāsiddha, Ācārya Ānandagarbha, and so forth clarified the meaning of the

¹⁶⁰ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (802.14) adds *drug rnams*.

Caryā Tantra and the Yoga Tantra.

4.9 [Guhyasamājatantra]

Ācārya Indrabhūti, Ācārya Buddhajñānapāda, and so forth solely clarified the meaning of the *Guhyasamājatantra*.

4.10 [Śrī-Cakrasaṃvaratantra]

Ācārya Caryāpāda, Ācārya Vajraghaṇṭā, Ācārya Lūyīpāda, and so forth clarified the meaning of the *Śrī-Cakrasaṃvaratantra*.

4.11 [Śrī-Hevajratantra]

Ācārya Dombhīheruka, Sararūpa, and so forth clarified the meaning of the *Śrī-Hevajratantra*.

4.12 [Śrī-Mahāmāyāt看tra]

Ācārya Kukuripāda, Dharmapāda, and so forth clarified the meaning of the *Śrī-Mahāmāyā*.

5 [The teachings of Nāgārjuna (D 113a4–113b6)]

5.1 [A classification of his teachings]

The teaching of Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] is most kind to all beings.

5.1.1 [Ordinary people]

In order to especially benefit ordinary people [he] wrote [texts on] calculation and divination.

5.1.2 [Ministers]

In order to benefit ministers [he] wrote the *Prajñāśataka*, the *Brtag pa gnyis pa* (*Twelve Examinations*), and so forth.

5.1.3 [Kings]

For the [benefit] of kings he wrote the *Suhrllekha* and the *Ratnāvalī*.

5.1.4 [The less fortunate]

For the [benefit] of the less fortunate, belonging to the retinue of four vow-holders (*'khor rnam bzhi*), [he] wrote the great [*Dhūpayogaratnamālā*] and lesser [*Aṣṭāpadikṛtadhūpayoga*] texts on incense preparation (*spos sbyor*).

5.1.5 [Doctors]

For the benefit of doctors he wrote the *Yogaśataka*, the *Sbyor ba sum cu rtsa gnyis pa dang nyis shu pa* (*Twenty and*

Thirty-two Practices), the *Bdud rtsi'i snying thigs* (*Essential Drop of Nectar*), the *Jīvasūtra*, and so forth.

5.1.6 [For those entering the Mahāyāna]

For the sake of those entering the Mahāyāna, [he] wrote the *Bodhicittotpādaavidhi*, the *Byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa gsal ba* (*Illuminating the Practice of the Bodhisattva*), the *Sūtrasamuccaya*, and so forth.

5.1.7 [The foremost of texts]

Furthermore, the foremost of those¹⁶¹ is the *Prajñāmūlamadhyamakakārikā*, and then the *Vigrahavyāvartanī* and the *Śūnyatāsaptati*.

5.1.8 [Ancillary Texts]

The ancillaries to the [foremost texts] are the *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā*, *Mahāyānaviṃśaka*, *Bhavasamkrānti*, *Bhāvanākrama*, *Vaidalya-prakarāṇa*, *Akṣaraśataka*, *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, *Dharmadhātustava*, *Paramārthastava*,¹⁶² *Rnam par mi rtog par bstod pa* (*Praise to the Non-Conceptual*), *Acintyastava*, *Lokātītastava*,¹⁶³ *Cittavajrastava*, *Āryaśālistambakamahāyāna-sūtraṭīkā*, and the *Pratītyasamutpāda-hṛdayakārikā* along with its *Vyākhyāna*.

5.1.9 [Secret Mantra Texts]

Likewise, for the sharpest of those with sharp faculties, the vessels of the secret mantra great vehicle, he wrote, [to clarify] the meaning of the *Śrī-Guhyasamājatantra*, the *Śrī-Guhyasamāja-maṇḍalavidhi*, the *Cho ga nyi shu pa* (*Twenty Rituals*), the *Pinḍikṛtasādhana*, the [Śrī-Guhyasamāja-mahāyogotpattikrama-sādhana] *sūtramelāpaka*, the *Śrī-Pañcakrama*, and the *Śrī-Vajrāsanacatvumahātantraṭīkā*. [He] wrote the *Commentary of the Pure Complete Exhortation* [*Nāmasaṅgīti*], the venerable *Khasarpanasādhana*, the *Yi ge drug pa* (*Six Letters*), the *Arapacana*, the *Vāgīśvara*, and many *sādhana*s, like the *Tshig sbyin gzhon nu* (*Youthful Verses*) and so forth. [He] wrote the *Trisamayavyūha*, the *Siddhaikavīra*, the *Kalyāṇakāmadhenu-vivaraṇa*, the *Gtor ma sum cu pa* (*Thirty Verses of the Sacrificial Cake Ritual*), the *Sangs rgyas mnyam sbyor gyi rdzogs pa'i rim*

¹⁶¹ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (803.8) states: *yang de dag gi thad du*.

¹⁶² Missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (803.11).

¹⁶³ Missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (803.12).

pa'i man ngag chen po (Great Special Instruction of the Completion Stages of Buddhasamayoga), and so forth.

5.2 [Nāgārjuna's predicted buddhahood (D 113b6–115b2)]

Since that supreme individual [Nāgārjuna] is an actual buddha, one should trust the texts written by him. Why is that? From the *Mahāmeghasūtra*:

Devaputras! Innumerable previous kalpas ago, at the time when the Tathāgata Klu rigs sgron ma (Nāgagotrādīpa) appeared in the world, the young Licchavi, Sarsvasattvapriyadarśana, was the *cakravartin* King “Holding the Teaching of the Great Effort”, his queen was called “Upholding Dharma”, and his minister was called “Upholding the Storehouse of Wonderful Dharma”. At that time, the king and minister debated whether relics [of the Buddha] exist or not. The retinue was amazed with the eloquent explanation of the king and they declared to the Bhagavan, “The king understands something profound”. Then the Bhagavan extensively explained the qualities of the king.¹⁶⁴

One should look in the sūtra. [Further:]

Then, the king along with the retinue, having scattered a handful of jewels, supplicated the Buddha and made vows: “In the future, close to the disappearance of the teaching of Buddha Śākyamuni, at that time, I will become ordained. When the dharma is at its end, I will proclaim three times with a great voice, only wearing religious garments, only having shaved hair: ‘May I leave the country, may the holy dharma arise, may I give up my life for the purpose of the holy dharma’”; thus [he] prayed. After that, the minister and queen also made a vow.¹⁶⁵

¹⁶⁴ This summary is also found in the *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa*, D (3854) tsha 286b6–287a2: *de bzhin du 'phags pa sbrin chen po'i mdo las kyang / ji skad du / lha'i bu dag bskal pa brjod du med pa'i ngon du de bzhin gshegs pa klu rigs sgron ma'i chos kyi rgyal po'i brtson 'grus chen po'i klu yum bstan pa 'dzin pa / blon po dam pa'i chos kyi mdzod 'dzin pa / rgyal po dang blon po gnyis sang rgyas kyi ring bsrel gyi gtam byas shing / rgyal pos legs par bshad pas dus der 'khor thams cad ngo mtshar skyes nas bcom ldan 'das la zhus pa / rgyal po 'di zab mo la mkhas pa'o zhes zhus pas / bcom ldan 'das kyi rgyal po'i yon tan rgyas par gsung te /*.

¹⁶⁵ Miyazaki, p. 61n120 notes that this is a summary of *Mahāmegha*, D (232)

Devaputras! After many hundred of years have passed since my death, at that time will appear in the southern area a king called Sukhacaryabhadra. At that time, in one hundred years, when even more of the remains of the holy dharma are disappearing, a disciple of mine will appear, the holy dharma will be brought out, issue forth, and reappear, and the wheel of the holy dharma will be turned. The Mahāyāna will be extensively taught to others”.¹⁶⁶

Further:

Listen to the prophecy of this bhikṣu; he is very pleasing to me. Making my teaching widespread, carrying a great burden, he is a young [member] of my Śākya [clan]. After passing away in the south, in a provincial land called “Drang srong byi (Rṣyākhu)”, he will be born in the great northern city called “Possessing Merit”. [He will be born in] a pure great lineage [known as] Bhra go can that is a lineage of Śākyas. In order to extend my dharma, the youthful Licchavi, Sarsvasattvapriyadarśana, the bodhisattva, this supreme human, will be born in a king's lineage, a great lineage. All his relations will make his name renowned. Then, when he has been ordained, his retinue will protect the teaching by giving up [their] lives for the sake of the holy dharma.¹⁶⁷

wa 180–181b1. This summary is also found in the *Madhyamakaratna-pradīpa*, D (3854) tsha 287a2-4.

¹⁶⁶ Miyazaki, p.61n121, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 187a5–7: *bcom ldan 'das kyis stsal pa / lha'i bu dag nga 'das pa'i 'og lo brgya phrag mang po 'das pa na lho phyog kyi rgyud du mkhar gyi rgyal po bde spyod zhes bya ba 'byung bar 'gyur te / de'i tshe lo brgyad cu na dam pa'i chos nub par 'gyur ba'i lhag ma tsam du lus pa'i dus la bab pa de'i tshe nga'i nyan thos 'byung bar 'gyur te / dam pa'i chos kyang 'byin par 'gyur / chos kyi 'khor lo yang bskor bar 'gyur / theg pa chen po yang gzhan dag la rgyas par 'chad par 'gyur ro* / This summary is also found in the *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa*, D (3854) tsha 287a4–5.

¹⁶⁷ Miyazaki, p. 62n122, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 187b5–188a3: *bcom ldan 'das kyi bka' stsal pa/ mthong na dga' ba dri za'i rgyal po dge slong de lung bstan pa nyon cig / de ni nga la dpen pa dang / nga'i bstan pa 'byung bar byed cing khur chen po khyer ba dang / nga'i śākya gzhon nu yin te / mthong na dga' ba dri za'i rgyal po nga 'das pa'i 'og tu lho phyogs kyi rgyud du drang srong byi bo zhes bya ba'i yul 'khor du bsod nams ldan gyi grong khyer bye ma chen po zhes byas ba 'byung ste / grong de'i 'bab chu mdzes 'byor ces bya ba de'i byang phyog kyi 'gram du 'byung bar 'gyur ro /*

After that, [the *sūtra*] later states:

[A] small [number] will be devoted to his texts but most will not. Those possessing four qualities will trust and be devoted to his teaching. (1) [They] will be pleased and hear teachings of previous buddhas, (2) [they] will be upheld by the spiritual friend, (3) [they will] stabilize the roots of virtue through relying on the superior thought, and (4) [they will] be devoted to performing extensive deeds publicly with their bodies¹⁶⁸. All those who do not trust and rejoice in his [teaching] have the ignorance that is blessed by Māra. Those who trust and rejoice in his [teaching] are those who embrace the Buddha's mind.¹⁶⁹

*der rje'u rigs chen po rnam par dag pa 'bra go can zhes bya ba'i sa'i phyogs su 'byung bar 'gyur te / śākya'i rigs gzhon nu lid tsa byi'i bu gzhon nu 'jig rten thams cad kyis mthong na dga' ba de nga'I chos 'byung bar bya ba'i phyir lid tsa byi'i bu 'jig rten thams cad kyis mthong na dga' ba byang chub sems dpa'i mi mchog de der rigs chen por skye bar 'gyur te / de'i pha ma dang / gnyen sde rnams kyis nga'i ming de'i ming du 'dog par 'gyur ro / 'Bra go can gyi rje'u rigs chen po'i rigs kyang de bzhin gshegs pa'i rigs yin par blta'o / de'i tshe drang srong byi bo'i yul 'khor yang 'byor cing rgyas las skyes bo mang pos gang bar 'gyur ro / de bzhin gshegs pa dang ming 'thun pa'i khye'u de yang skye bo thams cad kyi snying du sdug par 'gyur zhing skye bo mang pot hams cad kyi bkur bar 'gyur ro / gang gi tshe khye'u de rab tu byung ban a tshang pa mtshungs par spyod pa'i 'khor dang / dge slong gi tshogs rnams khrid de / rang gi srog dang bsdos nas dam pa'i chos stong cing / de bzhin gshegs pa'i spyod pa 'byung bar byed de / mchog tu dga' ba spyod par 'gyur ro / A summary is also found in the *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa*, D (3854) tsha 287a5-b2.*

¹⁶⁸ Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum (804.21) add lus kyis mngon sum du byas pa'o /

¹⁶⁹ Miyazaki, p. 62n123, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 188b2-6: *dge bsnyen gyi sde tshan dang / dge bsnyen ma'i sde tshan de dag ni sang rgyas 'byung dang phrad par 'gyur / dam pa'i chos la yang nan tan du sgrub par 'gyur mod kyi / 'on kyang mthong na dga' ba dri za'i rgyal po nga'i nyan thos kyi tshig la yid ches pa'i sems cand de dag ni nyung ste / shin tu phal cher ni mos par mi 'gyur ro / mthong na dga' ba dri za'i rgyal po rnam pa bzhi dag ldan na nga'i nyan thos de bzhin gshegs pa dang ming 'thun pa'i dge slong gi tshig la yid ches par 'gyur te / bzhi gang zhe na / sngon gyi mthar yang yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas snga ma rnams las zab mo brtan pa'i chu'i rgya mtsho'i dus tshod kyi ting nge 'dzin 'di thos pa dang / dge ba'i bshes gnyen gyis yongs su bzung ba dang / lhag pa'i bsam pa la zhugs shing dge ba'i rtsa ban ye bar brtan pa dang / rgya chen po la mos pa lus kyis mngon sum du byas pa ste / mthong na dga' ba dri za'i rgyal po rnam pa bzhi pa de dag gis ni nga'i nyan thos kyi tshig la yid ches par 'gyur ro / gang dag yid mi ches pa de dag thams cad nib dud kyis byin gyis brlabs pa'i mi gti mug can yin par rig par bya'o / sems can gang dag mos par 'gyur ba*

When venerating him, one is venerating to all the buddhas of the three times. If listening to his spoken word, one is listening to the spoken word of all buddhas of the three times.¹⁷⁰

Further, after him:

At the time of his death, my holy dharma will disappear. Without an individual like that, the [holy dharma] will become entirely nonexistent.¹⁷¹

Also, there will be many teachings following him:

Those who write extensive texts about him and who uphold his teaching will, when awakened, be the foremost [of the Buddha's] retinue. After this good aeon, a buddha will not appear for sixty-two aeons. Then, after that, seven buddhas will appear.¹⁷² Subsequent to that, in a world realm called 'Vivid Clear Light', a tathāgata, arhat, fully awakened buddha called Jñānabhavaprabhā will be fully and completely awakened.¹⁷³

This is taught in many texts. Here I have written just a little bit [of the whole prediction].

de dag ni sangs rgyas mang pos yongs su bzung ba yin par rig par bya'o /.
A summary is also found in the *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa*, D (3854) tsha 287b2-b4.

¹⁷⁰ Miyazaki, p. 62n124, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 189b4-5: *dge slong de la sems can gang dag gis bsnyen bskur byas pa de dag gis ni 'das pa dang / ma byon pa dang / da ltar byung ba'i de bzhin gshegs pa thams cad la bskal pa grangs med par bsnyen bkur byas pa yin no /.*

¹⁷¹ Miyazaki, p. 63n125, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 190a6: *de ni mtha' mar 'byung bar 'gyur la / de dang 'dra ba'i sems can gzhan med de mi srid /.*

¹⁷² *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (805.3) reads *de'i steng la sangs rgyas bdun po'i gcig 'byung ngo /.*

¹⁷³ Miyazaki, p. 63n126, cf. *Mahāmegha*, D (232) wa 190a7-b3: *rigs kyi bu khyod legs kyis rigs kyi bu nga'i nyan thos kyi che ba nyid nyon cig / rigs kyi bu bskal pa bzang po 'di 'das te / sang rgyas stong yongs su mya ngan las 'das pa'i 'og tu bskal pa drug cu rtsa gnyis su sangs rgyas 'byung bar mi 'gyur te / rang sangs rgyas bye ba phrag 'bum 'byung bar 'gyur ro / rigs ki bu bskal pa drug cu rtsa gnyis po de dag 'das nas sangs rgyas gzhan bdun 'byung bar 'gyur ro / de nas bdun pa yongs su mya ngan las 'das pa de'i tshe de'i dus na 'jig rten gyi khams 'di 'jig rten gyi khams mngon par dang ba zhes bya bar 'gyur tel' jig rten gyi khams mngon par dang ba der bcom ldan 'das de bzhin gshegs pa dgra bcom pa yang dag par rdzog pa'i sangs rgyas ye shes 'byung gnas 'od ces bya bar 'gyur ro /.*

Moreover, the *Mañjuśrīmūlatantra* states:

A bhikṣu called Nāgāhvaya will appear, having the knowledge of suchness that lacks inherent existence; having obtained a spell called ‘peacock,’ he will live for six hundred years.¹⁷⁴

Also, from the *Laṅkāvatāra sūtra*:

Oh Mahāmati, you should know...In Vedālī, in the south, a bhikṣu most illustrious and distinguished [will be born]; his name is Nāgāhvaya.¹⁷⁵ ...[H]aving attained the stage of the Joyous, he will go to Sukhāvatī.¹⁷⁶

There also is a prophecy in the *Mahābherihārakaparivarta*. There is no verse of prophecy in the *Ārya-Suvarṇa-prabhāsottamasūtra*, but there is a dispute over the relics of the Buddha between the Brahman Kauṇḍinya and this Licchavi Sarsvasattvapriyadarśana (“Joyous When Seen by All the World”).

Moreover, the honorable Ācārya Candrakīrti states:

Accordingly, [I] realized the meaning directly from the great Ācārya Ārya-Nāgārjuna himself, who teaches in the world the concentration of Mahāvajradhara that is realized by oneself. [He] has passed beyond the happiness of gods and men, and of the *tīrthikas*, and the happiness of concentration and absorption of *śrāvakas* and *pratyekabuddhas*. He possesses to the utmost all aspects of the body of the Tathāgata, which is free of arising and cessation. [One] could never have enough of looking at this body, which has attained the adornment of all qualities of a buddha, the ten powers and the four fearlessnesses and so forth. He went to Sukhāvatī and resides [there] possessing the eight qualities of mastery.¹⁷⁷

¹⁷⁴ *Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa*, 53.449cf, 450ad: /
nāgāhvayo nāma sau bhikṣuḥ / jīved varṣaśatāni ṣaṭ / 53.449 /
māyūrī nāmato vidyā siddhā / niḥsvabhāvarthatattvavit / 53.450 /.

¹⁷⁵ *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, 10.164c, 165abc: mahāmate nibodha tvam /
dakṣiṇāpathavedalyāṃ bhikṣuḥ śrīmān mahāyaśāḥ /nāgāhvayaḥ sa nāmnā
tu.

¹⁷⁶ *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, 10.166cd: āsādyā bhūmiṃ muditāṃ yāsyate 'sau
sukhāvatīm /.

¹⁷⁷ *Pradīpodyotana-ṭīkā*, 17, p. 226: evaṃ śrīnāgārjunapāda-
bhaṭṭāarakānuprāptasvakārthaḥ / pratyātmavedyaṃ mahāvajradhara-

This is taught in the *Pradīpodyotana*. Therefore, one should learn and understand the texts of Ācārya Nāgārjuna and become one who has the profound instructions of his lineage. The individual who practices [this lineage] will course in the great vehicle for immeasurable lifetimes. As long as the Buddha's teaching exists, these oral instructions will not be severed. The Venerable Āryadeva states:

The Bhagavan Śākyamuni at midnight made manifest the concentration of awakening and ever since, the Buddha's teaching has existed. Upheld by the Ācārya Ārya-Nāgārjuna, passed from the mentor's mouth to mentor's mouth, this oral instruction from the mouth of the Ācārya is a blessing of all the buddhas and bodhisattvas as well as all the *vajradākinīs*.¹⁷⁸

The Venerable Ācārya Candrakīrti [states]:

Yogi, for those desiring to become awakened in this life itself, this difficult-to-obtain special instruction of the profound essential reality from the mouth of the Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] for masters is like treasure, like pouring water of amṛta into precious vases. As long as the dharma of Śākyamunibuddha abides, is transferred and received from mouth to mouth, from ear to ear, for that long, this [teaching] will not disappear.

samādhim loke pratipādya devamanuṣyasukham atikramya tīrthikaśrāvaka-pratyekabuddhadhyānasamādhisamāpattisukham atikramya utpādabhaṅga-rahitaṃ sarvākāravaroṇetam āsecanakarahitaṃ daśabalavaiśāradyādi-buddhālaṅkāraṃ tathāgata-kāyaṃ pratilabhya sukhāvatiṃ gatvāṣṭagaṇaiśvāryānvito viharati /.

¹⁷⁸ Cf. *Caryāmelāpakapradīpa*, (Wedemeyer 2007: 446–47): *anenaiva krameṇa / bhagavān śrī-śākyasīmhaḥ sarva-tathāgatair acchaṭa-śabdaiḥ samcodite sati / āsphānaka-samādher vyutthāya bodhimūle niṣadyārdharātra-samaye prabhāsvaram sākṣāt-kṛtvā / māyopama-samādhinā vyutthāya jñānebyo dharma-cakraṃ pravartitavān / tad ārabhya yāvat saddharmo 'sthāt tāvad guru-vaktrād guru-vaktraṃ saṃkrāmati (yoga-yugma-viśva-viśuddhi-rahasyābhisambodhi-kramāḥ saṃkrāmatīti) /*; Tibetan D (1803) ngi 90a2-4: *rim pa 'di nyid kyis bcom ldan 'das dpal śākya thub pa la de bzhin gshegs pa thams cad kyis se gol gyi sgras bskul bar gyur pas mi g-yo ba'i ting nge 'din las bzhengs te / byang chub kyi shing drung la bzhugs nas mtshan phyed kyi dus su 'od gsal ba mngon du mdzad de / sgyu ma lta bu'i ting nge 'dzin las bzhengs nas / 'gro ba rnams la chos ston par mdzad pa yin no / dongs nas brtsams te / dam pa'i chos ji srid gnas pa de srid du bla ma'i kha nas bla ma'i khar brgyud pa yin no /.*

5.3 [Nāgārjuna's Maturation Body (D 115b2–115b5)]

The maturation body (*rnam par smin pa'i sku, vipākakāya*)¹⁷⁹ of Ācārya Ārya-Nāgārjuna—that very body—dwells on Śrī-Parvata, ‘Glorious Mountain’. At one time, the son of King Sukhacaryabhadra went to Glorious Mountain to take the head of the Ācārya. The Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] said, “Prince, cut and take [this body]”. Trying five times with a sword, [the Prince] could not cut [him] into pieces. The Ācārya [Nāgārjuna] said, “Take up a blade of *Kuśa* grass”. The Prince offered it to him, and having received that, the Ācārya himself wrapped the root around his throat, and [his] head, which dropped to the ground, was offered into the hand of the Prince. [His head] was not carried by the Prince, but went off by itself. Even now the trunk of the body and the head are in a pavilion made of splendid emanated light. They [are] placed on a precious throne, perpetually worshipped day and night by gandharvas, yakṣas, devas, and so forth. There is a long-established oral tradition about this.

5.4 [Nāgārjuna's Aspiration Body (D 115b5–116a1)]

The aspiration body aspiration (*smon lam kyi sku, pranidhānakāya*) dwells in Sukhāvātī. Named ‘Bodhisattva Precious Intelligence’ (*Byang chub sems dpa' blo gros rin po che*) by the Bhagavan Amitābha, it has two arms, white body-color, the right [hand in the gesture] of giving boons and the left [hand] holding a white lotus. From the mouth of the Venerable *Guru Avadhūtīpa*:

My lama, the great venerable [one], the lord of yogis, Avadhūtīpa Nāropa,¹⁸⁰ with previously acquired supernatural cognition, had a vision and heard [Nāgārjuna's] teaching, seeing him while dwelling on Śrī-Parvata. A disciple of the Ārya, the Venerable Nāgābodhi, who is renowned as Śrī-Śabaripāda, also always listened to

¹⁷⁹ In Sarvāstivādin accounts of the bodies of a buddha, the maturation body (*vipākakāya*) is related to the form body (*rūpakāya*). See Lamotte, *History of Indian Buddhism*, pp. 689–90. See also Bhavya's *Tarkajvālā* (D, fol. 103a7-b1, reference in Almogi 2009: 243n20), which cites Vajrasena as explaining the maturation body as the *rūpakāya*, which is supported by the *dharmakāya* and whose sphere of activity is *Akaniṣṭha* heaven (*'phags pa rdo rje sdes ni gzugs kyi sku 'og min gyi spyod yul can chos kyi sku'i gzhi la brten pa ni rnam par smin pa'i sku zhes bshad do*).

¹⁸⁰ *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (806.18) adds *nā ro pa*.

the dharma.

The Guru Avadhūtipa taught this.

6 [Regarding the Practice of Secret Mantra (D 116a1–116b3)]

Casting away their own suffering, tormented by the fire of others' suffering, [those with the] sharpest of sharp faculties aspire not to be frightened of the profound dharma. Not separating from self-achievement, desiring to be awakened in this life itself, and quickly achieving the purposes of others without difficulty, one should engage in the vehicle of particular skillfulness [i.e., Mantrayāna] with the desire to quickly produce supernatural knowledge. Having requested the *vajrācārya* empowerment from the auspicious *guru*, one should mainly practice. The secret (*guhya*) and wisdom-gnosis (*prajñajñāna*) empowerments are not authorized for those on the path of liberating pure conduct [i.e., celibacy] and therefore such a student should not take [such empowerments].¹⁸¹ [These empowerments] terminate pure conduct (*brahmacaryā*) and through causing the disappearance of the Buddha's teaching, undoubtedly cause both disciple and teacher to go to [the realm] of hell beings. If it is secret mantra activity, receive an empowerment and become a follower of any tantra where one has obtained a vase empowerment. Request from the guru the *samādhi* of one's own chosen deity and the mantra to mutter; emphasizing *siddhi*, protecting very purely the twenty vows and commitments (*samaya*), one should succeed. At any time, with the ability to produce [*siddhi*], with [mastery of] the four extensive activities and the eight worldly achievements, [one] will achieve the aims of others without difficulty. With that [in mind] a *tantra* states:

Secret *mantra* [is a] great ocean, a flood of perfection (*siddhi*), erotic (*'khrig pa can*); it cannot be cognized through examples, verbal authority, words, or the insights of inference (*anumāna*).

My *guru*, Yavadvīpāda, the meritorious Avadhūtipāda, states:

¹⁸¹ Compare with *Bodhipathapradīpa* and *Pañjikā* (D 290b; Sherburne 2000: 300-3) where these two empowerments are forbidden to those who are celibate.

Give up the two vehicles [of Hīnayāna and Mahāyāna], enter into this, [and] attain Mahāmudrā. This being the case, what wise person would not practice this vehicle of secret *mantra*?

Although it has the very same goal [of awakening], the way of secret *mantra* is superior because it is free from confusion, has multiple methods, is without hardship, and is mastered by those with acute faculties.¹⁸²

In this regard, if one does not gain consecration (*abhiṣeka*, *dbang bskur*), one should not engage in this [vehicle], and one should not cultivate the deity or mutter the *mantra*. Without one's obtaining the permission blessing (*rjes su gñang ba*), both secret *mantra* and the perfection [vehicles] become corrupted for attaining liberation. The special instruction (*upadeśa*) of the completion stage that is free from elaboration, the complete mind of *vajra*-awakening, should not be taught to one who is not a vessel. A fully accomplished *upāsaka* [i.e., layperson] who is on the path of desire is without fault in joining the two sexual organs.

Being content with one's own consort, [one] does not go with the woman of another. Abandoning the aspect of wrongful adultery, that *upāsaka* goes to the abode of the gods.¹⁸³

This is taught in a *sūtra*.

One should train [in] the secret *mantra* vehicle
For the sake of purifying quickly the two obscurations
And accumulating quickly the two collections.
Thus spoke Mar me mdzad dpal ye shes,
Sharp minded *bhikṣu* of Śākya[muni],
Who possesses the method of love and wisdom.
[This] was written at the urging of the good disciple
Known as Tshul khriims rgyal ba, "Victorious Conduct".

¹⁸² Miyazaki (p. 68n136) cites from the *Nayatrāyapradīpa* (D 3797, tsu 16b3-4) and the *Tattvaratnāvalī* (p.8): *ekārthatve 'py asammohāt bahūpāyād aduṣkarāt / tīkṣṇendriyādhikārāc ca mantraśāstram viśiṣyate* /. Also cited in the *Bodhimārgapradīpapañjikā* (D, 3948, khi 286b3-4; Sherburne 2000: 280-81).

¹⁸³ This verse is missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (807.16).

Written by Dīpaṅkaraśrījñāna
 As spoken by the holy *gurus*,
 In the great temple called “Vikramaśīla”, [supported by]
 The solemn oath of [King] Devapāla.

[Dīpaṅkaraśrījñāna did not give these teachings] merely for the
 sake of food, wealth, or minor matters.

[This teaching is] not to be given to those unprepared.

One who is not devoted to the teachings of Ārya Nāgārjuna
 Abandons the profound and goes to hell.

[This] completes the advice by the Mahāpaṇḍita Śrī-
 Dīpaṅkarajñāna, the so-called “Opened Basket of Precious Special
 Instructions of the Great Vehicle Middle Way”. It was translated,
 requested, and put in order by the Indian master Dīpaṅkarajñāna
 himself, the great lotsawa¹⁸⁴ *upāsaka* Rgya brtson 'grus seng ge,
 and Bhikṣu Tshul khrim rgyal ba.

¹⁸⁴ Missing from *Jo bo rje'i gsung 'bum* (807.24).

Appendix I**Table of Tibetan Texts**

	Section Heading	Dergé	Gsung 'bum
1	Preliminary Instructions	96b1–98b4	594.4–597.10
2	The Mind of Awakening	98b4–98b6	597.10–597.13
2.1	The Cause of the Mind of Awakening	98b6–99a3	597.13–597.23
2.2	The Condition for the Mind of Awakening	99a3–100a5	597.24–599.12
2.3	The Nature of Arising	100a5–100a6	599.12–599.16
2.4	The Distinctive Aspect	100a6–100b1	599.16–599.21
2.5	Training the Mind	100b1–100b3	599.21–600.1
2.6	Keeping the Mind of Awakening	100b3–103a2	600.1–603.13
2.7	Protecting the Mind of Awakening	103a2–103b4	603.13–604.10
2.8	The Causes for Downfalls to Occur	103b4–103b7	604.10–604.15
2.9	The Negative Consequence of Letting Go	103b7–104a3	604.15–604.20
2.10	The Benefit of Rejoicing in Others' Generating of the Mind of Awakening	104a1–104a3	604.10–604.25
2.11	The Negative Consequence of Interrupting Others' Generation of Mind	104a3–104a6	604.25–605.6
2.12	Increasing the Mind of Awakening	104a6–105b1	605.6–606.21
2.13	The Benefits of the Mind of Awakening	105b1–106a1	606.21–607.16
3	Buddhas and Bodhisattvas	106a1–112b3	607.16–608.11/ 793.2–802.4
4	Previous Buddhist Masters	112b3–113a4	802.4–802.25
5	The Teachings of Nāgārjuna		
5.1	A Classification of his Teachings	113a4–113b6	802.25–803.20
5.2	Nāgārjuna's Predicted Buddhahood	113b6–115b2	803.20–806.7
5.3	Nāgārjuna's Maturation Body	115b2–115b5	806.7–806.15
5.4	Nāgārjuna's Aspiration Body	115b5–116a1	806.15–806.21
6	Regarding the Practice of Secret Mantra	116a1–116b3	806.21–807.25

Principal Indian Sources

- Abhidharmakośakārikā* by Vasubandhu. Edited by V.V. Gokhale (1946). "The Text of the Abhidharmakośakārikā of Vasubandhu". *Journal of the Bombay Branch, Royal Asiatic Society* 22: 73–102; (1947) 23: 12.
- Abhisamayālaṃkāra*. Edited by Th. Stcherbatsky and E. Obermiller (1929). *Abhisamayālaṃkāraprajñāpāramitopadeśaśāstrakārikā*. Leningrad. (Bibliotheca Buddhica, XXIII, fasc. 1.) Sri Satguru Publications, 2nd edition (Delhi, 1992).
- Abhisamayālaṃkāralokā Prajñāpāramitāvyākhyā* by Haribhadra. Edited by U. Wogihara (1932-35). *The Work of Haribhadra*. Tokyo: The Toyo Bunko.
- Acintyastava (Bsam gyis mi khyab par bstod pa)*. Tōh. no. 1128. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KA, folios 76b7–79a2.
- Adhyardhaśatikāprajñāpāramitā*. Ian Astley–Kristensen, *The Rishukyō: The Sino–Japanese Tantric Prajñāpāramitā in 150 Verses*. Institute of Buddhist Studies (Tring, 1991).
- Akṣayamatīnirdeśanāmamahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa blo gros mi zad pas bstan pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 175. Dergé Kanjur, vol. MA, folios 79a1–174b7. Jens Braarvig, *Akṣayamatīnirdeśasūtra*. Solum Forlag (Oslo, 1993).
- Ārya-Avikalpapraveśanāmadhāraṇī* ('Phags pa rnam par mi rtog par 'jug pa zhes bya ba'i gzungs). Tōh. no. 142. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 1b1-6b1. Carmen Meinert, "Structural Analysis of the *Bsam-gtan Mig Sgron*: A Comparison of the Fourfold Correct Practice in the *Āryavikalpapraveśanāmadhāraṇī* and the Contents of the Four Main Chapters of the *Bsam-gtan Mig Sgron*." *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies*, vol. 26, no. 1 (2003), pp. 175–95.
- Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitāsūtra*. Edited by U. Wogihara (1932-35); included in *Abhisamayālaṃkāralokā*.
- Avalokiteśvarapariṣcchāsaptadharmaka-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa spyen ras gzigs dbang phyug gis zhus pa chos bdun pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 150. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 331a2–331b5.

- Bhagavadratnaguṇasaṅcayagāthā-nāma-pañjikā*, by Haribhadra.
Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa sdud pa tshigs sub cad pa.
D. No. 3792, mdo 'grel, vol. JA, folios 1a1-78a7.
- Bhāvanākrama-1 (Bsgom pa'i rim pa)*. Tōh. no. 3915. Dergé
Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 22a1-41b7. Giuseppe Tucci, *Minor
Buddhist Texts, Parts I and II*. Motilal Banarsidass (reprint,
Delhi, 1986), pp. 465-592.
- Bhāvanākrama-2 (Bsgom pa'i rim pa)*. Tōh. no. 3916 (also, no.
4567). Dergé Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 42a1-55b5. K.
Goshima, *The Tibetan Text of the Second Bhāvanākrama*
(Kyoto, 1983). Tenzin Gyatso, *Stages of Meditation, root
text by Kamalashila*, translated by Ven. Geshe Lobsang
Jordhen, Losang Choephel Ganchenpa and Jeremy Russell,
Snow Lion (Ithaca, 2001).
- Bhāvanākrama-3 (Bsgom pa'i rim pa)*. Tōh. no. 3917. Dergé
Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 55b6-68b7. Parmananda Sharma,
trans., *Bhāvanākrama of Kamalaśīla*. Aditya Prakashan
(New Delhi, 1997).
- Bodhicittavivarāṇa (Byang chub sems kyi 'grel pa lhug pa ma)*.
Tōh. no. 1801. Dergé Tanjur, vol. NGI, folios 42b5-45a5.
Christian Lindtner, *Master of Wisdom: Writings of the
Buddhist Master Nāgārjuna*. Dharma Publishing (Oakland,
1986), pp. 32-71.
- Bodhipathapradīpa (Byang chub lam gyi sgron ma)*. Tōh. no. 3947.
Dergé Tanjur, vol. KHI, folios 238a6-141a4. H. Eimer,
*Bodhipathapradīpa: Ein Lehergedicht des Atiśa
(Dīpaṃkaraśrījñāna) in der tibetischen Überlieferung*.
Asiatische Forschungen 59, (Wiesbaden, 1978).
- Bodhisattvabhūmi (Rnal 'byor spyod pa'i sa las, Byang chub sems
dpa'i sa)*. Tōh. no. 4037. Dergé Tanjur, vol. WI, folios 1b1-
213a7. Nalinaksha Dutt, *Bodhisattvabhūmi*. K.P. Jayaswal
Research Institute (Patna, 1966).
- Bodhicaryāvatāra or Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra (Byang chub sems
dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa)*. Tōh. no. 3871. Dergé Tanjur,
vol. LA, folios 1b1-40a7. P.L. Vaidya, ed.,
*Bodhicaryāvatāra of śāntideva with the Commentary
Pañjikā of Prajñākaramati*, Buddhist Sanskrit Texts series
no. 12. The Mithila Institute (Darbhanga, 1960; reprint
1988).

- Bodhisattvagocaropāyaviṣayavikurvānanirdeśa-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa byang chub sems dpa'i spyod yul gyi thabs kyi yul la rnam par 'phrul pa bstan pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 146. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 82a3-141b7.
- Bodhisattvasaṃvaraviṃśaka* (Byang chub sems dpa'i sdom pa nyi shu pa). Tōh. no. 4081. Dergé Tanjur, vol. HI, folios 166b1-167a5. In *Difficult Beginnings: Three Works on the Bodhisattva Path by Candragomin*, translated by Mark Tatz. Shambala (Boston, 1985).
- Caryāmelāpakapradīpa* (Spyod pa bsdus pa'i sgron ma). Tōh. no. 1803. Dergé Tanjur, vol. NGI, folios 57a2-106b7. English translation by Christian K. Wedemeyer, *Āryadeva's Lamp That Integrates the Practices (Caryāmelāpakapradīpa): The Gradual Path of Vajrayāna Buddhism According to the Esoteric Community Noble Tradition*. American Institute of Buddhist Studies at Columbia University (New York, 2007).
- Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa* (Sems kyi sgrib pa rnam par sbyong ba zhes bya ba'i rab tu byed pa). Tōh. no. 1804. Dergé Tanjur, vol. NGI, folios 106b7-112a3. P. B. Patel, ed., *Cittaviśuddhiprakaraṇa of Āryadeva: Sanskrit and Tibetan Texts*. Visva-Bharati Research Publications (Santiniketan, 1949). Mathew Varghese, *Principles of Buddhist Tantra: A Discourse on Cittaviśuddhi-prakaraṇa of Āryadeva*, Munshiram Manoharlal (New Delhi, 2008).
- Daśadharmaka-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa chos bcu pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 53. Dergé Kanjur, vol. KHA, folios 164a6-184b6.
- Gaganagañjaparipṛcchā-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa nam mkha' mdzod kyiis zhus pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 148. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 243a1-330a7.
- Guhyasamājatantra, or, Sarvatathāgatakāyavākcittarahasyaguhyasamāja-nāma-mahākālparāja* (De bzhin gshegs pa thams cad kyi sku gsung thugs kyi gsang chen gsang ba 'dus pa zhes bya ba brtag pa'i rgyal po chen po). Tōh. no. 442. Dergé Kanjur, vol. CA, folios 90a1-148a6. Yukei Matsunaga, *The Guhyasamāja Tantra, a New Critical Edition*. Toho Shuppan (Osaka, 1978).

- Jñānasiddhināmasādhana* (*Ye shes grub pa zhes bya ba'i sgrub pa'i thabs*). Tōh. no. 2219 (no author's name given). Dergé Tanjur, vol. WI, folios 36b7–60b6. Contained in: *Guhyādi–Aṣṭasiddhi–Saṃgraha*, ed., Samdhong Rinpoche and Vrajvallabh Dwivedi, with a number of coeditors. Central Institute for Higher Tibetan Studies (Sarnath, 1987), pp. 89–167 (Sanskrit text), and 145–244 (Tibetan text).
- Kāśyapaparivarta–nāma–mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa 'od srung gi le'u zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 87. Dergé Kanjur, vol. CHA, folios 119b1–151b7. M.I. Vorobyova–Desyatovskaya in collaboration with Seishi Karashima and Noriyuki Kudo, *The Kāśyapaparivarta: Romanized Text and Facsimiles*. Bibliotheca Philologica et Philosophica Buddhica vol. 5. The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University (Tokyo, 2002).
- Kudṛṣṭinirghāta* (*Lta ba ngan pa sel ba*). Tōh. no. 2229. Dergé Tanjur, vol. WI, folios 104a7–110a2. Glenn Wallis, “Advayavajra's Instructions on the Ādikarma.” *Pacific World*, third series, no. 5 (Fall, 2003), pp. 203–30.
- Kuśalamūlasaṃparigraha–nāma–mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa dge ba'i rtsa ba yongs su 'dzin pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 101. Dergé Kanjur, vol. NGA, folios 1b1–227b7.
- Lalitavistara–nāma–mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa rgya cher rol pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 95. Dergé Kanjur. P.L. Vaidya, *Lalita–Vistara*, Buddhist Sanskrit Text series no. 1 (Darbhanga, 1987).
- Laṅkāvatāra–mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa lang kar gshegs pa'i theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 107. Dergé Kanjur, vol. CA, folios 56a1–191b7. B. Nanjio, *The Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra*. Bibliotheca Otaniensis series no. 1 (Kyoto, 1923).
- Madhyamakahrdayakārikā* (*Dbu ma'i snying po'i tshig le'ur byas pa*). Tōh. no. 3855. Dergé Tanjur, vol. DZA, folios 40b7–329b4. Christian Lindtner, *Madhyamakahrdayam of Bhavya*. Adyar Series no. 123. The Theosophical Society (Chennai, 2001).

- Madhyamakahrdayatarkajvālā* (*Dbu ma'i snying po'i 'grel pa rtog ge 'bar ba*). Tōh. no. 3856. Dergé Tanjur, vol. DZA, folios 40b7–329b4. Annette L. Heitmann, *Nektar der Erkenntnis, Buddhistische Philosophie des 6. Jh.: Bhavyas Tarkajvālā* I–III.26. Shaker Verlag (Aachen, 2004).
- Madhyamakaratnapradīpa* (*Dbu ma rin po che'i sgron ma*). Tōh. no. 3854. Dergé Tanjur, vol. TSHA, folios 259b3–289a7.
- Madhyamakopadeśa* (*Dbu ma'i man ngag*). Tōh. no. 3929 (also, no. 4468). Dergé Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 95b1–96a7.
- Madhyamakopadeśavṛtti* (*Dbu ma'i man ngag ces bya ba'i 'grel pa*). Tōh. no. 3931. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 116b7–123b2.
- Mahāmegha* (*'Phags pa sprin chen po*). Tōh. no. 235 (also, nos. 657, 1063). Dergé Kanjur, vol. WA, folios 250a2–263a7.
- Mahāvairocanābhisambodhivikurvitādhiṣṭhāna-vaipulyasūtrendra-rāja-nāma-dharmaparyāya* (*Rnam par snang mdzad chen po mngon par rdzogs par byang chub pa rnam par sprul pa byin gyis rlob pa shin tu rgyas pa mdo sde'i dbang po'i rgyal po zhes bya ba'i chos kyi rnam grangs*). Tōh. no. 494. Dergé Kanjur, vol. THA, folios 151b2–260a7.
- Mahāyānaprasādaprabhāvana-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa theg pa chen po la dad pa rab tu sgom pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 144. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 6b6–34a3.
- Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra-nāma-kārikā* (*Theg pa chen po mdo sde'i rgyan zhes bya ba'i tshig le'ur byas pa*). Tōh. no. 4020. Dergé Tanjur, vol. PHI, folios 1b1–39a4. Sylvain Lévi, ed., *Mahāyāna-Sūtrālamkāra, Exposé de la doctrine du Grand véhicule selon le système Yogācāra*. Champion (Paris, 1907, 1911), reprinted in two volumes by Rinsen Book Company (Kyoto, 1983). Asaṅga., L. Jamspal, Robert Clark, Joe Wilson, Leonard Zwilling, Michael J Sweet, Robert A. F. Thurman, and Vasubandhu, *The Universal Vehicle Discourse Literature: Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra*. Center for Buddhist Studies, Columbia University and Tibet House US (New York, 2004).

Mañjuśrīmūlatantra ('Phags pa 'jam dpal gyi rtsa ba'i rgyud).
Tôh. no. 543. Dergé Kanjur, vol. NA, folios 105a1–351a6.
T. Gaṇapati Śāstri, *Mañjuśrīmūlakalpa*, Trivandrum
Sanskrit Series nos. 70 (Trivandrum, 1920), 76
(Trivandrum, 1922), 84 (Trivandrum, 1925).

Māyopamāsamādhi-nāma-mahāyānasūtra ('Phags pa sgyu ma lta
bu'i ting nge 'dzin zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo).
Tôh. no. 130. Dergé Kanjur, vol. DA, folios 210b3-230b4.

Mūlāpattisaṃgraha (Rtsa ba'i ltung ba bsdus pa). Tôh. no. 2478.
Dergé Tanjur, vol. ZI, folio 179a6-179b5. Fragment in
Sylvain Lévi, "Autour d'Aśvaghoṣa", *Journal Asiatique*
215: 255-87, 1929.

Nayatrāyapradīpa (Tshul gsum gyi sgron ma). Tôh. no. 3707.
Dergé Tanjur, vol. TSU, folios 6b4-26b1.

Nirāupamyastava (Dpe med par bstod pa). Ācārya Gyaltsen
Namdol, trans. and ed., *Catuḥstavaḥ of Ācārya Nāgārjuna*
(*Sanskrit Text with Tibetan Version and Hindi Translation*).
Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies (Sarnath, 2001).
Fernando Tola & C. Dragonetti, *On Voidness: A Study on*
Buddhist Nihilism. Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi, 1995), pp.
114–16.

Pañcakrama (Rim pa lnga pa). Tôh. no. 1802. Dergé Tanjur, vol.
NGI, folios 45a5–57a1. Katsumi Mimaki and Toru
Tomabechi, *Pañcakrama: Sanskrit and Tibetan Texts*
Critically Edited with Verse Index and Facsimile Edition of
the Sanskrit Manuscripts. The Centre for East Asian
Cultural Studies for UNESCO (Tokyo, 1994).

Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā. N. Dutt, ed., Calcutta
Oriental Series No. 28 (Calcutta, 1934). E. Conze, trans.,
The Large Sutra on Perfect Wisdom, with the Divisions of
the Abhisamayālaṃkāra. University of California Press
(Berkeley, 1975).

Paramārthastava (Don dam par bstod pa). Tôh. no. 1122. Dergé
Tanjur, vol. KA, folio 70a2–70b2. Fernando Tola & C.
Dragonetti, *On Voidness: A Study on Buddhist Nihilism*.
Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi, 1995), pp. 120–21.

- Pinḍikṛtasādhana*. (*Sgrub pa'i thabs mdor byas pa*). Tôh. no. 1796. Dergé Tanjur, vol. NGI, folios 1b1–11a2. Louis de La Vallée Poussin, *Études et textes tantriques: Pañcakrama*, J.B. Istas (Louvain, 1896).
- Pradīpodyotana-nāma-ṭikā* (*Sgron ma gsal bar byed pa zhes bya ba'i rgya cher bshad pa*). Tôh. no. 1785. Dergé Tanjur, vol. HA, folios 1b1–201b2. Chintaharan Chakravarti (Cintāharaṇacakravartti), ed., *Guhyasamājatantra-pradīpodyotanaṭikā-śaṭkoṭīvyākhyā*. Tibetan Sanskrit Works series no. 25. Kashi Prasad Jayaswal Research Institute (Patna [Pāṭaliputra] 1984). Alex Wayman, *Yoga of the Guhyasamājatantra: The Arcane Lore of Forty Verses*. Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi, 1977), pp. 35–41.
- Prajñāpāramitāpiṇḍārthapradīpa* by Mar me mdzad ye shes (Dipamkaraśrījñāna). *Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa'i don bsdus sgron ma*. Tôh. no. 3804, Dergé Tanjur, vol. THA, folios 230b1–240a7.
- Prajñāpāramitāratnagunaṣaṇcayagāthā* (*'Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa sdud pa tshigs su bcad pa*). Tôh. no. 13. Dergé Kanjur, vol. KA, folios 1b1–19b7. E. Obermiller, *Prajñāpāramitā-ratna-guṇa-saṃcaya-gāthā*. Bibliotheca Buddhica no. 29 (1937). Reprinted with a Sanskrit–Tibetan–English index by Edward Conze, Indo–Iranian Reprints no. 5 (1960). Edited with an introduction, bibliographical notes, and a Tibetan version from Tunhuang by Akira Yuyama, *Prajñā-pāramitā-ratna-guṇa-saṃcaya-gāthā*. Cambridge University Press (Cambridge, 1976).
- Prajñāpāramitāstotra* (*Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin ma'i bstod pa*). Tôh. no. 1127. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KA, folios 76a1–76b7. Sanskrit found in Étienne Lamotte, *Le traité de la grande vertu de sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāprajñāpāramitāśāstra)*, Tome II. Bureaux du Muséon (Louvain, 1949), pp. 1060–65.
- Pratibhānamatipariprcchā-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* (*spobs pa'i blo gros kyi zhus pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tôh. no. 151. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PA, folios 331b5–344a4.
- Ratnakaraṇḍodghāṭa-nāma-madhyamakopadeśa* (*Dbu ma'i man ngag rin po che'i za ma tog kha phye ba*). Tôh. no. 3930. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KI, folios 96b1–116b7.

- Ratnāvalī* (*Rājaparīkathāratnamālā*, *Rgyal po la gtam bya ba rin po che'i phreng ba*). Tōh. no. 4158. Dergé Tanjur, vol. GE, folios 107a1–126a4. Michael Hahn, *Nāgārjuna's Ratnāvalī, Vol. 1: The Basic Texts (Sanskrit, Tibetan, Chinese)*. Indica et Tibetica no. 1 (Bonn, 1982). John Dunne and Sarah McClintock, *The Precious Garland: An Epistle to a King*. Wisdom (Boston, 1997).
- Sāgaramatiparipṛcchā-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa blo gros rgya mtshos zhus pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 152. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PHA, folios 1b1-115b7.
- Sāgaranāgarājaparipṛcchā-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* (*'Phags pa klu'i rgyal po rgya mtshos zhus pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 154. Dergé Kanjur, vol. PHA, folios 198a3–205a6.
- Sarvapūṇyasamuccayasamādhisūtra* (*Bsod nams thams cad sdud pa'i ting nge 'dzin zhe bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo*). Tōh. no. 134. Dergé Kanjur, vol. NA, folios 70b2–121b7.
- Śatasāhasrikāprajñāpāmitāsūtra*. P. Ghosha, ed. Bibli. Ind. 1, nos. 146–48. Asiatic Society of Bengal (Calcutta, 1902–13). Contains only chapters 1–12. D. No. 0008, shes phyin, ka 1b1-a395a6.
- Sattvārādhana-gāthā* (*Sems can mgu bar bya ba'i tshigs su bcad pa*) or *Sattvārādhana-stava* (*Sems can mgu bar bya ba'i bstod pa*). Tōh. no. 1125. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KA, folios 74b3-75b1.
- Satyadvayāvatāra* (*Bden pa gnyis la 'jug pa*). Tōh. no. 3902 (also, no. 4467). Dergé Tanjur, vol. A, folios 72a2–73a7. Christian Lindtner, trans., “Atiśa’s Introduction to the Two Truths, and Its Sources”. *Journal of Indian Philosophy*, vol. 9 (1981), pp. 161–214. See also Sherburne (2000): 352–59.
- Śikṣāsamuccaya* (*Bslab pa kun las btus pa*). Tōh. no. 3940. Dergé Tanjur, vol. KHI, folios 3a2–194b5. Cecil Bendall, ed., *Śikṣāsamuccaya: A Compendium of Buddhist Teaching*. Bibliotheca Buddhica no. 1 (St. Petersburg 1897–1902), reprinted by Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi, 1971). C. Bendall and W.H.D. Rouse, *Compendium of Buddhist Doctrine*. J. Murray (London, 1922), reprinted by Motilal Banarsidass (Delhi, 1971).

- Śraddhābalādhānāvātāramudrā-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa dad pa'i stobs bskyed pa la 'jug pa'i phyag rgya zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 201. Dergé Kanjur, vol. TSHA, folios 1b1–63a2.
- Śrī-Paramādyamantrakalpakaṇḍa* (*Dpal mchog dang po'i sngags kyi rtog pa'i dum bu*). Tōh. no. 488. Dergé Kanjur, vol. TA, folios 173a1–265b7.
- Subhāṣitasamgraha*. Cecil Bendall, ed., *Subhāṣita-Samgraha. Le Muséon*, vol. 22 (1903), pp. 375–402; vol. 23 (1904), pp. 1–46, 245–74.
- Tathāgatācintyaguhyanirdeśa-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa de bzhin gshegs pa'i gsang ba bsam gyis mi khyab pa bstan pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 47. Dergé Kanjur, vol. KA, folios 100a1–203a7.
- Tathāgatajñānamudrāsamādhi-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa de bzhin gshegs pa'i ye shes kyi phyag rgya'i ting nge 'dzin zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 131. Dergé Kanjur, vol. DA, folios 230b4–253b5.
- Tattvaratnāvalī* (*De kho na nyid rin po che'i phreng ba*). Tōh. no. 2240. Dergé Tanjur, vol. WI, folios 115a6–120a1. Hara Prasad Shastri, *Advayavajrasamgraha*. Oriental Institute (Baroda, 1927), pp. viii, 14–22. Mark Tatz, "Tattva-Ratnāvalī: The Precious Garland of Verses on Reality," in: G. Kuppuram and K. Kumudamani, eds., *Researches in Indian History, Archaeology, Art and Religion: Prof. Upendra Thakur Felicitation Volume*. Sundeep Prakashan (Delhi, 1990), vol. 2, pp. 491–513.
- Trīśaraṇagamanasaptati* (*Gsum la skyabs su 'gro ba bdun cu pa*). Tōh. no. 3971 (also, no. 4564). Dergé Tanjur, vol. GI, folios 251a1–253b2. Per Sørensen, *Candrakīrti. Trīśaraṇasaptati: The Septuagint on the Three Refuges*. Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde (Vienna, 1986).
- Triskandhaka-nāma-mahāyānasūtra* ('Phags pa phung po gsum pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 284. Dergé Kanjur, vol. YA, folios 57a3–77a3.

Vajracchedikā-nāma-prajñāpāramitāsūtra ('Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa rdo rje gcod pa zhes bya ba theg pa chen po'i mdo). Tōh. no. 16. Dergé Kanjur, vol. KA, folios 121a1–132b7. Paul Harrison & Shogo Watanabe, "Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā", in: Jens Braarvig, Paul Harrison, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, Kazunobu Matsuda & Lore Sander, eds., *Buddhist Manuscripts in the Schøyen Collection*. Hermes (Oslo, 2006), pp. 89–132. Paul Harrison, "Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā: A New English Translation of the Sanskrit Text Based on Two Manuscripts from Greater Gandhāra", in: op. cit., 133–59.

Vajrajñānasamuccaya-nāma-tantra (Ye shes rdo rje kun las btus pa zhes bya ba'i rgyud). Tōh. no. 447. Dergé Kanjur, vol. CA, folios 282a1–286a6.

Vidyottamamahātāntra (Rig pa mchog gi rgyud chen po). Tōh. no. 746. Dergé Kanjur, vol. DZA, folios 1b1–237b7.

Vajrayānamūlāpattisaṃgraha (Rdo rje theg pa rtsa ba'i ltung ba bsdu pa). Tōh. no. 2478. Dergé Tanjur, vol. ZI, folio 179a6–179b5.

Principal Indigenous Tibetan Sources

Bod rgya tshig mdzod chen mo (*The Extensive Tibetan–Chinese Dictionary*). [1 vol.] Beijing: National Minorities Press, Mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 1998.

'Gos lo tsā ba gzhon nu dpal. *Deb ther sngon po*. 2 vols. Edited by Dung dkar blo bzang 'phrin las. Chengdu: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 1984.

Jo bo rje dpal ldan a ti sha'i gsung 'bum. *Works attributed to Atiśa and his early disciples*. Compiled by dPal-brtsegs-bod-yig dpe-rnying-zhib-'jug-khang. bKa' gdams dpe dkon gces btus. Zi-ling: Krung-go'i-bod-rig-pa-dpe-skrun-khang, 2006.

Las-chen Kun-dga'-rgyal-mtshan. *Bka' gdams kyi rnam par thar pa Bka' gdams chos 'byuñ Gsal ba'i sgron me: A Detailed Account of the Spread of the Kadampa Sect in Tibet* [Bka' gdams kyi rnam par thar pa bka' gdams chos 'byung gsal ba'i sgron ma]. Vols. 1 and 2. New Delhi: B. Jamyang Norbu, 1972.

- Mchims nam mkha' grag pa. *Jo Bo Rje Pal Ldan A Ti Sha'i Rnam Thar Rgyas Pa Yong Grags*. In *Bka' Gdams Gsung 'Bum Phyogs Sgrig Bzhugs So*, vol. 48, pp 299–449. Chengdu: Sichuan min zu chu ban she, 2007.
- Tāranātha, Jo nang pa, *Rgya gar chos 'byung*. Lama Chimpa and A. Chattopadhyaya, trans., D. Chattopadhyaya, ed. *Tāranātha's History of Buddhism in India*. Simla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study, 1970.

Secondary Sources

- Almogi, Orna. 2009. *Rong-Zom-Pa's Discourses on Buddhology: A Study of Various Conceptions of Buddhahood in Indian Sources with Special Reference to the Controversy Surrounding the Existence of Gnosis (Jñāna : Ye Shes) As Presented by the Eleventh-Century Tibetan Scholar Rong-Zom Chos-Kyi-Bzang-Po*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies of the International College for Postgraduate Buddhist Studies.
- Atiśa and Richard Sherburne. 1983. *A Lamp for the Path and Commentary of Atiśa [The Wisdom of Tibet Series, 5]*. London; Boston: Allen & Unwin.
- Atiśa and Richard Sherburne. 2000. *The Complete Works of Atiśa Śrī Dīpaṃkara Jñāna. Jo-Bo-Rje: The Lamp for the Path and Commentary, Together with the Newly Translated Twenty-Five Key Texts (Tibetan and English Texts)*. New Delhi: Aditya Prakashan.
- Bhāvaviveka and Malcolm David Eckel. 2008. *Bhāvaviveka and His Buddhist Opponents: [Chapters 4 and 5 of Bhāvaviveka's Madhyamakahrdayakārikāḥ with Tarkajvāla Commentary]*. Distributed by Harvard University Press.
- Chattopadhyaya, Alaka, and Lama Chimpa. 1981. *Atiśa and Tibet; Life and Works of Dīpaṃkara Śrījñāna in Relation to the History and Religion of Tibet*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Davidson, Ronald M. 2005. *Tibetan Renaissance: Tantric Buddhism in the Rebirth of Tibetan Culture*. New York: Columbia University Press.

- Duquenne, Robert. 1983. "Daigensui (Myōō)", in: *Hōbōgirin: dictionnaire encyclopédique du bouddhisme d'après les sources chinoises et japonaises*, ed. Paul Démieville and Sylvain Lévi (eds), pp. 510a-640b. Paris: Liba d'Amérique et d'Orient Maisonneuve [u.a.].
- Eckel, Malcolm David. 1994. *To See the Buddha: A Philosopher's Quest for the Meaning of Emptiness*. Princeton University Press.
- Gold, Jonathan C. 2007. *The Dharma's Gatekeepers: Sakya Pandita on Buddhist Scholarship in Tibet*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Hakuju Ui, et al., *A Complete Catalogue of the Tibetan Buddhist Canons, Tôhoku University*. Tokyo: Tôhoku Imperial University, 1934.
- Kapstein, Matthew. 1996. "gDams ngag: Tibetan Technologies of the Self," in: *Tibetan Literature: Studies in Genre*, ed. José Ignacio Cabezón and Roger R. Jackson, pp. 275–89. Ithaca: Snow Lion.
- Lamotte, Étienne. 1988. *History of Indian Buddhism: From the Origins to the Saka Era*. Louvain-la-Neuve: Université catholique de Louvain, Institut orientaliste.
- Mathes, Klaus-Dieter. 2008. *A Direct Path to the Buddha Within: Gö Lotsāwa's Mahāmudrā Interpretation of the Ratnagotravibhāga*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Miyazaki, Izumi. 2007. "Annotated Tibetan Text and Japanese Translation of the Ratnakaraṇḍodghaṭa-nāma-madhyamakopadeśa of Atiśa". *Memoirs of the Department of Literature, Kyoto University* 46:A1–A126. <http://hdl.handle.net/2433/73130>.
- Monier-Williams, Monier, Ernst Leumann, and Carl Cappeller. 1899, reprint 1998. *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary Etymologically and Philologically Arranged with Special Reference to Cognate Indo-European Languages*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press.
- Ohnuma, Reiko. 2007. *Head, Eyes, Flesh, and Blood: Giving Away the Body in Indian Buddhist Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press.

- Roerich, G., trans. 1979. *The Blue Annals*. New Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Ruegg, David Seyfort and Rin-chen-rnam-rgyal. 1966. *The Life of Bu Ston Rin Po Che, with the Tibetan Text of the Bu Ston Rnam Thar*. Roma: Istituto italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.
- Ruegg, David Seyfort. 1981. *The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India*. A History of Indian Literature, V. 7, Fasc.1. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Ruegg, David Seyfort. 2000. *Three Studies in the History of Indian and Tibetan Madhyamaka Philosophy*. Wiener Studien Zur Tibetologie Und Buddhismuskunde, Heft 50. Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien, Universität Wien.
- Silk, J. A. 2007. "Good and evil in Indian Buddhism: The Five Sins of Immediate retribution". *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 35 (3): 253–86.
- Sopa, Geshe Lhundup, Michael J Sweet, Leonard Zwillling, and Dharmaraksita. 2001. *Peacock in the Poison Grove: Two Buddhist Texts on Training the Mind: The Wheel Weapon (Mtshon Cha' Khor Lo) & the Poison-Destroying Peacock (Rma Bya Dug' Joms) Attributed to Dharmaraksita*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Sparham, Gareth. 1987. "Background materials for the first of the seventy topics in Maitreya-nātha's Abhisamayālaṃkāra," *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 10 (2): 139–58.
- Strong, John. 1992. *The Legend and Cult of Upagupta: Sanskrit Buddhism in North India and Southeast Asia*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Takasaki, Jikido. 1966. *A Study on the Ratnagotravibhāga (Uttaratantra): Being a Treatise on the Tathagatagarbha Theory of Mahayana Buddhism*. Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.
- Wangchuk, Dorji. 2007. *The Resolve to Become a Buddha: a Study of the Bodhicitta Concept in Indo-Tibetan Buddhism*. Studia philologica Buddhica, 23. Tokyo: International Institute for Buddhist Studies of the International College for Postgraduate Buddhist Studies.

Wedemeyer, Christian K. 2007. *Āryadeva's Lamp That Integrates the Practices (Caryāmelāpakapradīpa): The Gradual Path of Vajrayāna Buddhism According to the Esoteric Community Noble Tradition*. New York: American Institute of Buddhist Studies at Columbia University.